

UNITED THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY

THOSE ASTOUNDING FREE METHODIST WOMEN!

A BIOGRAPHICAL HISTORY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN IN MINISTRY
WITH AN EXTENDED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN'S STUDIES

A FINAL DOCUMENT SUBMITTED TO
THE DOCTORAL STUDIES COMMITTEE OF
UNITED THEOLOGICAL SEMINARY
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF MINISTRY

UNITED THEOLOGICAL
SEMINARY LIBRARY

D. Min.
Thesis
1992

BY

JEAN HALL GRAMENTO
BINGHAMTON, NEW YORK

OCTOBER 1992

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Particular appreciation to my Context Associates: Rita Emilio, Ron and Mary Foster, Gary Raduns, John and Jo Miles, Terry and Cre Yeomans, Tom and Cre Roberts, and Neva Lattimer. Their patient, and often delightful, critiquing of my writing style, along with their collaboration on content and format, has both corrected and supported my work.

Thanks are expressed to Paul Lattimer for his practical help early in the program.

Gratitude is extended to my Consultants: Bishop Richard Snyder, Reverend Doctor Catherine Stonehouse, Mrs. Carollyn Ellis, Reverend Marti Ensign, and Reverend Doctor LeRoy Kettinger, each of whom has kindly communicated wisdom and expertise so that I might expand my frames of learning and competence.

Thanks go out to Michael Guthrie, Samuel Tinsley, Phillip Davis, and J. Timothy Shumaker, my peers, for maintaining a comfortable collegiality with the only woman in the group while we honed each others' skills in our context of mutual encouragement.

Appreciation is directed to Doctor Howard A. Snyder, our Mentor, who has set an inspiring example of servant leadership which will continue to both inspire and challenge me.

Special thanks are tendered to my parents, Herbert and May (Belcher) Hall. In their eighties now, they have contributed largely to this enterprise, not only by means of encouragement, but by entertaining our Peer Group and Mentor as well!

UNITED THEOLOGICAL
SEMINARY LIBRARY

MAY 10 1999

My children: Jack, Timothy, Amity, and Elizabeth, in league with my son-in-law Donald, have kept my life, and their Dad's, in healthy balance throughout this process by means of cooking, conversation, transportation, shopping, and giving good advice - strategically interrupted by put-downs designed to prevent this doctoral candidate from acquiring undue pomposities. They have given more than they imagine.

A tremendous measure of gratitude goes out to Frank, my husband, who makes all my studies possible.

Additional thanks are extended to Reverend Jack Richardson for his kind permission to include "Appendix A" from his master's thesis, "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth-Century Free Methodism," Colgate Rochester Divinity School, April 1984. This appendix is entitled "Appendix to I,E: Free Methodist Review, Bibliographies" below.

Appreciation is expressed to Doctor Bruce L. Kline, General Secretary, Higher Education and the Ministry, The Free Methodist Church, for his willingness to be a member of my Final Examination Committee.

Gratitude is expressed to Charles H. Canon III, Librarian, Keating Library, Roberts Wesleyan College; and to Frances Haslam, Director, The Marston Memorial Historical Center, Free Methodist World Center. Chuck and Fran continue to provide invaluable research materials.

A special thank you to each person in the Doctor of Ministry office for responding to all my questions.

Scriptures are quoted from The Holy Bible: New International Version.

copyright 1978 by New York International Bible Society.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ii
ABSTRACT	vii
INTRODUCTION	viii
Chapter	
1. THEOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK FOR THE MODEL	
THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS IN SUPPORT OF GENDER EQUALITY . .	1
2. DESCRIBING THE MODEL	
A. CONTEXT ASSOCIATES MEETINGS AND CONTRIBUTIONS	58
B. SUMMARY OF CONTEXT ASSOCIATES' EVALUATIONS	60
C. WHAT I SET OUT TO LEARN	60
D. WHAT I DID LEARN	66
3. HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS FOR THE MODEL	
STUMBLING BLOCKS AND STEPPING STONES: THE FREE METHODIST	
DECISIONS 1861-1911	70
4. THE MODEL	
THOSE ASTOUNDING FREE METHODIST WOMEN! A BIOGRAPHICAL	
HISTORY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN IN MINISTRY	86
5. FUTURE DIRECTIONS FOR MINISTRY BY MEANS OF:	
A. THE BOOK	110
B. THE BIBLIOGRAPHY	110
C. THE THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS DOCUMENT	110
D. OTHER SETTINGS WHERE THE MODEL MIGHT BE USED	110
E. LIMITATIONS AND POSSIBILITIES OF THE MODEL FOR	
DIVERSE RELIGIOUS TRADITIONS	111

APPENDICES

A. CONFERENCE RECORDS OF WOMEN APPOINTED	112
B. SUMMARY OF CONTEXT ASSOCIATES' EVALUATIONS	124
C. EXAMPLES OF PERSONAL REFLECTION QUESTIONS	126
EXTENDED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN'S STUDIES: WITH SELECTED ECUMENICAL ENTRIES	128

ABSTRACT

THOSE ASTOUNDING FREE METHODIST WOMEN!
A BIOGRAPHICAL HISTORY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN IN MINISTRY
WITH AN EXTENDED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN'S STUDIES

The saga of Free Methodist women in ministry remains largely uncompiled as a readily available documented source. Historians along with others can benefit from an accurate, interestingly written history which conveys not only these women's contributions to the denomination's ministries, but will also be a vehicle to express the confusion, tension, and frustration which sometimes accompanied their attempts to live out their calling, to ordained ministry in particular. The extended bibliography which completes this project will be a valuable tool for researchers who focus upon Free Methodism's relationships with its women in ministry.

INTRODUCTION

This final document contains some of the results of my research into biblical justification and vindication for gender equality in all areas of ecclesial practice. Once begun, the gathering of evidence in support of gender equality in the church appears to be ongoing.

Implicit throughout all chapters in this presentation is the most recent account of my growth as person (both private and professional) and as pastor. What might not be overtly evident is my fresh, new confidence now that I have overcome my fear of letting myself "come through" the words which I write. My Context Associates' insight is responsible for this leap forward. Additional details are included in chapter 2.

The historical foundations have been lifted from what I have planned to be chapter 1 of the book Those Astounding Free Methodist Women! A Biographical History of Free Methodist Women in Ministry which is the projected long-range goal for all my research in this area. Chapter 3 of this document is then a glimpse of the history I write about - Free Methodism's relationships with its women in ministry, while chapter 4 offers a soupcon of the book which is in process. This seminal work (the book) will be scholarly in fact and documentation, but popular in format and content. The projected table of contents included in chapter 4 visualizes my present concept of the book.

It is my hope that this book, the first of its kind for Free Methodists, will inspire denomination-wide, perhaps ecumenical response to record each of our histories through the minds, hearts, and eyes of our

sisters before pieces of our history are dropped between the cracks of seemingly more important reviews. I want to inspire people to learn about who they are by discovering their roots - and, furthermore, once having discovered them, to break through our self-accepted walls of prejudice and ignorance - to burst excitedly upon the phenomenal eternal truth that there is a universal fellowship of Christians - and that this fellowship comes by means of the fact that one Root and one Vine - Jesus Christ - gives us all our life.

The extensive bibliography which completes this project can prove to be a valuable tool for researchers who will be focusing, as I am doing now, upon Free Methodism's relationships with its women in ministry. My best hope for this bibliography is that it will elicit enough response to warrant the compilation of a sequel which will document works not yet available to the general public.

It is not enough to study only the Bible passages at issue. You cannot deal adequately with the subject until you look within the lives of women and see their searching, loss, and longing.

Patricia Gundry

CHAPTER I

THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS IN SUPPORT OF GENDER EQUALITY

Introduction

Biblical justification need not convey a universal mandate for the immediate implementing of that which it vindicates. It does however furnish the common foundation upon which each denominational Christian church builds its theological identity.

Free Methodism's principal founder, Benjamin Titus Roberts, insisted that God called women and men both to preach and to govern with ecclesial equality in the fledgling denomination. Although his Ordaining Women¹ argued particularly for the ordination of women, his rationale extended to church administration as well:

There is no Scripture which forbids the ordination of woman on the ground that, being ordained, she will have a part in the government of the church.²

[1 Timothy 5:1-2] If the word elder is to be taken here, where it refers to men, as it is used generally in the New Testament, to denote an officer of the church, then it must have the same meaning in the same sentence where it refers to women.³

That woman possesses the administrative ability to exercise properly all the governing power usually vested in ordained preachers of the Gospel is fully demonstrated by experience. That some women govern well, we know, because some women have governed well. It is not a matter of theory. It is a demonstrated fact. Occasionally a woman has been placed at the head of the government of a country. In all such cases her administration will compare favorably with that of the men who preceded and followed her.⁴

Roberts' proposal to ordain women in the Free Methodist denomination was narrowly defeated by the 1890 General Conference. He re-

sponded with Ordaining Women which was published by his Earnest Christian Publishing House in 1891. The General Conference of 1911 voted to allow women to be ordained as deacons. Sixty-seven additional years passed before the 1974 General Conference voted in favor of ordaining women as elders. While ordaining women is no longer a vital issue for most Free Methodists, the tension which surrounds woman as church administrator, unfortunately, continues in a number of annual conferences as well as in some Societies (Free Methodist local congregations of members).

Roberts' Ordaining Women is a pragmatic apologia with a precisely expounded biblical basis. Selections from his plethora of scriptural expositions will form the centrum for my theological reflections upon women in ordained ministry. Free Methodist Bishop Walter A. Sellew wrote his compelling pamphlet Why Not? A Plea for the Ordination of those Women whom God Calls to Preach His Gospel,⁵ in 1894. His 1914 revision of this booklet will enrich and direct my theological considerations. What Paul Really Said About Women,⁶ authored by John Temple Bristow in 1988, will serve as a vehicle by means of which to convey a (representative) modern scholarly biblical approach to theological justification and biblical vindication for gender equality in Christian ministry.

Although ecclesial political equality rather than ordination alone is the issue here, granting women the right to govern in every echelon of Methodism rests initially upon her ordination as elder. This ordaining, in its turn, depends upon a biblical theological supporting structure. A number of particular scriptural pericopes have been fervidly debated by some very convincing Free Methodist interpre-

ters, some of whom assert, while others deny, that the Bible justifies across-the-board ecclesial equality as well as ordination for women. This dismaying tension continues unresolved among Free Methodists despite the history of Roberts', Sellew's, and others' informed conviction that God calls women to preach and to govern equally with men. It continues in spite of our Book of Discipline⁷ as well.

Ordaining Women's title page heralds the apostle Paul's insight to the Galatians as if to trumpet a muster to its own contents:

There is neither Jew nor Greek,
there is neither bond nor free,
there is neither male nor female:
for ye are all one in Christ Jesus.
Galatians 3:28 (KJT)

Both Roberts and Sellew open their expositions with a brief historical resumé which juxtaposes force over against rights:

If prejudiced, we should, as Daniel Webster said, 'Conquer our prejudices.' The feeling against women's being accorded equal rights with man, is old and deeply rooted. Generally, among mankind, the law of force has been the prevailing law. The stronger have tyrannized over the weaker.⁸

. . . this superiority in physical power of the man over the woman has always been the open secret of their complicated conditions. The men have possessed the power and they have taken the rights. But rights taken by force are rights still, and woman the world over has been patiently waiting . . . for the glorious Gospel of love as taught by Jesus Christ . . . to restore to her those rights . . . taken away from her by force. . . . the prejudice against the religious rights and privileges is more strongly entrenched than that against either her social or business rights, and yields the last of all, and then most reluctantly.⁹

Ongoing similar contexts keep on inviting forceful trampling upon selected rights. The poor, the disabled, and women for example are most readily disenfranchised because they often lack the sort of power they need to overcome the force which confines them inside boundaries which

are still being defined and redefined according to traditional Christian interpretations of God and of the Bible.

Methodologies cannot reconcile abuse of power of any sort to Jesus' universally unequivocal command to all his followers: "In everything, do to others what you would have them do to you, for this sums up the Law and the Prophets" (Matthew 7:12).

A Theological Justification and Biblical Vindication of Equality for Women in Ordained Ministry

Each pericope below introduces some point(s) of interpretive conflict centering around theological justification revealed by biblical vindication for gender equality in ministry. Traditional Christian interpretations will be stated first, followed by challengers Roberts, Sellew, and Bristow. Summary statements conclude each textual investigation.

Genesis 1:26-27; 2:23-25

Then God said, 'Let us make man in our image, in our likeness, and let them rule over the fish of the sea, and the birds of the air, over the livestock, over all the earth, and over all the creatures that move along the ground.'

So God created man in his own image,
in the image of God he created him;
male and female he created them.

The man said,

'This is now bone of my bones
and flesh of my flesh;
she shall be called 'woman,'
for she was taken out of man.'

For this reason a man will leave his father and mother and be united to his wife, and they will become one flesh.

The man and his wife were both naked, and they felt no

shame.

Traditional Christian View The fact that woman was created last is presented as proof that she is inferior to man (male), and therefore subject to him.¹⁰ Tradition extends the implications of this Creation sequence to suggest that Adam was created in the image of God "while Eve (and all women) are in the image of men," created in order to propagate the race.¹¹

Augustine asserts in chapter one of The Good of Marriage "that the union of male and female is: 'a kind of friendly and genuine union of the one ruling and the other obeying' . . ."¹² Elisabeth Elliott represents today's fundamentalist echo to Augustine in this:

The Genesis account calls woman a 'help, meet' - that is, fit, suitable, for man. I do not hold all men to be so strong, so intelligent, so competent, and so virtuous or holy that they deserve a superior position. I simply see¹³ that the place is theirs not by merit but by appointment.

It is in willing and glad submission rather than grudging capitulation that the woman in the church and the wife in the home find their fulfillment.¹⁴

Aquinas, one of the most respected of the church fathers, and particularly influential in structuring Christian tradition, agreed with Aristotle that woman was "defective and misbegotten,"¹⁵ never equal to man either before or after the Fall.

Roberts wrote that if the Creation sequence "proves anything, it proves her [woman's] superiority. For the work of creation proceeded in regular gradation from the lower to the higher."¹⁶ "Woman as man's help-meet is not his servant but rather his companion, his equal.¹⁷ Roberts quotes Adam Clarke's comment on 2:18, that a help meet is a counter-part, literally:

like or as himself, standing opposite to . . . a perfect resemblance of the man in all things like and equal to himself.¹⁸

Interestingly enough, Spencer, translating from the Hebrew text, arrived at the same conclusion as Clarke. Spencer, writing circa 1985, expands upon her discovery:

. . . God created woman to be 'in front of' or 'visible' to Adam, which would symbolize equality (if not superiority!) in all respects. Even more, one can argue that the female is the helper who rules over the one she helps! In effect, God has inaugurated a mutual submission, even at creation.¹⁹

In addition to gender equality, the dominion which God gave (1:27-28) "was a joint dominion," to be exercised equally.²⁰

Sellew's view It is true that "absolute equality" is a "constitutional impossibility", and that one of the fundamental laws of association is that of "superiority and inferiority"; it is just as true that "In the beginning . . . man and woman were created with equal rights" (1:26-27).²¹ God gave Adam and Eve equal right to his blessing as well as "to live, to eat, and to rule whatever there was to be ruled."²²

Sellew describes the vast divergence between "equality of rights" and "equality of relations". Rights, being inherited, remain immutable while relations, being "results", are always changing. Women and men were not created owning relative equality. Man has, with few exceptions, always been superior to woman in physical strength:

In fact, this superiority in physical power of the man over the woman has always been the open secret of their complicated conditions. The men have possessed the power and they have taken the rights. But rights taken by force are rights still . . .²³

Bristow's View Bristow provides a background for his stance on what Paul really said about women. He does not deal at length with

Genesis 1:26-27 or 2:18. He does however work in depth with 2:23-25 in developing the historical cultural developments which elicited his explication of the Pauline standards pertaining to equality for women.

He speaks of Philo, for example, who interpreted a man's "cleaving unto his wife" (2:24) within the Aristotilian context "that a husband is to his wife as one's soul is to one's body . . .":²⁴

In us mind corresponds to man, the senses to woman; and pleasure encounters and holds parley with the senses first, and through them cheats with her quackeries the sovereign mind itself . . . It is the senses that act as panders for her and procure the lover. When she has ensnared these she easily brings the Mind under her control.²⁵

Therefore, Philo argued, a man "leaves" his father (i.e., according to Philo, he leaves God) in order to become one in erotic love with his wife. Furthermore, in championing the "Essene ideal of celibacy", Philo asserts the Stoic argument that "a wife is a selfish creature . . . adept at beguiling the morals of her husband."²⁶ The Jewish historian Josephus, writing during the ensuing generation, affirmed that Jewish law supported this "disdain" toward women - that it "declared that the wife 'is inferior to her husband in all things.'"²⁷

In the prudential nature of true scholarship, however, Gamaliel (the apostle Paul's teacher), along with a number of other Jewish scholars, disavowed this ante-cavalier attitude toward women. Gamaliel's posture became:

part of the educational heritage of the apostle Paul, who later wrote in defiance of those who would deprecate women that there is 'neither male nor female, for you are all one in Christ Jesus.'²⁸

The apostle Paul, on the one hand, taught that all people were equal in Christ, while some of his Gentile converts, on the other hand,

were already acculturated into the Hellenistic mind-set in respect to women's inferiority. This, regrettably, led even such "defender[s] of the Christian faith" as Tertullian (c. A.D. 160-230) to extend the traditional condemnatory implications of Eve's sin to include all women.²⁹ Some perennially honored saints, Augustine and Jerome among them, alongside the much-quoted desert fathers, in their quest for uncontaminated meditation and unpolluted holiness, came to regard sexual desire not as a gift from God, but as "evil". It was "but another small step" from this to viewing women as 'snares in the narrow pathway to purity, and to conclude . . . that women are symbolic of the basest of human corruption."³⁰ In the second century after Christ, Clement of Alexandria "regarded marriage as simple prostitution and a practice introduced by the devil."³¹

It was Aquinas (c. 1225-1274) however who, in the thirteenth century, finally gave "highest expression" to this "tendency to interpret Scripture from the viewpoint of Greek philosophy."³² As he systematized Christian beliefs and harmonized them with Greek philosophy, he also interpreted Saint Paul's letters "through the mind of Aristotle," and thus:

the Greek depreciation of women became solidly infused within Christian theology.

Since that time, both Catholics and protestants have tended to read Paul's words through the eyes of pagan philosophers who lived five centuries before the apostle!³³

Bristow offers more scholarly evidence for the culturally misanthropic misapplication of Saint Paul's teachings about women than the scope of this paper allows. We have presented selections which convey support for gender-equal interpretation of Genesis 2:23-25.

In light of his search into interpretive antiquities, Bristow might perhaps chuckle in accord with B.T. Roberts' wryly succinct "We cannot ascertain the truth of an opinion by inquiries about its age."³⁴

Summary Though I argue against the posits of Christian tradition (that the female was created inferior to the male, and is therefore subject to him in all things), I acknowledge the lack of infallible tangible proof in plenary support of any one particular interpretation. In addition to the several interpretations of Genesis 1:26-27, 2:18, and 2:23-25, a number of key words such as "servant", "slave", and "free" continue to be variably translated according to national and, in some cases local, cultures so that universal definitions remain out of the question. Bristow's note 2 (120), though too lengthy to include here, provides an excellent introductory synopsis to the servant, slave, free conundrum.³⁵

That man and woman were created to belong to each other is made clear in 2:24-25. The controversy arises out of cultural definitions and the related sets of terminologies which result. Confusion can arise in areas where terminologies overlap.

Marks avers that:

A man and a woman belong to each other because originally they were **one flesh**. The man and the woman were **naked** before each other, un-self-conscious and unashamed. Nudity is here the symbol for mutually frank and honest self-giving.³⁶

This mutual self-giving informs Matthew 19:4-5, and it extends into Jesus' "Golden Rule"³⁷ (Matthew 7:12) as well. The lesson is also intrinsic, by implication, in 1 Corinthians 7:3-5 and in Ephesians 5:22-23 where, one may infer, Saint Paul is teaching that "Husbands and

wives are to be responsive to the needs of each other . . .³⁸

Theologies as widely divergent as Clarke's conservatism, Marks' liberalism, and Spencer's feminism are, paradoxically, joined in interpreting Genesis 1:27-28 and 2:23-25 in order to say that, because Adam and Eve were created as one human named Adam, gender equality was intentionally indigenous in humankind.³⁹

Genesis 3:16

To the woman he said,
 'I will greatly increase your pains in childbearing;
 with pain you will give birth to children.
 Your desire will be for your husband,
 and he will rule over you.'

Traditional Christian View Genesis 3:16 implies that Eve, the woman, "initiated the sin of disobedience to God" which resulted in the "expulsion of the primal pair from paradise."⁴⁰ Though both Eve and Adam were punished for flouting God's command to not eat of the fruit of the tree of the knowledge of good and evil, many people feel that Eve alone is liable for that primary disobedience.⁴¹ Reuther posits that:

Woman is defined [emphasis mine] as having sinned in the beginning by getting out of her secondary and auxiliary relation to the male by taking initiative in questioning God's orders and acting contrary to God's will.⁴²

Her punishment, "Pain in childbirth and subjugation to her husband's will" appears to be rooted in her sin which forfeited all humanity's "original blessedness"⁴³ and imposed toilsome, sweaty labor in an environment suddenly, surprisingly antagonistic.

This particular theological fustian purports that woman can be redeemed only by means of: "voluntary submission to her sexual role, the definition of her nature through childbearing, and social subord-

ination to the male."⁴⁴ Traditional Christian interpretation assumes that women accept these roles "not only as their nature, but also as punishment for the primal sin that imposed all troubles on humanity."⁴⁵ Thus, woman's guilt becomes, by extension, "limitless."⁴⁶

Christian tradition extrapolates that because of Eve's sin, women are universally culpable "for the presence of evil in the world."⁴⁷ This aspect of the notion of Eve's prime guilt has been reconstructed so as to appear that "women are a distraction to men in their pursuit of holiness."⁴⁸ Near the end of the second century, Tertullian wrote:

Do you know that each of you women is an Eve? The sentence of God - on this sex of yours - lives in this age; the guilt must necessarily live, too. You are the Gate of Hell, you are the temptress of the forbidden tree; you are the first deserter of the divine law.⁴⁹

Rabbinical teachings support this major negative cultural tradition in the sense that while Adam "is to bear prime responsibility for the disastrous first sin,"⁵⁰ Eve, succumbing to the serpent, then becomes its accomplice in inducing Adam to sin. Sirach later unabashedly assesses blame to Eve and to all women as well: "From a woman sin had its beginning and because of her we all die . . ."⁵¹

Tradition continues to expand the curse for sin so that Eve's punishment, "with pain you will give birth to children. Your desire will be for your husband, and he will rule over you," is always being elongated to include every woman.⁵² Woman, perceived as being responsible for sin, is religiously and socially metamorphosed into a scapegoat for the invasion of sin. This allocation invites the Christian scapegoating extension of the Fall to become:

a pervasive victim-blaming ideology toward women, which

justifies any amount of male use and abuse of women and directs women silently to accept this treatment as their means of salvation.⁵³

This context can lead into an astounding conclusion: that the man is the woman's only means for salvation - and that only provided she bears him a child! This childbearing is that which is mentioned in 1 Timothy 2:15:

But women will be kept safe* through childbirth, if they continue in faith, love and holiness with propriety. (*Or be saved, n, NIV.)

Some people today go on extending and misrepresenting Eve's curse "to the ruling by all men of all women."⁵⁴ "Such is the traditional use of the Genesis account . . ."⁵⁵ to limit women ecclesiastically and socially to areas and occupations which can be readily defined and redefined according to current interpretive opinions.

Roberts' View "Nothing was said of the subjection of women before the fall."⁵⁶ One consequence of the Fall however was that God informed Eve that one part of her punishment would be that her desire would be for her husband and that he (Adam) would rule over her. Roberts does not elucidate on this pronouncement. Instead he refers to Genesis 3:15 as God's first great biblical prophecy, in which God promises the serpent that "the seed of the woman will crush your head . . ." Woman was "first in the fall," but she was also "first in the restoration": Christ hath redeemed us from the curse of the law, being made a curse for us. Gal. 3:13. The US includes woman."⁵⁷

In addition, Roberts juxtaposes Christ's response to the Pharisees' question over against the case for subjection of women. When the Pharisees asked Christ, "Is it lawful for a man to divorce his wife for

any and every reason?" Jesus' answer "did not appeal to existing laws or long established customs. He based his answer on the state of things that existed before the fall."⁵⁸ "Haven't you read," he replied, "that at the beginning the Creator 'made them male and female,' and said, 'For this reason a man will leave his father and mother and be united to his wife, and the two will become one flesh'?" (Matthew 19:4). Roberts' rejoinder following upon his own query was, "Why this appeal to the beginning? IT WAS TO RE-ENACT THE LAW ENACTED THEN." The law to which Roberts refers is found in Genesis 2:24, and reiterated in Matthew 19:4, quoted above. Roberts asserts that: "THUS Christ restored the primitive law. He said nothing about the subjection of woman – not one word."⁶⁰

Bristow's View The sequence of humans' sinning continues to elicit abundant attention with its double-whammy conclusion which avers that "since Eve sinned first, women are more easily led into error than are men" and, in addition, since Eve tempted Adam, "one must conclude that women constitute a moral threat to men."⁶¹ Bristow suggests that this sequence of sin has no more bearing upon the ranking of the relationships between women and men than does the order of creation which, carried to its logical conclusion, would rank cows, for example, higher than men because cows were created prior to Adam, "and fish are superior to cows, since they were created first, and so on."⁶²

Bristow challenges traditional Christian interpretations of "help meet" or "helper" as well. Ezer, the Hebrew word used in Genesis 2:20-22 is translated "partner" by a number of biblical scholars

in order to avoid the subordinate role which "helper" connotes. The word ezer itself does not confer inferior status. In fact, each of its seventeen additional Old Testament appearances is a reference to God.⁶³

Bristow offers three "equally plausible" interpretations of the primal temptation and Fall which appear to have been "overlooked" in Judeo-Christian history and thought. First, the serpent "waited until Eve was alone before tempting her." Rather than demonstrating that women are "morally more vulnerable and easily led astray than men . . . , this account "could just as well suggest that husbands and wives are meant to provide . . ." mutually reciprocal "moral fortitude, and when this fails, sin can enter into their relationship and change it."⁶⁴

Second, perhaps the serpent "deliberately chose Eve because she was the stronger, not the weaker, of the two."⁶⁵ The tempter's argumentative skills were required to convince Eve to sin, whereas the simple act of handing over a piece of fruit sufficed for Adam's fall. One could speculate that the serpent knew, prior to the tempting, that Adam would probably follow Eve's example.⁶⁶

The third interpretation, quoted below in its entirety, without comment, appears to provide an incredibly plausible illumination upon the incessant ramifications of Eve's punishment:

The third interpretation is the least speculative of the three. It focuses upon the result of sin for the couple, in which she desires him and he rules over her. If this kind of marital relationship, far from being divinely ordered, is the product of sin and God's curse, then it is to be avoided rather than commended. It is characteristic of marriage outside of God's grace. To prescribe that kind of relationship is to advocate living under the penalty of sin imposed upon Adam and Eve, as if Christ brought nothing new to marriage relationships.⁶⁷

Moreover, Bristow asserts that while the tenth commandment includes a neighbor's wife in the "thou shalt not covet" list, commandments five and seven present a viable context which belies the prevalent interpretation of the word "wife" as "possession."⁶⁸

Summary Due to the lack of incontrovertible supporting evidence, I continue to acknowledge the validity of a number of others' interpretations alongside those presented here, each being essentially limited by its sociocultural milieu.

Spencer's dialectic scenario of the fall, which includes a silent Adam along with Eve and the serpent, could appear widely divergent from Bristow's more popular assumption (above) that the serpent approached Eve when she was alone. Spencer's assertion depends upon a single linguistic conjugation: "when the serpent speaks to the woman it uses the plural 'you', not the feminine singular 'you'."⁶⁹ God, commanding only Adam in Genesis 2:16-17, had employed the singular 'you'. This use of selective pronouns in the Hebrew text provides additional support for Spencer's theory by means of Genesis 3:6, particularly in the King James Version, where 'mmah is translated "with her." Adam's silence in this scenario would imply his ongoing consent to being implicated as accessory before the fact, thus effectually challenging the assumption that Eve deceived Adam into eating the fruit.⁷⁰

The heart of the women's liberation movement is its challenge to Christian theology. This movement questions the extension of traditional assumptions derived from severely limited interpretations of Genesis 2:18 and 2:20b-24, along with 3:16 - the setting and aftermath of the scene presented above. Gray, in her essay, continues in this same vein:

The issue raised by the women's liberation movement . . . takes us to the heart of theology because they question our understanding of God. If God from the beginning established a context of injustice by creating one social category that serves another, then that is unacceptable to people who believe in the true worth of all humankind.

. . . .

Our theology will not be credible if it opposes one system of oppression while championing another.⁷¹

Gray hones her declaration, "The ranking of diversity is always a basis of oppression",⁷² to focus sharply on a single point thrust from Genesis 3:16, power to control. Virtually every woman whom God calls out of a traditional frame into ordained ministry slogs and trudges her way through these same inquisitions until she appropriates her liberation in Christ, or effects a compromise, or consigns herself to perpetually desperate resignation.

Gray interprets Berger in her paraphrastic summary: "religion legitimates social institutions by bestowing on them an ultimately ontological status, by locating them within a sacred and cosmic frame of reference."⁷³ She reveals the skeleton of Genesis 3:16 which, when enfleshed in patriarchy, has unfortunately resulted in bad as well as good for women and, by implication, for men. She declares that an ecclesially engendered patriarchy, though religiously benevolent, has fostered a surprisingly widespread male practice of woman and girl-child abuse. She attributes the ongoing condoning of this violence to the persisting exercise of patriarchal control, first in churches, then in society,⁷⁴

Women in ordained ministry are forced into radically personal questioning on this issue, but, what is more, even as we formulate our

own responses, we are driven into offering credible solutions to women and men who seek theological justification to vindicate their frightening new awareness of potential biblical support for gender equality.

Spencer's linguistic exegesis of Genesis 3:16 could lend support to Gray's conclusions in that Spencer, in examining the outgrowth of the Fall, also remarks upon the consequent divergence between male and female.⁷⁵ Spencer however, along with Marks, emphasizes the separation, alienation, suffering, and misery which invaded the world, their vehicle being the human will to be as gods by means of forbidden knowledge:

Eve and Adam learn the knowledge of shame, independence, and irresponsibility.

Also, Adam and Eve lose that fundamental sense of interrelationship which they had before the fall.⁷⁶

Investigating the potential inferences to be drawn out of the Hebrew textual pronouns, Spencer tracks the Adams' loss of original unity, that is to say God's suspension of their original created equality, through the sequence of significant pronouns which change from "them", "they", "we", and "our" into "she", "he", "you", and "I". Spencer comments that the immediate punishments which God assigned in Eden acknowledge his recognition of equal tripartite culpability, and that this response presages redemption in Christ being offered equally to all.⁷⁷ Incontrovertible biblical evidence is insufficient to support the assumption that God universalized Eve's curse (Genesis 3:16), or that redemption through Jesus Christ was intended to convey only partial restoration or some unequal sort of liberation. Perhaps Eve's punishment was not directed toward sexual desire, or toward power to control people other than oneself, but instead, addresses the causal

relationships among God's will, individual humans' will, and making informed choices.

Psalm 68:11

The Lord announced the word,
and great was the company of those who proclaimed it: . . .
NIV

The Lord gave the command,
and many women carried the news: . . .
Good News Bible

Traditional Christian View Widely-read standard translations such as the New International Version, the King James Version, the Douay Confraternity Bible, and the Newberry Bible do not include "women" in their Psalm 68:11 text. The New Oxford Annotated, along with the New American Standard translation, for example, also overlook "women" as a contextually viable inclusion in this verse. The omission extends to a number of notable modern paraphrases, The Book and The Living Bible among them. The New English Bible uses a footnote to acknowledge the potential for including "women."⁷⁸

Sellew's observations upon the prejudice evidenced toward women preachers were salient in 1914; they prove regrettably descriptive of some few current Christian traditionalist bents. Sellew wrote that "such a great residue of prejudice remains against women preachers that many will not go to hear them preach. A large number will 'listen to no reasons or arguments in favor of their preaching . . .'"⁷⁹ Tradition, sometimes unfortunately, has gotten into the habit of control, particularly when apportioning clerical (clergy) responsibilities and remunerations. God gives the command however, and sometimes women

carry the news.

Roberts' View Roberts makes of Psalm 68:11 a prediction "that in the days spoken of in this psalm, when 'Ethiopia shall stretch out her hands unto God,' [68:31] women were to preach the Gospel."⁸⁰ Roberts points out that verse 11 declares that women in fact have "a distinguished part" in making the Gospel known.⁸¹

He supports his prognostication partly by means of Adam Clarke's "literal translation" of verse 11b: "Of the female preachers there was a great host."⁸² Clarke comments upon his own translation, "the reader may make of it what he pleases."⁸³ Roberts alludes to the Revised Version, quoted above, as an additional pillar to help support his prophetic assertion.

Sellew's View:

But the age of women preachers has come. As the Spirit is poured out on all flesh our daughters are prophesying, and the prophecy in Psa. 68:11 and 12, 'The Lord giveth the word: the women that publish the tidings are a great host,' is being rapidly realized.⁸⁴

"A good woman preacher filled with the Spirit will convince more people" more readily "that she has a right to preach" than will "pages of argument."⁸⁵

Summary Extending Psalm 68:11 to include women in ordained ministry in the twentieth century might appear an over-attenuation. This particular psalm is, according to Toombs, "the most difficult in the Psalter . . . in both text and interpretation."⁸⁶ Some regard it as a celebration hymn, sung along the route while the Ark was being transferred to Zion. Others see it as a collection of fragments or an "index of first lines."⁸⁷ The text which includes "women" appears to

arise out of a minority of scholarly studies. It could be said that, within ongoing scholarly perimeters of contextual integrity, almost anything goes - excepting perhaps the extending of its immediate application to nineteenth and twentieth century women in ordained ministry. Deeper reflection however reveals it as a celebrative affirmation for women in ministry rather than the absurdly over-extended tenuous connection that it might seem at first. Old Testament celebration and affirmation are allowable elements in theological justification for women who carry the Gospel in the New Testament era.

Joel 2:28-32

And afterward,
 I will pour out my Spirit on all people.
 Your sons and daughters will prophesy,
 your old men will dream dreams,
 your young men will see visions.
 Even on my servants, both men and women,
 I will pour out my Spirit in those days.
 I will show wonders in the heavens
 and on the earth,
 blood and fire and billows of smoke.
 The sun will be turned to darkness
 and the moon to blood
 before the coming of the great and dreadful day of the LORD.
 And everyone who calls
 on the name of the LORD will be saved;
 for on Mount Zion and in Jerusalem
 there will be deliverance,
 as the LORD has said,
 among the survivors
 whom the LORD calls.

Traditional Christian View One prevailing traditional Christian interpretation of this pericope employs prophecy quite prudentially, as a vehicle to convey Joel's preaching women into the eschatological Day of the Lord. This removal effectually nullifies further interpretive responsibility during the Age of the Church.

A different perspective suggests that Joel's prediction was "exhausted on the day of Pentecost,"⁸⁸ although there is no biblical documentation to support the associate claim that women preached on the day of Pentecost.

Roberts' View Roberts insists that Joel's prediction was equally affirmed for all, that "No higher ministry is given to the sons than is given to the daughters," and furthermore, that "This prediction was not exhausted on the day of Pentecost," but was to keep on being fulfilled "throughout the Christian dispensation."⁸⁹ He assigns the ongoing aspect of this equal outpouring to Joel's implicative "In the last days" which, if they included the day of Pentecost, must also include the remainder of the Christian era. If we accept the foregoing, then we are to "look for the same outpouring of the Spirit on the women as on the men."⁹⁰

Sellew's View Sellew refers to Joel 2:28-32 only in the context of Psalm 68:11, presented above.

Bristow's View In explicating this passage from Joel, Bristow concentrates upon the content of the word "prophesy." ". . . prophesy means, simply, to speak for God."⁹¹ Perhaps about the future, "but more often than that, it is speaking about the here and now . . . telling them what God wants them to hear."⁹² It is preaching inspired by the Spirit of God. Joel and, later, Peter declare that this enabling outpouring of the Spirit upon "both men and women, both young and old, both slave and free,"⁹³ alike and equally was (and, by implicative extension, is) **the** sign of the new (Church) age:

It would be strange, indeed, if the Church under the apostles regarded this [Joel's prophecy] as a sign of the new age in Christ and yet forbade women the right to give

inspired messages to the church! And in fact it was not until later, after the age of the apostles, when the Greek attitude about women became dominant within the Church, that women were forbidden to preach.⁹⁴

Summary Gundry quotes from her correspondence:

I was beginning to almost believe that the Holy Spirit in me was somehow not the same Holy Spirit that indwelled "the brethren," or if otherwise why am I to keep quiet in the church and not let that Holy Spirit speak through me, simply because I have a woman's body? God surely makes more sense than that.⁹⁵

Huckle and Visokay have provided, though in an altogether different context, an insightful response to this seemingly "different" sort of Spirit. They proffer that "God is Spirit not as he is defined in his essence but as he represents himself to humanity. This is the Spirit poured out in the messianic age that renews humankind from above."⁹⁶ This same Spirit in Christ **restores** the divinely-mandated gender equality set in place at Creation and interrupted by the Fall.

An increasing number of contemporary Christian women, called by God and enabled by the Spirit:

are becoming able to allow themselves to think and discover, to listen to the Spirit . . . and say, "Why not? Why not me? Why not do it?"⁹⁷

Gundry cautions both women and men that whenever we restrict the ministry of women, we "quench the Spirit of God who would have spoken through them."⁹⁸ The apostle Paul warned the congregation in Thessalonica, "Do not put out the Spirit's fire . . ." (1 Thessalonians 5:19).

Joel 2:28-32 prophesies a thoroughly inclusive equality for all of God's people who are indwelt by the Spirit during the dispensation of the Church.

Matthew 19:4

'Haven't you read,' he replied, 'that at the beginning the Creator made them male and female . . .'

Traditional Christian View Matthew 19:4 contains Jesus' response to the Jewish leaders' legal query: What are the conditions, if any, under which it is lawful for a man to divorce his wife?⁹⁹

Christian tradition largely continues to frame biblically-oriented marital relationships inside its stereotypical structure: dominant male with subordinate female. Julia Shelhamer wrote, "Happy is the home where love rules, where the husband is the personification of love, and where the wife submits to his judgment in everything."¹⁰⁰ Shelhamer, writing at the cusp of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, uses immediately subsequent statements to radically qualify her description of the stereotypically ideal Christian marriage. Her description however can stand alone, a monolith defining the exemplary, perhaps mostly metaphysical, traditional Christian marriage partnership.

Logan, in his introduction to Shelhamer's work, refers to "the three hoods without which no woman can be perfect - Christian-hood, Wife-hood and Mother-hood."¹⁰¹

Roberts' View In light of the foregoing exegesis of referential selections from Genesis, much of the material which pertains to Matthew 19:4 would be redundant.

Roberts does however expand upon his observations (5-6, 13-14 above) to include his objection to domestic society's requiring:

the wife to be subject to the husband . . .

This is a great mistake. If it did, Christ would doubtless have given instructions accordingly.

But it does not. The greatest domestic happiness

always exists where husband and wife live together on terms of equality. Two men, having individual interests, united only by business ties, daily associate as partners for years, without either of them being in subjection to the other. They consider each other as equals; and treat each other as equals. Then, cannot a man and woman, united by conjugal love, the strongest tie that can unite two human beings, having the same interests, live together in the same manner?

Christ came to repair the ruin wrought by the fall.
In Him, and in Him only, is Paradise restored.

The Gospel belongs to woman as much as to man.¹⁰²

Summary The traditional Christian pattern drawn out of Matthew 19:4 portrays an ideal which cannot be universally approximated by spouses of either gender.

Logan's "hoods" might be viewed in the 1990's as being hoods of another sort, inviting challenge in the name of Wesleyan Perfection. Loganhood, carried to its logical extreme, would deny Perfection, as Methodism often interprets it, to all except men and married mothers.

Kee, analyzing 19:3-8, points up Matthew's compelling linkage of Mark 10:2-9 with Genesis 1:27 and 2:24:

for the stability of the marriage relationship . . . God has indicated by creating persons as sexual beings that he intended for man and woman to be joined and remain joined together. There is no place in his purpose for divorce. Matthew repeats (verses 4, 8) that God had in mind this intention of indissoluble unity **from the beginning**.¹⁰³

Wesley, in his Explanatory Notes, extends his commentary toward an unexpected dimension: "By making them one man and one woman, He condemned polygamy; by making them 'one flesh' He condemned divorce."¹⁰⁴

Spencer probes the divine intent inherent in gender unity. "At creation . . . male and female form a unity. It is that unity which mirrors God's likeness."¹⁰⁵ Gray delves into the mutual need which

necessity implies, a need which can be met only by means of the combining of female and male perceptions of our identity as humans.¹⁰⁶

Moloney posits that "Christian discipleship can admit of no culturally or historically conditioned barriers."¹⁰⁷ The central issue which emanates out of Matthew 19:4 is augmented in verses 7-8 (extending into the verses which follow 8), with Jesus' response to the Pharisees' follow-up question:

'Then why,' they retorted, 'did Moses command us to give a written divorce-notice and dismiss the woman?'

'It was because you knew so little of the meaning of love that Moses allowed you to divorce your wives! But that was not the original principle . . .'

Phillips Translation

Acts 1:13-14; 2:17-18; 8:3, 12; 13:1-3; 21:8-9

When they arrived, they went upstairs to the room where they were staying. Those present were Peter, John, James and Andrew; Philip and Thomas, Bartholomew and Matthew; James son of Alphaeus and Simon the Zealot, and Judas son of James. They all joined together constantly in prayer, along with the women and Mary the mother of Jesus, and his brothers.

'In the last days, God says,
I will pour out my Spirit on all people.
Your sons and daughters will prophesy,
your young men will see visions,
your old men will dream dreams.
Even on my servants, both men and women,
I will pour out my Spirit in those days,
and they will prophesy.'

But Saul began to destroy the church. Going from house to house, he dragged off men and women and put them in prison.

But when they believed Philip as he preached the good news of the kingdom of God and the name of Jesus Christ, they were baptized, both men and women.

In the church at Antioch there were prophets and

teachers: Barnabas, Simeon called Niger, Lucius of Cyrene, Manaen (who had been brought up with Herod the tetrarch) and Saul. While they were worshiping the Lord and fasting, the Holy Spirit said, 'Set apart for me Barnabas and Saul for the work to which I have called them.' So after they had fasted and prayed, they placed their hands on them and sent them off.

Leaving the next day, we reached Caesarea and stayed at the house of Philip the evangelist, one of the Seven. He had four unmarried daughters who had the gift of prophecy.

Traditional Christian View **1:13-14** Tradition continues to accept and to propagate 1:13-14 as the model of obedience for all Christians. Men and women "joined together constantly in prayer . . ." while they waited in Jerusalem, as Jesus had commanded (Acts 1:4), until they should receive the gift which God had promised, that is to say, baptism with/in the Holy Spirit, conferring power to be witnesses for Jesus Christ.

2:17-18 Peter's Pentecost-Day appropriation of Joel's prophecy (Joel 2:28-29) is sometimes lifted from its Acts context, to be whisked away into eschatological limbo by means of the vehicle of prophecy (23 above). The womanly courage implicit in **8:3** elicits praise from virtually all the church. **8:12** Although local as well as denominational politic prerequisites may vary, Christian baptism is available to almost everyone. It is however reasonable to assume that one might discover pockets of Christians who, out of a unique interpretive perspective, might decline to baptize females, 8:12 notwithstanding as a precedent.

13:1-3 Many who practice Christian tradition extensively remain comfortable with 13:1-3 which appears to convey the information that only males were called and ordained or blessed. No woman is named among this particular group of prophets and teachers who pioneered the

exercise of ecclesial authority by means of sending out Saul and Barnabas.

21:8-9 The gift of prophecy is generally consigned to women and men of Old Testament times, and to the first century of the New Testament era. A number of tradition-oriented Christian groups however do continue the practice of prophetic utterance.

Roberts' View **1:14** "So in the first prayer meeting, it appears the women went ahead. 'These all continued with one accord, in prayer and supplication with the women' --Acts 1:14"¹⁰⁸ Roberts' unexpected emphasis could surprise the reader into a fresh, parabolic discerning of additional pericopes. **2:17-18** There are no distinctions made between the "sons and daughters" or between the "servants and handmaidens.

Whatever is affirmed of the one is affirmed of the other."¹⁰⁹ The words "in the last days" imply that the outpouring of the Spirit was to "continue to be fulfilled throughout the entire Christian dispensation . . . If on the day of Pentecost they were 'in the last days . . .'" - and this is tacit in Peter's "this is what was spoken by the prophet Joel . . ." (Acts 2:16) - "then certainly we are now in the last days."¹¹⁰ If that is so, then we may expect "the same outpouring of the Spirit on the women as on the men." Prophecy in this context means speaking for God under the direct influence of His Spirit, hardly related at all to speculative prognosticating. "No distinction of sex is to be observed in the power and liberty given by God to speak for Him."¹¹¹

8:12 From its earliest days, the Christian Church diverged from the Jewish religion in that Christian women as well as men were

baptized.¹¹²

Sellew's View 13:2-3 The church in general has expanded the simple laying on of hands for healing and for blessing (i.e., setting apart) into ordination, a ceremony which confers both recognition and blessing upon those whom the Holy Spirit has **already** chosen.¹¹³

2:17-18 If prophecy means speaking for God, and if the pouring out of God's Spirit enables women and men, slave and free, young and old, to speak for him as he calls them; and if this outpouring signals the new age of Christ, it would be "strange, indeed, if the church," in that context, "forbade women the right to give inspired messages to the Church!"¹¹⁴ Philip, one of the original seven deacons in the Jerusalem Church, had four daughters whom Luke identifies as prophets (21:8-9).

8:3 Saul, later Paul, in his zeal to rid Jerusalem of this heretical sect, stressed the importance of "the place of women in the church . . ." by the fact that he arrested them along with the men.¹¹⁵

Summary Roberts' emphasizing the temporal primacy of the women at prayer delightfully multiplies support for women in ministry - and God expects his people to take delight in his Word (his Law). The crux is that a group of women and men believed strongly enough in Jesus as the Messiah to obey him, together, equally. 2:17-18 Baird offers a comparison of Joel with Luke: "**the Spirit** has been poured out and **the day of the Lord** has come. For Joel the "Lord" was God and the "day" was the end. But for Luke the "Lord" is Jesus and the "day" is the time of preaching."¹¹⁶

Juxtaposed over against the nearly celebrative atmosphere of 2:17-18 are the women about whom Gundry writes; the women who leave

the church because they "cannot bear the oppression of silence and disuse forced upon them."¹¹⁷ Wesley's Explanatory Notes corroborate ongoing gender equality:

17. The times of the Messiah are frequently called the last days, the gospel being the last dispensation of divine grace. I will pour out of my Spirit - not on the day of Pentecost only. Upon all flesh - On persons of every age, sex, and rank.

Perhaps the most prevalent non-traditional application of 2:17-18 is Charismatic. The thrust of this movement is binary. An overt dichotomy has, regrettably, developed. This division, as I see it, is cosmetic; it need not force universal separation into hostile factions, although this has already occurred among a number of groups. The Pentecostal charismatic movement incorporates individuals' use of charismata within its primary signal structure, baptism in the Spirit. A number of other Christian groups, while not concentrating their understanding of the presence of the Spirit within this single phenomenon, acknowledge that only the Spirit's presence enables and enhances Christians' use of charismata (gifts of the Spirit). The Holiness Movement, for example, recognizes the indwelling presence of the Holy Spirit as sanctifier of both recipient and gift. Huckle and Visokay, writing out of a Johannine context, focus this spiritual activity: "At the center of the [triune] tapestry is the glorified Lord who releases God's power and who looses human powerlessness, the same whom the woman met at the well."¹¹⁸

8:3 presents the crucible in which "**All** who would live a godly life in Christ Jesus . . ." (2 Tim. 3:12) will be refined. Wesley adds a note of linguistic interest: "Saul made havoc of the church - like

some furious beast of prey. So the Greek word properly signifies. Men and women - Regarding neither age nor sex."¹²⁰ Wesley's commentary on 8:12 might, perhaps tenuously, extend out from baptism to presuppose gender equality in charismatic service: "But when they believed - what Philip preached, they then saw and felt the real power of God, and submitted thereto."¹²¹

Spencer augments 13:2-3:

Clearly their [Saul's and Barnabas'] ordination included the laying on of hands and prayer, the church's symbolic earthly obedience to God's specific command.

Consequently, the true biblical question is not should women be ordained but rather does God command women to preach, to teach, and to have authority? Then the church can symbolically affirm and pray for what God has already commanded.

Christ gave the people as "gifts" people who would focus on Christ's own body, the church, mending, repairing, instructing, upbuilding, and strengthening that body in order that it might mature. Maturity includes obedience to God, unity, knowledge, truthfulness, and love (Eph. 4: 13-16). Now, too, we ordain persons whose calling is to equip other Christians for ministry.

Consequently, we should ask whether the Lord gives gifts of apostleship, prophecy, evangelism, teaching, and pastoring to women. . . . would not the God who gives gifts and heartily reproves not developing such gifts (e.g. Luke 19:11-27) want women to develop their leadership gifts and be publically approved for doing so? Indeed, if even one woman could be found who was affirmed as an apostle, a prophet, an evangelist, a pastor, or a teacher, then one could - one must - conclude that women have been given gifts from God for positions to which we now ordain people and for positions considered authoritative in the first century church.¹²²

Snyder further clarifies the point by means of defining authorization for charismatic exercise among the ecclesia: "Whether we call them elders, deacons, pastors, bishops or superintendents, the fact is that God provides for leadership in the church through the exercise of the

gifts of the Spirit. This is God's ecclesiology."¹²³ In a somewhat related context, Snyder amplifies:

Since the first Gentile outreach recorded in the book of Acts and through the ages, God has been calling and sending forth his charismatically equipped missionaries. The Antiochene pattern (Acts 13:1-3) has been repeated countless times and will continue to be repeated until Christ returns (Matt. 24:14). It is God who calls and gives gifts, and the gift and the call go together.¹²⁴

Acts 21:8-9 Spencer, in historically justifying Philip's four preaching (prophesying) daughters, ecclesially vindicates, by means of associative extension, all women who preach the Gospel of Jesus Christ:

In the Old Testament Miriam, Huldah, and the wife of Isaiah were called prophets. Miriam was God's appointed leader over Israel along with Moses and Aaron (Micah 6:4). Only Huldah could interpret the significance of Deuteronomy to the devout King Josiah, to Hilkiah the high priest, and to Josiah's cabinet, Shaphan, Ahikam, and Asaiah. Deborah was both a prophet and a judge (Judg. 4:4). As a Judge, she was appointed by God to rule the government, direct the army, and judge legal matters. Deborah was so impressive as a military strategist and a prophetess that Barak refused to combat Sisera without her. Under this 'mother of Israel,' the land had rest for forty years. Many Old Testament heroes, while devout, had major flaws, but Deborah and her contemporary Ruth stand out in the Scriptures as totally pure. Joel proclaimed that God will afterwards pour out God's Spirit on all so that the daughters will prophesy and so they did (2:28). Anna is called a prophetess (Luke 2:36). Only Anna, together with Simeon, recognized the youthful Saviour and she preached about Jesus throughout Jerusalem. Phillip's four daughters were active prophets who became well known in the ancient church.¹²⁵

In light of the above, Spencer thrusts deeply into today's practical ecclesiology:

When examining the New Testament to decide whether women should become active acknowledged leaders in ministry, one notices that present church practices often jar against one another. The presence of women apostles, prophets, and teachers indicates that women had and were approved in positions considered authoritative in the first-century

church. Those positions did equip the body of Christ for the work of ministry, a common contemporary criterion for a 'Minister.' Probably the functional equivalents of today's 'head' pastor was yesterday's overseer of church communities.¹²⁶

Snyder, in his discussion of "The Rise of Pietism," includes Spener's remarks on the role of women (1677):

Since God dignifies believing women also with the spiritual gifts, Joel 2:28, 29; Acts 21:9; 1 Cor. 11:5, the exercise of them in proper order cannot be forbidden. The apostles themselves make mention of those godly women, who worked together with them and edified their fellow men . . .¹²⁷

Earlier (1977), Snyder had elucidated upon Yoder's work with regard to church leadership: "In fact the New Testament description of the Church as the messianic community undercuts the very basis of any institutional/hierarchical view and puts ministry on a charismatic/organic basis."¹²⁸ This is to say that the New Testament teaches that God provided leaders for the Church, that leadership was considered to be the exercising of charismata, and the the New Testament Church was both flexible and fluid in its understanding and allowance for the ways in which these "leadership functions operated."¹²⁹

Christian traditionalists along with Modernists and non-conformists largely agree that women in leadership roles of some sort are the life-support of the apostolic, universal Church. There is probably a rational position in the traditional argument against women being ordained to pastoral and administrative leadership in the church. However, whether expansion or definition has introduced the fault, I reiterate that both the Old Testament and the New Testament clearly justify and vindicate unqualified universal gender equality, and **that most particularly** in the body of Christ.

Romans 16:1, 12

I commend to you our sister Phoebe, a servant of the church in Cenchrea.

Greet Tryphena and Tryphosa, those women who work hard in the Lord. Greet my dear friend Persis, another woman who has worked very hard in the Lord.

Traditional Christian View While all tradition does not deny that a number of the women Paul mentions in 16:1 and 12 were deaconesses, or that they preached, the preponderance of opinion is similar to Barclay's: "A female who administered offices to those of her own sex, such as the baptism of adult women."¹³⁰

Roberts' View Roberts concludes in his heavily supported thesis, that deaconesses in the early church were both church officers and preachers, and that Phoebe was in every sense a minister (pastor):

When any words are given an ecclesiastical meaning in the New Testament they must always be understood as having that meaning when used in treating of church officers, and the connection warrants it. The word . . . deacon, where used in the New Testament as referring to an officer of the church, when translated at all, in both our common and revised versions is uniformly translated minister, except in one solitary instance. That is where it refers to a woman. 'I commend unto you Phebe, our sister, which is a servant (in the original . . . deacon) of the church which is at Cenchrea . . .

Here you see the power of prejudice in even learned and pious men. Paul, when called a deacon, our translators call a minister; but Phebe, when called a deacon they make a servant. That there might be no dispute about her sex Paul calls her our sister.

That there might be no doubt about her ecclesiastical position he calls her deacon or minister of the church at Cenchrea. Nothing can be more clear; nothing can be more definite.

Here, then, we have a record in the New Testament of one woman who was a minister.¹³¹

Sellew's View Sellew garnered a collection of definitions of

"deacon," along with a number of opinions about the ecclesiastical duties of Phoebe, Tryphena, Tryphosa, and Persis. His insistence that women deacons preached and administered (though perhaps only for women) extends to speculation that there may have been female elders as well in the early church.¹³²

Bristow's View Bristow, writing nearly a century after Roberts, also asserts that the apostle Paul points out in 16:1-2 that Phoebe was a **deacon** in the Cenchrean church: "the word itself is masculine, the same word used elsewhere in the New Testament for that office."¹³³

Summary The point is probably moot, with nearly equal evidence for each choice. Meticulous scholarship however appears to tend toward the preacher/administrator/minister/deacon interpretations, not only of 16:1 and 12, but of a number of similar pericopes as well.

1 Corinthians 11:3-5; 14:33-35

Now I want you to realize that the head of every man is Christ, and the head of every woman is man, and the head of Christ is God. Every man who prays or prophesies with his head covered dishonors his head. And every woman who prays or prophesies with her head uncovered dishonors her head - it is just as though her head were shaved.

For God is not a God of disorder but of peace:

As in all the congregation of the saints, women should remain silent in the churches. They are not allowed to speak, but must be in submission, as the Law says. If they want to inquire about something, they should ask their own husbands at home, for it is disgraceful for a woman to speak in the church.

Traditional Christian View Henry concludes his rationalization of the Corinthian texts above, along with 1 Timothy 2:9-15: "Paul in no way grounds his argument in a protest against established social

custom. Rather he appeals for subordination of women in Christian public worship on the basis of a divinely established order, the violation of which he considers reprehensible (c. Col. 3:18). Indeed, he identifies his teaching on the point in terms of divine commandment incumbent even upon those who may claim private revelation (1 Cor. 14:36, 37)."¹³⁴

Elisabeth Elliott, writing out of the Fundamentalist perspective, contends that:

Paul called for the subjection of women. He pointed to the order of creation: quite simply, woman was made for man. Man was not made for woman. For those who accept Scripture as authoritative, any attempt to evade or reinterpret this statement is mere tergiversation. A knowledge of what a thing is made for is prerequisite to its proper use. In a vastly harmonious arrangement of the universe, it is not so much a question of whether a creature is higher or better, or lower or worse, but a question of what it's there for.¹³⁵

Furthermore, since "Service to God is never a purely private matter," it is the church's "duty" to judge a woman's vocation "theologically rather than sociologically . . . No one, merely because he or she has the Spirit, may disregard the judgment of the congregation." Elliott continues: "the ordination of women is not proscribed because of women's lack of spiritual qualification. . . . It is a question of appropriateness."¹³⁶ Neither the Fall nor redemption in Jesus Christ have abrogated the "natural order established at creation . . ."¹³⁶

I quote Elliott at length below, without comment, because she articulates the ongoing tradition of Fundamentalist interpretation cogently:

The Apostle Paul did not allow women to teach or to usurp authority over men - not because women were incompetent,

but because the structure of church and home, as an image of the relationship between the God of the Old Testament and his covenant people, and between Christ and his Bride, requires subordination. . . . Subjection of wives to husbands as the Church is subject to Christ is an important aspect of the Church's message. The Church cannot, therefore, negate this truth that it teaches by ordaining women to the office of minister of [or?] Word proclaimer.

Equality in the kingdom of Christ, as set forth in Galatians 3:28, does not erase, for the political ecclesiastica, the distinction established from the beginning, the distinction that Paul sought to preserve when he admonished women to be silent or, when praying or prophesying (clearly exceptions to the rule of silence), to cover their heads as a sign of subjection. The particular ways in which sexual differentiation is signaled in various cultures may differ widely. The use of the headcloth or veil in Paul's time may perhaps be an example of a custom that might vary in a different time and place; but what it represented, the subjection of women, is a divinely inspired principle and not negotiable. Paul recognized in the desire to dispense with the head covering an attempt to nullify the hierarchical order by equalizing men and women, whose respective positions in church and home had been assigned by God.¹³⁷

Wesley's observations on Eastern cultural practices might serve to support this severely traditional exegesis:

11:4-5 St. Paul seems to mean, As in these Eastern nations veiling the head is a badge of subjection, so a man who prays or prophesies with a veil on his head reflects a dishonour on Christ, whose representative he is.

But every woman - Who, under an immediate impulse of the Spirit (for then only was a woman suffered to speak in the church), prays or prophesies without a veil on her face, as it were disclaims subjection, and reflects dishonour on man, her head. For it is the same in effect, as if she had cut her hair short, and wore it in the distinguishing form of a man. In those ages, men wore their hair exceeding short, as appears from the ancient statues and pictures.

14:34-35 Let your women be silent in the churches - Unless they are under an extraordinary impulse of the Spirit. For in other cases, it is not permitted them to speak - By way of teaching in public assemblies. But to be in subjection - to the man whose proper office it is to lead and instruct the congregation.

And even if they desire to learn anything - Still they

are not to speak in public, but to ask their own husbands at home - That is the place, and those are the persons to inquire of.¹³⁸

Roberts' View Roberts succinctly exegetes, in practical tandem, **1 Cor. 14:34-35**, **1 Tim. 2:11-12**, and **1 Cor. 11:5**. He points out their unique biblical status as the only passages which "seem to forbid women to preach, or to perform all the other duties of a minister of the Gospel."¹³⁹ His commentary might appear to be a comically grotesque, tongue-in-cheek, caricatured extension of Paul's teachings about women's ecclesial and familial relationships:

2. No denomination applies these passages literally. If they did, they would not allow:

(1) Women to sing in church. For to sing is not to keep silence.

(2) Nor to pray; for the same reason.

(3) Nor to testify; for to testify is to speak.

(4) Nor to teach in the Sabbath school or elsewhere; for the statement is general - I suffer not a woman to teach.

(5) Nor to write religious books, or for religious periodicals; for this is to teach.

Notice. Preaching is not specified. It is forbidden only as it is one method of breaking the silence, one method of teaching. . . .

2. It is evident that Paul did not intend to prohibit women from taking any part in religious services, or even from preaching. For, in this same epistle, he gives directions about their dress when in public congregations they take a part in the exercises, - pray and prophesy - that is, preach.¹⁴⁰

Roberts' subsequent defenses and refutations concerning these passages are in common with a number of others who share his interpretive milieu.

Sellew's View The rights, duties, and privileges engendered by church membership may be followed by "those privileges and duties . . .," preaching the Gospel and/or participating in church government for example, which result from "some official relation to the church."¹⁴¹ Sellew appears to sanction women as church administrators. In light

of this complete work however, one might infer that his 1914 position on this particular point was not espoused except with considerable trepidation.

Bristow's View Bristow offers an etymological argument in refutation of traditional translations of male/husband, female/wife, boss or chief/physical head, shear/cut short, and conceal/ cover "down over"/veil. He then, interestingly enough, clarifies 11:3-5 in its contextual relation to 2 Cor. 3:7-18 by means of a historical/biblical exposition:

In 2 Cor. 3:7-18, Paul referred to the veil that Moses put over his face after descending from Mt. Sinai because his skin shone with a brightness that frightened the Israelites (Exod. 34:29-35).

The Jewish custom of wearing head coverings during worship was linked to the idea of God's radiance (Shekhinah) shining upon the devout. Just as one might wear a hat to keep off the sun's rays, one would wear a hat when entering the brilliance of God's splendor. The custom of wearing something on top of one's head became a symbol of the kind of glory that Moses covered with a veil. in 1 Corinthians Paul gave a theological reason why a man ought not to wear something hanging down from the head while praying or prophesying. He began by reminding his readers that their head is not Moses, but Christ. . . . His next sentences imply that what one does with one's head makes a theological statement about Christ.

Jewish custom demanded that women too cover their heads when worshiping. . . . But what a woman did with her head held different social significance from what a man did with his. . . . For a [married] Jewish woman to loose her hair in public . . . was the same, he argued, as if they had their hair cut close (the style of prostitutes) or as if they had had their heads shaved. . . . The question is not what a woman does with her head, but what she says by what she does with her head.

Since customs have changed and hairstyles no longer mean what they did in the societies of Paul's time, his specific instructions are no longer relevant to modern Christians. However, the principle behind these instructions, of being sensitive to what message our dress codes and styles convey to others still holds.¹⁴²

Bristow's expansion of 14:33-35, similar to Roberts', discovers the cause back of Paul's ordering women to be silent in the church congregations to be God's penchant for peaceable order. Paul saw God as being offended by the apparently boisterous tumult which emanated from the women's joyful response to their new cultural freedom in Christ.¹⁴³

Summary Religions and cultures function in the same territory by means of reciprocal permission. Appropriateness therefore is always being defined and redefined, expanded and contracted, according to currently prevailing ethos. An esoteric interpretation of one which diminishes the other becomes impracticable.

The Corinthian women "were not silent, they apparently were monopolizing the whole service!"¹⁴⁴ The issue in 1 Corinthians 11 is not their participation, but "simply their attire . . .," alongside their social decorum "while doing so."¹⁴⁵

Storkey speaks to the traditional/fundamentalist/holiness/charismatic/liberal stances with:

My own life began to change when I started to see the debate, not from entrenched human positions, but from the light of the Gospel

Nowhere did he [Jesus] make pronouncements about women's "proper" role in society. In fact the only time he was drawn into this situation, he rejected the traditional domestic stereotype, telling Martha not to be obsessed with kitchen duties, but to come and learn more about the Gospel!

Each of us is called to make our unique contribution in Christ's name.¹⁴⁶

Storkey offers a number of rational reference points for women in the church today.

Snodgrass and Snyder, citing 11:5, write that "it is clear that

women were praying and prophesying [preaching] in the early church."¹⁴⁷ Similar to Bristow, they enter into 14:34–36 contextually, beginning with verse 26. During the worship service in Corinth, each person was encouraged to contribute to the service "by offering some item for praise or instruction."¹⁴⁸ This pericope extends beyond Paul's asking the women to be silent; it continues:

Women were not the only ones to be silent. Anyone who was going to speak in tongues is told to keep silent if no interpreter were present (14:28). Also if one prophet were speaking and revelation came to someone else, the first prophet should be silent. Nor were women the only ones told to be in submission. The various prophets were to be submissive to each other as well (14:34). . . . The issue with regard to women is clearly within the context of the disruption of the worship service.¹⁴⁹

While 1 Corinthians 11:3–5 and 14:33–35 may appear to continue confusingly complicated due to linguistic divergences, cultural diversities, and interpretive differences, reliable scholarship persistently reveals valid textual readings which foster, as well as support, gender equality.

Galatians 3:28

There is neither Jew nor Greek, slave nor free, male nor female, for you are all one in Christ Jesus.

Traditional Christian View Packer boldly queries, "does not wisdom urge us to stop this practice [of ordaining women] and point us to a better way of benefitting from women's ministry than by ordaining them . . .?"¹⁵⁰ That God has "blessed the ministry of ordained women . . ." does not indicate that he "wants them"¹⁵¹ in this role. He has after all "blessed his people before through intrinsically

inappropriate arrangements and may be doing so again."¹⁵²

Packer, an Episcopal clergyman and professor of theology, confidently asserts that the New Testament, in affirming the maleness of the historical Jesus, envisions "a presbyteriate of manly men . . ." which "indicates that the truest womanly ministry will be distinct from this . . ." because "one male is best represented by another male . . ." Packer continues: "Both males and females bear his image and in personal dignity are equal in every way, but God has set them in a nonreversible relation to each other."¹⁵³

This particular traditional bifurcation of the gender equality presented in Galatians 3:28 channels women's ecclesial participation into a subjectively internalized equality in spirit which is not to be mistaken for, or realized by means of, ecclesial equality. Packer concurs with Elliott that a woman's dignity will never be jeopardized by a call from God to ordained ministry. Both also extend and expand the traditional interpretation of the Genesis 2:18-23 Creation account to include gender relationships among persons in Christ:

The creation pattern, as biblically set forth, is: man to lead, woman to support; man to initiate, woman to enable; man to take responsibility for the well-being of woman, woman to take responsibility for helping man.

Elliott, Selected

The argument here is this: presbyters* are set apart for a role of authoritative pastoral leadership. But this role is for manly men rather than for womanly women, according to the creation pattern that redemption restores. Paternal pastoral oversight, which is of the essence of the presbyterial role, is not a task for which women are naturally fitted by their Maker. [* "the person or persons (usually professional clergy) officially charged with the oversight of a local congregation."]¹⁵⁴

Women are to look to Mary, Jesus' mother, for a model as well

inappropriate arrangements and may be doing so again."¹⁵²

Packer, an Episcopal clergyman and professor of theology, confidently asserts that the New Testament, in affirming the maleness of the historical Jesus, envisions "a presbyteriate of manly men . . ." which "indicates that the truest womanly ministry will be distinct from this . . ." because "one male is best represented by another male . . ." Packer continues: "Both males and females bear his image and in personal dignity are equal in every way, but God has set them in a nonreversible relation to each other."¹⁵³

This particular traditional bifurcation of the gender equality presented in Galatians 3:28 channels women's ecclesial participation into a subjectively internalized equality in spirit which is not to be mistaken for, or realized by means of, ecclesial equality. Packer concurs with Elliott that a woman's dignity will never be jeopardized by a call from God to ordained ministry. Both also extend and expand the traditional interpretation of the Genesis 2:18-23 Creation account to include gender relationships among persons in Christ:

The creation pattern, as biblically set forth, is: man to lead, woman to support; man to initiate, woman to enable; man to take responsibility for the well-being of woman, woman to take responsibility for helping man.

Elliott, Selected

The argument here is this: presbyters* are set apart for a role of authoritative pastoral leadership. But this role is for manly men rather than for womanly women, according to the creation pattern that redemption restores. Paternal pastoral oversight, which is of the essence of the presbyterial role, is not a task for which women are naturally fitted by their Maker. [* "the person or persons (usually professional clergy) officially charged with the oversight of a local congregation."]¹⁵⁴

Women are to look to Mary, Jesus' mother, for a model as well

as for proof that ordination is not necessary for a woman; she can serve God and Christ significantly enough in non-ordained roles and "informal ministries."¹⁵⁵ In addition, since a woman's ministry is only maternal while a man's ministry is paternal, a woman who works professionally in the church should work:

In partnership with a male leader, rather than as a sole pastor. In such a partnership, the psychological dynamics of the "help meet" relationship of Genesis 2:18 will be maintained, in the sense that the woman will feel herself, and be felt, to be helping a man fulfill a calling that embraces them both. If she is on her own, this cannot be, and one element of womanly satisfaction will be lacking to her.

Since authority resides in the Word of God rather than in preachers and teachers of either sex, . . . a woman's preaching and teaching gifts may be used to the full in situations where a male minister is in charge and the woman's ministry of the Word has the effect of supplementing and supporting his own preaching and teaching.¹⁵⁶

The role of Christian women is to always and everywhere serve God by means of supporting men in their calling, nurturing children, and caring for the weak. This God-mandated pattern of limitation by gender, when examined in light of Galatians 3:28, undergoes a revelatory metamorphosis, emerging as one of the inexplicable paradoxes which inhabit the freedom given equally to all who are in Christ.

Roberts' View Juxtaposed over against traditional expositions, Roberts' exegesis trumpets a clarion justification for ecclesial gender equality. It is significant that Jesus never spoke against woman's right to be "in the fullest sense . . ." a minister of the Gospel, and that Jesus applied the same "rules of moral conduct . . ." equally to all who were accountable.¹⁵⁷ To infer that women are not to preach because Jesus did not include a woman among the twelve apostles is to

imply by extension that Gentiles are not to preach because the twelve apostles Jesus chose, and the apostle Paul as well, were Jews.

Roberts' response to the objection that the context of Galatians 3:28 (that salvation is by faith, not by means of keeping the Law, and that this applies universally) limits the application to salvation alone for women is that, if such were the case, "female" would not be specified. Not once in the myriad offers of salvation made throughout the New Testament is woman ("female") specifically mentioned, but instead woman is regarded as being included in the Gospel's salvific provision. "He that believeth and is baptized shall be saved," exemplifies the gender-inclusive nature of the New Testament invitation. Galatians 3:28 teaches "the perfect equality of all, under the Gospel, in rights and privileges, without respect to nationality, or condition, or sex."¹⁵⁸

Sellew's View While Sellew in fact predicates his pamphlet upon Galatians 3:28, he does not comment upon that text in the body of the work.

Bristow's View Bristow describes one result of his research into the historical foundations upon which ecclesial gender inequality is built:

It was as if the veil described by Thomas Fuller had been lifted from my own eyes, and now I could read afresh the urgent cry from Paul for churches to have women learn, to let them be leaders, to let them have the authority due them, to realize in practice the great truth that 'there is neither male nor female . . . you are all one in Christ Jesus (Gal. 3:28). I found that Paul presented a new and modern-sounding model for husbands and wives, one that offers a fresh quality to marital interaction.¹⁵⁹

Bristow avers that the transition from what Paul really said about

women into the male-chauvinistic appearance of some of his writings happened because Paul's first quoters and interpreters were Greek and pagan rather than Jewish and Christian. They understood his words within their own contextual milieu of Greek philosophy, customs, and culture. The long-lived cultural power of Greece initiated the ongoing process which keeps on defining and redefining women's place socially and ecclesiastically according to Aristotelian tradition.¹⁶⁰

Summary Moloney proffers Mark 3:31-35 alongside Matthew 12:46-50 as a set of parallel tracks leading out from a Christological declaration of gender equality:

Then he looked at those seated in a circle around him and said, 'Here are my mother and my brothers! Whoever does God's will is my brother and sister and mother.'

Mark 3:34-35

Pointing to his disciples, he said, 'Here are my mother and brothers. For whoever does the will of my Father in heaven is my brother and sister and mother.'

Matthew 12:49-50

The texts above both describe and identify the disciples of Jesus, with no distinctions or divisions between male and female; disciples are all people who practice radical personal obedience to Jesus' Father. The Matthean community, the "new family" of Jesus, is comprised of women and men who are doing God's will. "The essential characteristics of any Christian community . . ." are these: 'There is neither male nor female, for you are all one in Christ.'¹⁶¹

Furnish's declaration that baptism unites all who believe in Jesus Christ, and furthermore, that this unity is without gender discrimination even to the extent of equality as "full heirs of the promises of God . . ."¹⁶² represents an exegetical application of the

linkage between baptism and equality of the sexes decried by Elliott in her article quoted above.

Spencer's contextual application of the law as paiadagogos to the "young" heirs of God's promises until these adopted children mature enough to inherit lends feminine support to Furnish's commentary above. Spencer further reveals that oneness in Christ disallows any sort of divergence or dichotomy between the spiritual and the social; because our act-centrum, God, is one God, "the church is to be 'one' in unity, its members living in harmony, economically and spiritually interdependent, serving the interests of others in humility, even as Jesus Christ, to the extent of death."¹⁶³ This God-given mandate over-rules all our petty self-inflicted limitations along with human-imposed discriminatory inequities wherever they are allowed to exist. It gives the lie to biblical exegeses which limit to males those whom Jesus Christ has liberated. Therefore whether among the community of believers (Ephesians 5:22-24; Philippians 4:2-3; 1 Timothy 2:9-15 and 3:13; Titus 2:3-5; Hebrews 5:1) or in the intimacy of our homes (Ephesians 5:22-23; 1 Timothy 3:8-13 and 2:9-15; Titus 2:3-5), women and men are one in Christ - and one divided by anything is the poorer for that division. We the church, both women and men, need now to redefine who we are in relation to our history, to our context, and to the ever-fluid nature of our future. All times are right for initiating needful change, though none will appear convenient.

[Galatians 3:28 appeared to be the pivotal scripture beyond which the refining of both challenge and support for ecclesial equality for

women began to refer repetitiously to materials, the Genesis accounts in particular, already well covered. Acknowledging that each ambiguous or challenging scripture deserves its own explication, redundancy can become unduly time consuming.]

Theological foundations, frameworks, and reflections in support of gender equality, already numerous, continue to proliferate. Each one however presents its author's biases, bents, and perspectives, all of which enhance the researcher's personal reflections as well as augmenting her or his information pool. In this vein, the theological material above, compiled in order to clarify, vindicate, and justify my personal convictions about women in ordained ministry, can provide for others the same sorts of help which their work has so richly supplied to me.

COLLATED TEXTS

<u>Roberts</u>	<u>Sellew</u>	<u>Bristow</u>
<u>Genesis</u> 1:26-27 (50) 3:16 (50)	<u>Genesis</u> 1:27 (5)	<u>Genesis</u> 1:27 (59, 111, 117) 3:16-19 (17, 32, 59)
<u>Psalms</u> 68:11 (87)	<u>Psalms</u> 68:11-12 (9)	<u>Psalms</u>
<u>Joel</u>	<u>Joel</u> 2:28-32 (8-9)	<u>Joel</u> 2:28-32 (57)
<u>Matthew</u> 19:4 (51)	<u>Matthew</u>	<u>Matthew</u> 19:3-9 (92)
<u>Acts</u> 1:14 (57, 140) 1:22 (140) 2:17-18 (142, 88) 5:14 (57) 6:6 (141) 8:3 (57) 8:12 (57) 13:1-3 (42) 14:23 (41) 21:8 (94)	<u>Acts</u> 1:22 (14) 6:6, 3-6 (14, 22) 13:2, 3 (17, 15) 14:23 (14)	<u>Acts</u> 1:13-14, 14 (109, 54) 2:17-18 (57) 5:14 (54) 8:3 (55) 8:12 (54) 13:1 (58) 21:9-10 (58)
<u>Romans</u> 16:1 (96) 16:12 (63)	<u>Romans</u> 16:1 (20-27) 16:12 (21, 27)	<u>Romans</u> 16:1-2 (56)
<u>I Corinthians</u> 11:5 (61) 11:7 (49) 11:8-9 (48) 14:33-34 (65) 14:34 (60-65)	<u>I Corinthians</u> 11:2-5 (8) 14:34-35 (5)	<u>I Corinthians</u> 11:2-15 (82-88) 14:33-35 (60)
<u>Galatians</u> 3:28 (55)	<u>Galatians</u> 3:28 (5)	<u>Galatians</u> 3:28 (xiii, 2. 27, 111)
<u>Ephesians</u> 5:2 (36)	<u>Ephesians</u>	<u>Ephesians</u> 5:3 (104)

(Roberts)	(Sellew)	(Bristow), con't.
<u>Philippians</u> 4:3 (62)	<u>Philippians</u>	<u>Philippians</u> 4:2-3 (56)
<u>I Timothy</u> 2:7 (85) 2:11-12 (60, 139) 2:13 (48) 2:11-12 (60, 139) 3:9 (105) 3:10 (119) 5:1 (142) 5:17 (141)	<u>I Timothy</u> 2:7 (14) 2:11-13 (68, 69, 71) 3:8-13 (21-22) 3:11-12 (21, 25-27) 5:19 (15)	<u>I Timothy</u> 2:11-13 (68-69, 71) 3:8-13 (67) 5:1 (67) 5:17-19 (67)
<u>Titus</u> 1:4 (41)	<u>Titus</u> 1:5 (14)	<u>Titus</u> 1:5-7 (67)
<u>Hebrews</u> 5:1 (34)	<u>Hebrews</u> 5:1 (14)	<u>Hebrews</u>

Numbers in parenthesis indicate page numbers.

END NOTES

- ¹ Benjamin Titus Roberts, Ordaining Women (Rochester, NY: Earnest Christian Publishing House, 1891).
- ² Ibid., p. 141.
- ³ Ibid., p. 142
- ⁴ Ibid., p. 143.
- ⁵ Walter A. Sellew, Why Not? A Plea for the Ordination of those Women whom God Calls to Preach His Gospel (Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1914).
- ⁶ John Temple Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women (San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Pub., 1988).
- ⁷ The Doctrines and Discipline of the Free Methodist Church (Buffalo, NY; Winona Lake, IN; Indianapolis, IN: The Free Methodist Church. Revised following each General Conference, 1860 -).
- ⁸ Roberts, Ordaining women, p. 10.
- ⁹ Sellew, Why Not? . . ., p. 6.
- ¹⁰ Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 10.
- ¹¹ Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women, pp. 58-59.
- ¹² Augustine, The Good of Marriage, quoted in Aida Besancon Spencer, Beyond the Curse: Women Called to Ministry (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Pub., 1985), p. 18.
- ¹³ Elisabeth Leitch Elliott, "Called to be Liberated Women," The Christian Reader (Nov/Dec 1975), p. 44, quoted in Aida Besancon Spencer, Beyond the Curse: Women Called to Ministry (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Pub., 1985), p. 18.
- ¹⁴ _____, "Why I Oppose the Ordination of Women," Christianity Today (June 6, 1975), p. 14.
- ¹⁵ Aquinas, Summa Q. 92, art. 3, quoted in John Temple Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women (San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Pub., 1988), p. 115.

¹⁶ Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 47.

¹⁷ Ibid., p. 49.

¹⁸ Ibid., p. 49.

¹⁹ Aida Besacon Spencer, Beyond the Curse: Women Called to Ministry (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Pub., 1985), p. 25.

²⁰ Roberts, Ordaining Women, 49.

²¹ Sellew, Why Not? . . ., p. 5.

²² Ibid., p. 5.

²³ Ibid., p. 6.

²⁴ Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women, p. 26.

²⁵ Philo, On the Creation, pp. 165-166, quoted in John Temple Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women (San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Pub., 1988), p. 115.

²⁶ _____, Hypothetica trans. 380, quoted in John Temple Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women (San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Pub., 1988), p. 26.

²⁷ Josephus, Against Apion 2.25, trans. by William Whiston (Cincinnati: Morgan, 1849), quoted in John Temple Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women (San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Pub., 1988), p. 26.

²⁸ Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women, p. 27.

²⁹ Ibid., p. 28.

³⁰ Ibid., p. 29.

³¹ Clement of Alexandria, The Stromateis, trans. by James Donaldson (NY: Scribner's, 1903) 3.49 1-3, quoted in John Temple Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women (San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Pub., 1988) p. 29.

³² Bristow, What Paul Really Said About Women, p. 29.

³³ Ibid., p. 29.

³⁴ Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 13.

³⁵ Bristow, What Paul Really Said about Women, p. 120.

- ³⁶ John H. Marks, "The Book of Genesis," The Pentateuch: A Commentary on Genesis, Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers, Deuteronomy, Interpreter's Concise Commentary, 8 vols., Charles M. Laymon, ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1983, vol. 1), p. 14.
- ³⁷ Confucious, quoted in Light from Many Lamps, Lillian Eichler Watson, ed. (NY: Simon and Schuster, 1951), pp. 193, 195, 196.
- ³⁸ Bristow, What Paul Really Said about Women, p. 111.
- ³⁹ Adam Clarke, quoted in B.T. Roberts, Ordaining Women (Rochester, NY: Earnest Christian Publishing House, 1891), p. 49.
- ⁴⁰ Rosemary Radford Reuther, "Sexism as Ideology and Social System: Can Christianity Be Liberated from Patriarchy?", in With Both Eyes Open: Seeing Beyond Gender, Patricia Altenbernd Johnson and Janet Kalven, eds. (NY: The Pilgrim Press, 1988), p. 155.
- ⁴¹ Spencer, Beyond the Curse: Women Called to Ministry, p. 30.
- ⁴² Reuther, "Sexism as Ideology . . .", p. 156.
- ⁴³ Ibid., p. 156.
- ⁴⁴ Ibid., p. 156.
- ⁴⁵ Ibid., p. 156.
- ⁴⁶ Ibid., p. 156.
- ⁴⁷ Spencer, Beyond the Curse: . . ., p. 30.
- ⁴⁸ Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., p. 59.
- ⁴⁹ Elizabeth Dodson Gray, "Eden's Garden Revisited: A Christian Ecological Perspective," in With Both Eyes Open: Seeing Beyond Gender, Patricia Altenbernd Johnson and Janet Kalven, eds. (NY: The Pilgrim Press, 1988), pp. 36, 38.
- ⁵⁰ John J. Huckle and Paul Visokay, The Gospel According to St. John, vol. 1, New Testament for Spiritual Reading, 25 vols. (NY: Crossroad, 1981), p. 60.
- ⁵¹ Sirach 25:24, quoted in The Gospel According to St. John, vol. 1, New Testament for Spiritual Reading, 25 vols., John J. Huckle and Paul Visokay (NY: Crossroad, 1981), p. 60.
- ⁵² Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., p. 59.
- ⁵³ Reuther, "Sexism as Ideology . . .", p. 156.

⁵⁴ Spencer, Beyond the Curse: . . ., n.p.

⁵⁵ Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., p. 59.

⁵⁶ Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 50.

⁵⁷ Ibid., pp. 86, 51.

⁵⁸ Ibid., p. 51.

⁵⁹ Ibid., p. 51.

⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 51.

⁶¹ Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., p. 17.

⁶² Ibid., p. 17.

⁶³ Ibid., p. 16.

⁶⁴ Ibid., p. 16-17.

⁶⁵ Ibid., p. 18.

⁶⁶ Ibid., p. 18.

⁶⁷ Ibid., p. 18.

⁶⁸ Ibid., pp. 18-23.

⁶⁹ Spencer, Beyond the Curse: . . ., p. 30.

⁷⁰ Ibid., pp. 30-31.

⁷¹ Louise Kumandjek Tappa, "God in Man's Image," in New Eyes for Reading: Biblical and Theological Reflections by Women from the Third World, John S. Pobee and Barbel Von Wartenberg-Potter, eds. (Quezon City, Philippines: Claretian Publications, 1986), p. 103.

⁷² Gray, "Eden's Garden . . .," p. 42.

⁷³ Gray is referring to Peter Berger's The Sacred Canopy.

⁷⁴ Gray, "Eden's Garden . . .," p. 44.

⁷⁵ Spencer, Beyond the Curse : . . ., p. 32.

⁷⁶ Ibid., p. 32.

⁷⁷ Ibid., p. 41.

⁷⁸The New English Bible with the Apocrypha (USA: Oxford Univ. Press, 1970), p. 666, n--a.

⁷⁹Sellew, Why Not? . . ., p. 8.

⁸⁰Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 87.

⁸¹Ibid., pp. 86-87.

⁸²Ibid., p. 87.

⁸³Ibid., p. 87.

⁸⁴Sellew, Why Not? . . ., pp. 8-9.

⁸⁵Ibid., p. 8.

⁸⁶Lawrence E. Toombs, "The Book of Psalms," Wisdom Literature and Poetry: A Commentary on Job, Psalms, Proverbs, Ecclesiastes, the Song of Solomon, Interpreter's Concise Commentary, 8 vols., Charles M. Laymon, ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1983), vol. 3, p. 132.

⁸⁷Ibid., p. 132.

⁸⁸Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 88.

⁸⁹Ibid., pp. 88-89.

⁹⁰Ibid., p. 89.

⁹¹Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., p. 58.

⁹²Ibid., p. 58.

⁹³Ibid., p. 58.

⁹⁴Ibid., p. 58.

⁹⁵Gundry, Neither Slave Nor Free . . ., p. 1.

⁹⁶Huckle and Visokay, The Gospel According . . ., p. 57.

⁹⁷Gundry, Neither Slave Nor Free . . ., viii.

⁹⁸Ibid., p. 91.

⁹⁹Howard Clark Kee, "The Gospel According to Matthew," The Gospels: A Commentary on Matthew, Mark, Luke, John, Interpreter's Con-

cise Commentary, 8 vols., Charles M. Laymon, ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1983), vol. 6, p. 68.

¹⁰⁰ Julia A. Shelhamer, Secret of a Happy Married Life (Cincinnati, OH: God's Bible School and Missionary Training Home. n.d.), p. 40.

¹⁰¹ J.T. Logan, Introduction to Secret of a Happy Married Life, Julia A. Shelhamer (Cincinnati, OH: God's Bible School and Missionary Training Home, n.d.), p. 4.

¹⁰² Roberts, Ordaining Women, pp. 51-52.

¹⁰³ Kee, "The Gospel According to Matthew," p. 68.

¹⁰⁴ John Wesley, Explanatory Notes Upon the New Testament (First published London: Epworth Press, n.d., Reprint, Naperville, IL: Alec R. Allenson Inc., 1966), p. 92.

¹⁰⁵ Spencer, Beyond the Curse . . ., p. 22.

¹⁰⁶ Gray, "Eden's Garden . . .," p. 32.

¹⁰⁷ Francis J. Moloney, Woman First Among the Faithful (Notre Dame, IN: Ave Maria Press, 1986, Published Australia: Dove Communications, 1984), p. 49.

¹⁰⁸ Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 57.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid., p. 88.

¹¹⁰ Ibid., pp. 88-89.

¹¹¹ Ibid., p. 89.

¹¹² Ibid., p. 57.

¹¹³ Sellew, Why Not? . . ., pp. 15-17.

¹¹⁴ Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., p. 58.

¹¹⁵ Ibid., pp. 54-55.

¹¹⁶ William Baird, "The Acts of the Apostles," Acts and Paul's Letters, Interpreter's Concise Commentary, 8. vols, Charles M. Laymon, ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1983) vol. 7, p. 8.

¹¹⁷ Gundry, Neither Slave Nor Free . . ., p. 91.

¹¹⁸ Wesley, Explanatory Notes . . ., p. 398.

- ¹¹⁹ Huckle and Visokay, The Gospel According . . ., p. 58.
- ¹²⁰ Wesley, Explanatory Notes . . ., p. 424.
- ¹²¹ Ibid, p. 424.
- ¹²² Spencer, Beyond the Curse . . ., pp 98-100.
- ¹²³ Howard A. Snyder, The Community of the King (Downer's Grove, IL: Inter-Varsity Press, 1977), pp. 82-83.
- ¹²⁴ Ibid., p. 167.
- ¹²⁵ Spencer, Beyond the Curse . . ., pp. 103-104.
- ¹²⁶ Ibid., pp. 108-109.
- ¹²⁷ Spener, Das Geistliche Preistertum (1677), trans. by A.G. Voight, The Spiritual Priesthood (Philadelphia, PA: The Lutheral Publica-tion Society, 1917), p. 15, quoted in Signs of the Spirit: How God Reshapes the Church, Howard A. Snyder (Grand Rapids, MI: Academie Books, Zondervan, 1989) p. 97.
- ¹²⁸ Snyder, The Community . . ., p. 86.
- ¹²⁹ Ibid., p. 86.
- ¹³⁰ Barclay's English Dictionary, quoted in Why Not? A Plea for the Ordination of those Women whom God Calls to Preach His Gospel, Walter A. Sellew (Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1914), n.p.
- ¹³¹ Roberts, Ordaining Women, pp. 95-96.
- ¹³² Sellew, Why Not? . . ., pp. 20-29.
- ¹³³ Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., pp. 56-57.
- ¹³⁴ Carl F.H. Henry, "Further Thoughts About Women," Christianity Today, n.d., p. 90.
- ¹³⁵ Elliott, "Why I Oppose the Ordination of Women," Christianity Today (Jun 6, 1975), p. 14.
- ¹³⁶ Ibid., p. 14.
- ¹³⁷ Ibid., p. 14.
- ¹³⁸ Wesley, Explanatory Notes . . ., pp. 617-618, 632.

- ¹³⁹ Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 60.
- ¹⁴⁰ Ibid., pp. 60-61.
- ¹⁴¹ Sellew, Why Not? . . ., pp. 8-9.
- ¹⁴² Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., pp. 85-86.
- ¹⁴³ Ibid., pp. 60-66.
- ¹⁴⁴ Spencer, Beyond the Curse . . ., p. 104.
- ¹⁴⁵ Ibid., p. 104.
- ¹⁴⁶ Elaine Storkey, "A Christian and a Woman," Decision (Jan 1991), p. 11.
- ¹⁴⁷ K. Snodgrass with Howard A. Snyder, "A Biblical and Theological Basis for Women in Ministry," unpublished essay (Feb. 1987), n.p.
- ¹⁴⁸ Ibid., n.p.
- ¹⁴⁹ Ibid., n.p.
- ¹⁵⁰ J.I. Packer, "Let's Stop Making Women Presbyters," Christianity Today (Feb 11, 1991), p. 18.
- ¹⁵¹ Ibid., p. 18.
- ¹⁵² Ibid., p. 18.
- ¹⁵³ Ibid., p. 20.
- ¹⁵⁴ Ibid., pp. 20-21.
- ¹⁵⁵ Ibid., p. 20.
- ¹⁵⁶ Ibid., p. 20.
- ¹⁵⁷ Roberts, Ordaining Women, p. 54.
- ¹⁵⁸ Ibid., p. 58.
- ¹⁵⁹ Bristow, What Paul Really . . ., Preface xiii.
- ¹⁶⁰ Ibid., pp. 3, 7.
- ¹⁶¹ Moloney, Woman First Among the Faithful, pp. 48-49.
- ¹⁶² Victor Paul Furnish, "The Letter of Paul to the Galatians," Acts

and Paul's Letters: A Commentary on Acts, Romans, I and II Corinthians, Galatians, Ephesians, Philippians, Colossians, I and II Thessalonians, I and II Timothy, Titus, Philemon,
Interpreter's Concise Commentary, 8 vols., Charles M. Laymon,
ed. (Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1983) vol. 7, pp. 291-292.

¹⁶³Spencer, Beyond the Curse . . ., p. 67.

CHAPTER 2
DESCRIBING THE MODEL

African Americans, Latinos, Native Americans, and white women have been displaced by means of either virtual historical annihilation or by anonymous inclusion in our common annals. Though this regrettable oversight might be largely unintended, it is nonetheless ongoing.

No single volume, or series of volumes, can adequately explore all facets of this unfortunate spectrum. Therefore I have chosen to limit the scope of my work to Free Methodist women in ministry. My experience in this particular area reveals gaps between principle and practice in some conferences. This gap, far from presenting hopelessness, offers instead an opportunity to address the issue of gender discrimination with creativity in its varying dimensions across the denomination.

I will finally focus intently upon ordained women in Free Methodist ministry: where we were, where we are, and where we expect to be in the imminent future. Though my work lies within one denomination, the model, along with my methodologies, questions for personal reflective learning, and the extended bibliography, present an adaptable pattern for a number of varied replications.

A. Context Associates Meetings and Contributions

My Context Associates represented a cross-section of Free Meth-

odists who, habitually or sporadically, read Free Methodist literature. The group included a former school superintendent who continues to function in the school system as a problem solver (male); two executive secretaries (female); one formerly self-employed driving instructor and retirement center worker, retired (male); one former school teacher, now a real estate agent (female); one pastor's spouse who is a nurse, working in public health services referral (female); one investment broker (female); and one Ph.D (mathematics) candidate (male). During our working period, the Binghamton Free Methodist Church, which they all attend, split. One couple, a medical supplies representative and a homemaker, no longer attended the sessions following this division. I have however continued to supply them with my work, at their request. One man was unable to complete the series due to seriously impaired health.

We met nine times; one additional scheduled session was preempted when the Bishop called a number of us to an adjourned session of the Annual Conference. These individuals with whom I dreaded to work, particularly in this context, became the associates with whom I eagerly anticipated dialogueing.

We discussed format, including maps and illustrations, along with specific informational content, during our meetings. The major focus of each session was my writing style: I enjoy scholarly writing which neither piques the interest nor grips the attention of most readers today. My associates were critiquing my work with an eye toward marketability, while concurrently supporting me as person, pastor, teacher, and author. There was a noticeable hoped-for altera-

tion in my writing style as the series progressed.

B. Summary of Context Associates' Evaluations

The evaluation instrument (Appendix C) was designed to measure progress toward our common goal: a popular book for Free Methodists, designed, in some cases, to change readers' minds about the burgeoning issue of women in ordained ministry. My Context Associates have functioned as editors, coordinators, and as designers of the book which we all hope will accomplish its purpose.

C. What I Set Out to Learn

Goals (Personal)

1. To improve my interviewing skills.
2. To develop skill in sustained prose writing.
3. To become exceptionally and interestingly knowledgeable about women in Free Methodist ministry.
4. To be one of the people who are providing the nucleus of women's studies for the denomination.

Goals (Ministry)

1. To inspire Free Methodists to celebrate the women in our ongoing history, and to accept contemporary women now as well as we accept the women in our past.
2. To provide an introductory study about women in Free Methodist ministry.
3. To heighten Free Methodism's awareness of the problems

uniquely and often needlessly faced by its women in ministry, in the hope of eliciting both individual and corporate practice of gender equality.

4. To compile a useful, extensive bibliography of Free Methodist women's studies.
5. To convey the urgency of the need for gender equality in Free Methodist ministries by means of an enjoyable, historically accurate, spiritually challenging book.

Meeting the Goals

Personal

1. I interviewed Bishop Richard Snyder (Free Methodist) in depth about his views and stance on women in ordained ministry, placing particular emphasis upon his role in placing women as pastors-in-charge during his recent tenure as Superintendent of the Genesee Conference. In order to facilitate and retain the focus of this interview, I mailed a prepared list of questions to the bishop about one week prior to our appointment. We adhered to the agenda. This allowed Bishop Snyder additional time to expand upon his responses.

This style of interview is an easy one for me; extemporaneous interviewing however presents a desperate challenge. In order then to genuinely improve my skills, I conversed with people about women in ministry. As the heart palpitations lessened, and my brain returned to sequential functioning, I advanced to asking questions which intentionally elicited both emotional and cognitive responses.

Did I meet my goal? Yes, but I must keep on interviewing

extemporaneously, even though I am most comfortable with a prepared script in this particular field of study.

2. My doctoral studies in English had already honed my skills in this area. The difficulty, foolish on the face of it, was that I had not dared to unify my scattered satellites of learning by means of making my own self their act centrum. I felt that writing in the context of the church was like writing while sitting between relentlessly contracting walls, with no visible exit. My Context Associates' insightful articulation of this dilemma, during our final meeting, is already stimulating a justifiable faith in my own ability to write as a Christian for other Christians. Furthermore, I can write populist literature (the book) which is as cogent as are my scholarly papers. A vestige of trepidation remains, but this might prove itself a fortuitous appendage.

Did I meet my goal? Not entirely. I do however, now, thanks to my Context Associates, work with a bright new confidence.

3. Exceptionally knowledgeable about my topic? Yes and no. In my geographic and conference areas I probably know more than most Free Methodists know about women in Free Methodist ministry. My learning is a pauper however when I am among people, Rev. Dr. Stonehouse for example, who have been studying this subject for a number of years.

People with whom I habitually associate are listening to - and for - information about women in ministry. This activity is increasing noticeably, and I am somewhat responsible for this.

Have I met my goal? Yes, insofar as anyone can "meet" a necessarily ongoing process.

4. The wealth of Free Methodist holdings in women's studies

remains regrettably inaccessible. The denomination's sole bibliography, compiled in 1977, contains eight entries in the women's studies category. This paucity justifies my decision to invest largely of my doctoral time and expertise in the compiling of a basic bibliography of women's studies, ecumenical as well as denominational, to be placed in Free Methodist World Headquarters Historical Library, in the libraries of Free Methodist institutions of higher learning, and in as many libraries outside the Free Methodist denomination as will accept it. The format I have designed provides headings which readily accommodate additional entries.

Have I met my goal? Yes, for now. A tremendous volume of material remains to be discovered and cataloged.

Ministry

1. As a woman in ordained ministry, I have challenged this goal to the extent that a small, yet surprising, number of former parishioners, peers, friends, and even family are less troubled than they were two years ago about women who pastor and administrate. There is, in some responsorial content, the admission of an unexpected - even unwelcome - respect for me and, by extension, for my sisters in ordained ministry. The conversions come slowly, the testimonies more slowly perhaps, but the latent affirmation is alive.

Have I succeeded in meeting this goal? Sometimes I get so angry, so frustrated in this mission, that I almost itch to play Joan of Arc - to mount my white charger; set my long, sharp spear; and, with the bands blaring and flags bourgeoning in the refreshing breeze - go out to conquer prejudices and unquestioned practices of tradition, and

people who do not yet think for themselves. We must outwit the notion that God created any person less in His image than any other person. I cannot accomplish this thoroughly, but I have been succeeding beyond my personal expectations. For this I thank God every day.

2. This is in process. Frankly, as the familiar saying conveys: I bit off more than I could chew. That is to say that I work less quickly than I thought I could. The information, which I discover mostly in library volumes, is voluminous, yet discouragingly repetitive. Yes, the study will be completed. A number of local churches will, in all probability, test its efficacy as an interesting vehicle by means of which to convey the intended message.

3. Having spoken with two bishops, two conference superintendents, a number of conference colleagues, and almost every person who will listen to facts about the practice of gender equality, I do contribute to the heightening of the awareness of this problem among Free Methodists.

Have I met this goal? Commensurately. Perhaps largely, by taking into account extension, expansion, and attenuation.

4. Additional discourse here would appear redundant, following closely as this does upon Personal Goal 4, above.

5. I am convinced that the final product will be all I have hoped it would be. I keep on searching, reading, comparing, and writing.

Have I met my goal? I have met the goal I set for the doctoral presentation. Experiential wisdom prods me to project a goal now for completion of the final product.

Interestingly enough, I suggested to a small group of friends that a videotape of these women's stories might prove more popular

in our culture than even a well-written book. The idea sparked instant enthusiastic support! Perhaps the urgency is conveyed by means of the medium as efficaciously as it is by the content. ("The medium is the message," M. McLuhan.)

The Replicable Model

A book as a physical object is an obviously replicable model. My book however will be remarkably replicable, not only because of its content and thrust, but because I construct (an) intensely radical personal question(s) to follow each chapter. The questions' format is probably not unique, but their content has tended, where I have offered it, to enable individuals to pilgrimage deeper into their own spiritual depths and potential than have other forms of query which I have posed.

The pattern of the question is readily assimilated, after which virtually anyone can build sets of questions which will enhance various modes and shapes of ministry. The bibliography also presents a model which is easily replicated. It is my hope that other scholars will augment this bibliographical nucleus. In addition, I expect that this seminal project will inspire others to construct similar tools which can facilitate the extensive specialized research which I confidently posit is now in embryo among Christians.

* * * * *

As a scholar I set out to research the role and status of women in ministry throughout the history of the Free Methodist denomination. As a pastor I expected to reaffirm my distressing conviction, thoroughly supported by the results of the Webb Inventories Instrument, that I

am indeed highly gifted and apt as priest and scholar, yet I work best alone. This conclusion has preyed upon my sense of pastoral duty - my ability to work well with others - sporadically, especially when the inevitable interpersonal problems rear themselves inside the congregation. As a private person I dreamed of leaping ahead into becoming suddenly the person I've always known I could be - respected as preacher, teacher, and scholar. As a woman in ministry I wanted to articulate with convincing credibility the urgent need for the practice of gender equality among all Christians.

What I Did Learn

As a scholar I have discovered plentiful material which spills out of no stationed cornucopia, but instead is strewn almost profusely wherever Free Methodists have been. I revel in the reading and writing which this material demands of me.

My Context Associates' astute observations about my reluctance to project my own self and my opinions through my writing was the key to accepting myself as a pastor who is gifted and active - and perhaps happiest - in atypical pastoral contexts. The criticism of my writing, which I had feared would elicit either self-pity or anger, was more intense than I had anticipated - and I enjoyed our sessions! I reacted with neither of the above dreaded responses, but was able to discuss, to agree, and to disagree with courtesy and appreciation. I am a more mature person and pastor than I gave myself credit for being. Although I will probably always prefer to be alone, reading and writing, preparing to speak to a group, along with all the other things

one does most comfortably alone, I can work well with others. This is cause for relief and rejoicing. Frankly, I am probably most inclined toward functioning as a professor in a seminary or in a Christian college.

As a private person I am to some extent articulating the urgency of the gender discrimination problem simply by being all I can be everywhere I am. I am closer to becoming the woman I have always thought I could be than I have ever honestly expected to be.

I have also confirmed that I have excellent ideas, and a gift for setting them into working plans on paper. I am however always cutting myself, though not others, short of time.

What Happened to Me in the Process

I am a more mature and confident person than I was. Being forced - and it was that for me - to ask people to be a part of my doctoral process has prodded me into overcoming my apprehension on that particular activity. The process has enabled me to look honestly at myself, at the people I work with, and at the long-lived nature of hasty or ill-considered decisions. I have grown as person, as pastor, and as Christian.

My Most Significant Learnings

1. Context

The most significant learning for me has been that people in my pastoral context are, in large part, earnestly seeking theological justification for, and authorized direction toward, acceptance and

affirmation of women in positions of authority in the local church.

2. Theology

The overwhelming abundance of reliable scholarship in support of theological justification for gender equality throughout the church has thoroughly convinced me that God calls us all equally to ministry.

The "Theological Foundation In Support of Gender Equality" represents my initial entry into feminist theology. I had anticipated some offensive sorts of skewed misrepresentations of my own theological foundations. Instead, I met excellent scholarship which presented the information I had hoped to someday discover - that gender equality is implicit in the wholeness which Christ restores in us. While some portion of feminist theology is, in all likelihood, distorted, I was fortunate in that the United Theological Seminary Library and Bookstore were immediately accessible, and that they are always stocked with reliable scholarship.

3. Working with Others in Ministry

The tremendously significant learning for me in working with others in ministry is that my attitude determines my response to both criticism and praise, assuming that these are offered with genuine intent to augment. I have also learned that I earn the respect that I choose to deserve while working with others in ministry, and that this choice extends to all my relationships. I now enjoy the sort of ministry which I until recently dreaded - working in ministry with people who are very much like me!

Conclusion

I am convinced that the summary of learnings for each of us can be fully assessed only after time has allowed the spectrum of kaleidoscopic fragments of contemplation and experiential application to settle into the final patterns of our lives.

CHAPTER 3
HISTORICAL FOUNDATIONS FOR THE MODEL
STUMBLING BLOCKS AND STEPPING STONES: THE FREE METHODIST
DECISIONS 1861-1911

1861. Civil war in America while, in Free Methodism, the brothers in the Genesee Conference voted their opposition to the denomination's allowing women to preach.¹ Not content to limit their wishes to one conference, they sponsored legislation which was aimed toward making this prohibition denominational policy. Their concern was not however addressed at the following session of the General Conference. The resolutions may be found in the Minutes of the Genesee Convention of 1861:

Resolutions

Resolved, 1. That the following questions and answers embody the views of this Convention on the subject involved. Carried 36 to 4.

2. That the same be referred to the next General Convention, with the request that they be incorporated in the Free Methodist Discipline. Carried 28 to 14.

Question. 1. Do we, as a Church, approve of female labors?

Answer. Most heartily. It is the duty of all Christian women to exercise in social and public meetings, by way of prayer, personal testimony, or exhortation, according as their abilities may warrant, or the occasion may offer.

Question. 2. Do we approve of female preaching?

Answer. We do not. And for the following reasons:

1. We do not find it authorized in the Old Testament Scriptures.

2. We do not find it authorized in the New Testament.

3. On the contrary, it is clearly intimated in the Word of God that woman is not designed for the office of the holy ministry.

4. It clashes with the ordinary duties and relations of

the female sex.

5. It tends to awaken prejudice, and produce confusion in carrying on the work of God.

6. It is contrary to the usage of the church in all ages; the Methodist Church forming no exception. That the practice is anti-Wesleyan, may be seen from the following language of John Wesley in his advice to Mrs. Crosby: "The Methodists do not allow of women preachers. * * * In public you may properly enough intermix short exhortations with prayer; but keep as far from what is called preaching as you can: therefore never take a text; never speak in a continued discourse, without some break, above five or six minutes. Tell the people, 'We shall have another prayer meeting at such a time and place.' If Hannah Harrison had followed these few directions, she might have been as useful now as ever.²

This resolution appears to have resulted from a dispute which a few preachers in the Genesee Conference were waging because of a number of women Nazirite preachers. In justice to Wesley, whom these preachers used in support of their resolution, we must state that he did indeed license women to preach, though this occurred a number of years following his refusal to do that. Genesee's thinly disguised attempt at the "separate but equal" fallacy was reversed in 1873 when its members voted to license women as local preachers, the first conference to take this conciliatory step.

In 1866, the Atlantic Cable was completed. In Free Methodism, the General Conference, voting on a motion to eliminate deacon's orders, thus retaining only elder's orders, was deadlocked in a tie vote. The president's vote against the motion was a crucial decision in favor of women's ordination which was to come a number of years later. B.T. Roberts, the president, with his vote, held the door open for women to be ordained deacons, though with the particular stipulation that this ordination was not to lead to ordination as elders. The ordination as deacon however was not to come either soon or uncontested.

Marston does not mention the context in which a class of evangelists - lay workers - was provided. Hogue however amplifies this elegantly, particularly in relation to the work of women:

General Superintendent B.T. Roberts, as a Committee on Woman's Work, presented his report, which, as finally adopted by the Conference, provided for a class of ministers having denominational recognition, to be known as Evangelists. Evangelists were declared to be 'a class of preachers called of God to preach the Gospel, to labor to promote revivals of religion and spread abroad the cause of Christ in the land; but not called to a pastoral charge or to government in the church.'

The report was finally made a separate chapter in the Discipline; and it was this provision which opened the way for women to occupy the prominent position in the ministry of the Free Methodist Church which they have so long and efficiently held in many of the Conferences, not merely as Evangelists, in the general acceptation of that term, but as Evangelist-pastors.³

Marston describes these evangelists as "a class of lay workers called 'evangelists.' . . . No provision for their ordination was made, as in the case of local preachers who from the beginning had a defined status and a route by following which they could qualify for ordination."⁴ Women were not officially eligible to be local preachers although many of them not only held the title unofficially, but performed the work admirably.

During his sojourn as editor of The Free Methodist, B.T. Roberts penned the following (1886-1890):

While the churches generally admit that under the gospel dispensation 'there is neither Jew nor Greek, there is neither bond nor free,' yet they still insist upon it, in the bestowment of positions in the church, that there is 'male and female.' It takes a long while for some who embrace the gospel to understand the gospel.⁵

The General Conference of 1886 further amended the Discipline, making provision for women Evangelists to be admitted to the Quarterly

Conferences, "and for making them amenable thereto."⁶ William Gould, New York Conference ministerial delegate to the Conference, vigorously protested this policy "on the ground that it was admitting women to a ruling function in the church."⁷

While the debate heated, in preparation for the landmark 1890 General Conference, arguments were presented in The Earnest Christian as well as in a number of other forums. The following excerpt from one article of this ilk may be from this era, or from a later day. The tenor however fits well into the 1886-1890 time frame:

There are others, sisters in Christ, who have received the call to labor 'much in the Lord.' Once we could not receive this saying; but now we believe, after what our eyes have seen, and our ears have heard, and the Holy One hath enlightened our understanding. Many have been the obstacles in the way of such, which God is removing in His own best time. . . .

It is not ours to say how one or another shall labor; but the voice of the Spirit is unerring, and will lead us into all truth.⁸

Richardson's catalog of pertinent articles from The Free Methodist, April 16, 1868 - October 22, 1890 comprises "Appendix to I,E: Free Methodist Review, Bibliographies," below.

The eighth quadrennial session of the General Conference convened on October 8, 1890 in Chicago, Illinois. The session was adjourned on the twenty-third of that same month. Two remarkable landmarks set by this Conference are easily passed with little or no notice - eclipsed perhaps by the glaring decision of the Conference on Roberts' resolution to ordain women. The first has affected Free Methodist marriage ceremonies and, by extension, marriages:

The committee on revision of the Discipline reported in favor of striking out of the ritual on marriage the words

'obey and serve him,' and to make the answers of the woman correspond with those of the man. This elicited some discussion.

On motion the question was divided, so that the action might be taken as follows: 1. On striking out the words 'serve him.' 2. Striking out the 'obey him.' The conference ordered to strike out the first, by a vote of 29 ayes to 25 nays.

B.T. Roberts then offered a substitute for the whole which would insert the words 'comfort him' instead of both the first and the second. After considerable discussion the substitute was voted down. On motion then the conference amended the report of the committee so that the question to the woman shall be in substance the same as the question to the men [sic] by a vote of ayes 51 to nays 12.⁹

The second of these landmarks is referred to in the "Personal Mention" column of The Free Methodist:

Two of the lay delegates having seats in the General conference [sic] are ladies. Sister Wetherald is a licensed evangelist, and has preached several times (in different churches) during the conference. Sister Grant comes from the North Indiana conference, and does credit to the constituency she represents. Both are doing some committee work. Most of our readers will be glad to know that the question of admitting ladies as lay delegates did not in the least disturb the equanimity of the conference.¹⁰

During this year of 1890, when "Sitting Bull was killed in South Dakota," and "the Sherman Anti-Trust Act was passed,"¹¹ the Free Methodist General Conference hotly argued the issue of ordaining women. The debate and subsequent vote are offered below without comment. The record excerpts convey cogently the majority mind of the conference:

[Fourth Sitting] D.W. Abrams. - I'm in favor of the ordination of women. I did not know there was so much opposition as there appears to be. . . . We are the representatives of twenty thousand people. We can't drive prejudice out. We must not try to bring people to this without education. Let it go back to the conferences and be agitated. When the next general conference meets they will have a majority of the people. . . . Woman suffrage is coming . . .

George Seacord. - I'm surprised at the discrimination. It seems to me that there is a fear with the minority and they want to hold the majority. It has been said it ought to go back to the conferences. Why then require a two-thirds vote of the general conference and three-fourths of the annual conferences if the only object is to get the minds of the people? It looks to me like hedging the way of this ever coming up.

THE PREAMBLE AND THE RESOLUTION

Whereas, the question of the ordination of women is likely to come up during this conference, and,

Whereas, on other questions involving like radical changes in the polity of the church, we require more than a majority vote in the annual conferences as well as in the general conference, before they become a law of the church,

Therefore, Resolved, that it is the sense of this conference that in the interest of unity and harmony among us as a people, a like vote be required on said question before it shall become incorporated in our Discipline.

Coleman. - There is no question but this body has power to decide this question.

T.B. Arnold. - I understand that we now have come to a law question. Is it a proper thing for this general conference to take up this resolution and pass it? It seems to me that we have authority to take up any question and make any law that we may deem best for the church.

Seacord. - Does not this amount to a revisal of the Discipline, and as such should it not go to the committee on revisals?

Reilly. - I believe that the intent of the Discipline is to hold in check any tendency to lower the standard, and hedge up the way and shut the gates through which other churches go into worldliness. Anything that hampers the work of the Lord, or lowers our standard, is to be held in check.

As this question does not tend in any of these directions - as I have no doubt the majority of the Free Methodist church believe in the ordination of women and it can have no tendency to lower the standard - this general conference has no excuse for referring it back.

Colt. - The Discipline plainly says, the general conference has full power. We have full power to decide this question by a majority vote. Let us like men meet it. The one third can defeat the two thirds.

B.T. Roberts. - Let me ask you to defer this till the matter comes up on Wednesday. Your action reminds me of Cicero. A man was condemned to be hung and he was asked to hear his defence; he said, 'I will hang the man first and hear him afterwards.'

Hart. - I think in all fairness this should be deferred until action is had on the question of ordination of women. Let us know what the prevailing sentiment of the church is, and then any of us who are not in harmony may have the privilege of stepping down and out.

Roberts. - I give notice now that no matter how it is settled I will not step down and out.

Hart. - I might.

The vote was taken and the appeal was sustained by a vote of 28 to 48.¹²

THE SEVENTH SITTING

Wednesday, October 15, was called to order by Superintendent Roberts.

B.T. Roberts. - . . . It is a very hard thing to speak to men's prejudices. They are stronger than the sense of justice. They are stronger than the love of truth, even in many good men. . . . Prejudices on this subject are the growth of centuries. Truth may be in conflict with our training and prejudice on this subject. We have been brought up to regard woman as inferior to man, and are not willing the same rights be given to her.

. . . . My prejudices are one way and those of many of you are another; and I think I can make it clear from the Bible, if you will listen candidly to me, that the resolution before us ought to receive a unanimous vote.

. . . . I will say, Mr. President, that the burden of proof lies with those who dispute the resolution. The presumption is that they were in favor of equality of rights; and when a person comes and claims that there is no justice or equality of rights he should show why it is not so.

. . . . but all through the New Testament teaches that women have a perfect equality with men. Now the inference from the resolution is correct, therefore no person who is called of God and who is duly qualified, should be refused ordination on account of sex, race or condition.

. . . . every woman should not be ordained any more than every man should be ordained; but it does follow that every one duly qualified should not be refused ordination

on account of sex, race or condition. In the Bible we have no form of ordination . . . It is simply setting apart permanently for an office. But in setting apart for an office, I insist that the women shall be set apart just the same as the men.

The Protestant Episcopal and the Methodist Episcopal Churches have deaconesses. But what are they? They bear about the same relation to a scriptural deacon as does a woman who takes a side degree in Masonry to a full-fledged Mason. They try, too, to settle the demand that they be allowed the same position as men by giving women the name of deaconesses without permitting them to discharge the duties which according to the Scriptures belong to that office.

I am heartily opposed to all such shams. If we recognize her at all, we should give her the place that properly belongs to her.

They say it is contrary to a woman's nature. What is there contrary to their nature? They preach and pray - I wish men would pray.

'There's not a spot in earth or Heaven,
There's not a task to mankind given,
Without a woman in it.'

[O.M. Owen. -] The passage, 'Let the women keep silence in the churches,' has reference in my opinion to their speaking on matters pertaining to church government.

It will be time enough to agitate this question, and pass this resolution, when the sisters of our church, generally, shall ask to be ordained. I do not understand that the female evangelists, as a rule, ask for ordination. Many of them feel a repugnance to it. I am in favor of according to woman all the rights and privileges which pertain to her sex. I would favor her laboring in public and private for the salvation of the people, but when you come to ordain her into the regular ministry, and put her on the same basis as man in assuming pastoral and other ecclesiastical relations, you are placing her out of her sphere. We would give her the full benefit of the Gospel of Jesus Christ, and all the privilege in the church accorded to her by the Great Head of the church. We would give her the same educational advantages, and the same property rights as man. We would acknowledge her to be the equal of man in intellect, equal in ability, but not equal in authority. This is woman's proper sphere - a help meet to man. Thank God for so many help meets. It is the exception that woman preaches, woman becomes queen. It was never intended as a rule.

Ordain women and we shall have female pastors, chairmen and superintendents. it is contrary to

divine law, physical law, the law of common sense, to place woman in a sphere designed for man. Give to woman her place, and let her in her sphere occupy a position equal with man. But do not place her as ruler in the church of God.

[W.T. Hogg. -] I know of no advantages in the way of increased efficiency in the work of saving men to be secured by the ordination of women sufficient to warrant such a radical change in the interpretation of Discipline and Scripture and in the usages of the church, as the resolution before us contemplates.

[E.P. Hart. -] Three years ago at the session of the Central Illinois conference a sister was presented for ordination, and my ruling was that there is no provision in our Discipline for ordaining women. Brother Roberts stated yesterday that we need no change in the Discipline in order to ordain women, only the exercise of a little common sense in the interpretation. I think the question should come up on my decision and be squarely met. I am not a debator. I have not been trained in the arena of debate. My stronghold is to get a congregation before me where they can't talk back, and then give it to them.

. . . . It is not a question of woman's rights: this is not a woman's rights convention.

NOTES [October 20, 1890]

- The woman question came up again Saturday, in a proposition to give women who labor as supplies on circuits for two years, a seat in the annual conferences. Some saw in this a starting of woman towards ordination again, under the laws respecting the advancement of ministers in the conference towards ordination. This was tacitly admitted by the advocates of woman's ordination. There seems to be a necessity of something of this kind being done, especially for those sections where the laborers are largely women, - as in Canada. But the proposition to ordain women has been voted down by a large majority [The proposition to ordain women lost by 2 votes. Perhaps the writer had some other vote in mind.], and the conference will not consent to set aside that vote even in an indirect manner. If the question could be brought forward unmixed with the ordination question it might be done.

- Our reporter, on account of her inexperience in such matters, was unable to give any adequate report of Brother Michael's speech on the ordination of women. In the opinion of many, Brother Michael successfully answered that part of Brother Roberts' argument which was based upon the New Testament use of the Greek word rendered

'deacon.' He gave all the passages in which this word and two corresponding words occur in the Greek New Testament, and commented upon some of them. Brother Michael informs us that he does not have time to write out his speech because of general conference duties, but he would be glad to put his address with some additions into a tract, provided he could get a sufficient number of subscribers to pay for the same at five cents a copy. Orders may be sent to J.T. Michael, 2942 Westmont St., Philadelphia, Pa.¹³

[October 22, 1890.] It is coming, brethren. Fall into line and help to consummate that which the Lord wills.¹⁴

Late in the afternoon the vote on the resolution was taken. The Roberts' [sic] resolution was lost by a vote of 38 yeas to 40 nays.¹⁵

Following brutally hard upon the defeat of Roberts' resolution, the members of the General Convention of 1890, by means of a counter-resolution, put themselves on record as a General Conference opposed to the ordination of women. Marston adds, "In sardonic humor someone moved to amend the proposal by adding 'when called and duly qualified.' The proposed amendment drove home its barbed point, but failed . . . to win enough support to prevail."¹⁶ The original counter-motion passed with 35 yeas and 29 nays.

The 1890 General Conference, in addition to denying women ordination, legislated rules for the members of the Pentecost Bands. These Bands, founded by Rev. Vivian Dake, employed many young women and men as preachers and leaders in small, vividly evangelistic groups.

B.T. Roberts might have been aware, though he never articulated it, that the Free Methodist denomination's refusal to ordain women alongside its later stricture placed on the Pentecost Bands suggested that its leaders had not yet acknowledged the healthy dichotomy in a balanced tension between structure and control. His colleagues, not

having made this distinction, might have been functioning out of the misconception that structure ensured control, and that control was implicit only in structure: the more limiting the structure the tighter the control. This has not been an uncommon fallacy, particularly within the institutional church. Spiritual health and growth however, for everyone, depends upon a skeletal structure which encourages self-control without undue limitation.

Weary and ill, Roberts returned home following the 1890 General Conference determined to provide theological justification for his stance on ordaining women. Ordaining Women, written out of his disappointment, is a scholarly biblical justification for gender equality in both ordination and church administration (authority). This seminal work for Free Methodist women's studies is considered by many to be Roberts' masterpiece. The volume was published in 1891 by his own Earnest Christian Publishing House and was his final extended written work.

The 1894 General Conference, meeting in Greenville, Illinois, October 10-25, again addressed the question of ordaining women - this time with interest which had been heightened and intensified by the votes from the annual conferences. The result of each conference's vote is no longer available, but their representatives voted 35 yeas and 65 nays, following a debate in which fourteen members were involved. This discussion was "perhaps as animated as any discussion that ever was conducted in the General Conference during the entire [until 1915] history of the Church."¹⁷ "In ten conferences the majority voted for ordination; in eight conferences the majority opposed ordination; in one conference the vote was tied."¹⁸ While these figures appear to

indicate a close difference among the conferences, Richardson asserts that his research "reveals that opposition to the ordination of women was then, and at that level [annual conferences], even stronger than it had been at the General Conference of 1890."¹⁹

A non-binding vote was taken at the 1894 Conference on the question, "Do you believe in the ordination of women?" Even though the Presiding Officer, Wilson T. Hogue, emphasized that "a vote on a motion so phrased could enact no legislation,"²⁰ the vote was overwhelmingly opposed to ordaining women. Roberts' death (1893) had engendered no personal sentiment for his cause; his book had apparently missed its mark as well.

There was hope however. During this time of disputation and confusion, the Pittsburgh Conference, along with a number of other conferences, had "admitted several ladies into the 'on trial' relationship."²¹ Emma Ellison, Minnie Shelhamer, and Nettie Hibbard are listed in this relationship in the 1894 Yearbook of the Pittsburgh Conference.

Despite the vehement opposition to women's ordination, the General Conference of 1894 enacted an amendment to the Discipline's chapter on Evangelists:

When women evangelists have been licensed by the Annual Conference, and have served two successive years under appointment as pastors, they may, upon recommendation of the Quarterly Conference of which they are members, and at the option of the Annual Conference, have a voice and vote in the Annual Conference; and in the transaction of Conference business they shall be counted with the preachers. This relation shall continue only while they receive appointments as pastors.²²

This then became the vehicle which conveyed a lesser onus than ordination, yet gave a woman evangelist who met the criteria a vote in

annual conference business.

The General Conference, meeting in the historically quiet year of 1907, established an order of deaconesses.²³ Deaconesses were "a class of women, divinely called to advance the cause of Christ, in ministering the sick and destitute, saving the fallen and relieving the suffering, but not to become pastors or evangelists."²⁴ The Discipline did not allow a person to hold both deaconess' and evangelist's licenses simultaneously. The deaconess was a member of the quarterly conference in the district where she held her church membership, and was amenable to that conference.²⁵

1911 proved a banner year for some sorts of emancipation: "Standard Oil and American Tobacco were ordered dissolved under the Sherman Anti-Trust Act,"²⁶ and Free Methodist women were granted the right to be ordained deacons. While the resolution designed to effect this was rejected in committee, the fact that the rejection was by less than a two-thirds vote allowed the resolution to come before the body of the Conference, where it passed. Bishop Sellew worded the resolution as follows:

Resolved, That whenever any Annual Conference shall be satisfied that any woman is called of God to preach the Gospel, that Annual Conference may be permitted to receive her on trial and into full connection, and ordain her a Deacon, all the above on the same conditions as we receive men into the same relations, provided always that this ordination of women shall not be considered as a step toward ordination as Elder.²⁷

The resolution did not pass easily; "all reasonable efforts were made to defeat it."²⁸

Bishop Sellew, fearing that a movement was afoot to rescind the

ordination of women; expecting this battle to be joined during the 1915 General Conference, he rewrote his explicitly pointed 1894 pamphlet Why Not? A Plea for the Ordination of those Women whom God Calls to Preach His Gospel. The pamphlet is a fiery, condensed lesson in theological justification for gender equality. Sellew's fear was not realized. It could however be said that a shadow of it was enacted. Paragraph 100 of the Discipline, which allowed women to be ordained deacons, was amended to read, in addition to its 1911 wording:

and provided further, that no woman whose husband is a member on trial or in full membership shall be eligible to be received into the Conference,²⁹

Our sources contain an additional conditional clause; its year of Disciplinary inclusion is unclear at present:

A woman whose home duties interfere with her appointment to a circuit is not eligible to be received on trial in the annual conference. A woman who is ordained and a member of the annual conference, upon her marrying a preacher who is also a member of the conference thereby becomes a local deacon.³⁰

The Canadian conferences, unlike those in America, have appointed women as pastors since the earliest days. John Sigsworth has compiled an appendix which lists these pioneer women along with their appointments.

END NOTES

¹Jack Richardson, "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth Century Free Methodism" (Master of Arts dissertation, Colgate Rochester Divinity School, April, 1984), p. 1.

²Minutes of the Genesee Annual Convention of the Free Methodist Church, October 24, 1861, p. 1, quoted in Jack Richardson, "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth Century Free Methodism" (Master of Arts dissertation, Colgate Rochester Divinity School, April, 1984), p. 53.

³Wilson Thomas Hogue, History of the Free Methodist Church of North America, 2 vols. (Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1915), vol. 1, p. 178.

⁴Leslie R. Marston, From Age to Age a Living Witness: A Historical Interpretation of Free Methodism's First Century (Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1960), p. 433.

⁵Benjamin Titus Roberts, Pungent Truths: Being Extracts from the Writings of the Rev. Benjamin Titus Roberts, A.M., While Editor of "The Free Methodist" from 1886 to 1890, Compiled and edited by William B. Rose (Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1912), p. 355.

⁶Hogue, *Ibid.*, p. 186.

⁷*Ibid.*, p. 186.

⁸Hattie A. Warner, The Earnest Christian, (n.d.), pp. 137-138.

⁹The Free Methodist 44 (29 October 1890): 691.

¹⁰*Ibid.*, n.d. (October 22, 1890):16.

¹¹Marjory B. Hinman, Shirley Hess, and Helen A. Sax, compilers, "Chronological History of Broome County - Its Place in the Country and in the World" (The Broome County Historical Society, Binghamton, NY, 1976), p. 32.

The historical data used throughout this document to place Free Methodist events and decisions within their historical contexts are used with the kind permission of Marjory B. Hinman, Broome County Historical Society.

¹² General Conference Daily 2 (14 October 1890): 75.

¹³ Ibid. (20 October 1890): 155.

¹⁴ The Free Methodist (22 October 1890): n.p.

¹⁵ Ibid 44 (29 October 1890): 691.

¹⁶ Marston, From Age to Age . . ., p. 418.

¹⁷ Hogue, History of the Free Methodist Church . . ., p. 196.

¹⁸ Richardson, "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women . . .," p. 119.

¹⁹ Ibid., p. 120.

²⁰ Marston, From Age to Age . . ., p. 418.

²¹ C.H. Canon, E.W. Cowser, and R.L. Page, History of the Pittsburgh Conference of the Free Methodist Church: Centennial Edition 1883-1983 (Pittsburgh, PA: Published by order of the Pittsburgh Conference, 1983), p. 279.

²² Hogue, History of the Free Methodist Church . . ., p. 218.

²³ A Digest of Free Methodist Law or Guide in the Administration of the Discipline of the Free Methodist Church (Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1924), p. 59.

²⁴ Ibid., pp. 59-60.

²⁵ Ibid., p. 60.

²⁶ Hinman, Hess, and Sax, "Chronological History . . .," p. 33.

²⁷ Hogue, History of the Free Methodist Church . . ., p. 218.

²⁸ Ibid., p. 218.

²⁹ Ibid., p. 233.

³⁰ A Digest of Free Methodist Law or Guide . . . (1935), n.p.

CHAPTER 4

THE MODEL

THOSE ASTOUNDING FREE METHODIST WOMEN!: A BIOGRAPHICAL HISTORY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN IN MINISTRY

This chapter contains a preliminary draft of a book manuscript on Free Methodist women in ministry. Writing this manuscript, and the research on which it is based, was the central aspect of my model for the Doctor of Ministry program.

PREFACE

This book comes from the mind and heart of a woman whom God has called to ordained ministry. It strides out of my struggles with the powerful tension and the painful dichotomy between what God has called me to do and the traditions with which I grew up.

Two discoveries have enhanced my courage tremendously: (1) don't dwell on experiences; build on them instead and, (2) one individual's protest in any cause can appear insignificant, yet, like a comma in a sentence, it defines a boundary and thus alters its context. Yes, I do make a difference. What sort of difference depends upon my choices among methodologies.

I have chosen to narrate the biographical history of a number of Free Methodist women in ministry. Until now their journeys have been recounted only in sporadic fragments which remain separated from each other, and from their historical context as well.

Throughout Free Methodist church history the trend has been women and men ministering together. Women have consistently provided distinguished leadership among the denomination's most courageous visionary pioneers. Free Methodist women have been ministering - preaching, teaching, administering, and pastoring - with tremendous vitality since the denomination was founded in 1860. Research among Free Methodism's rosters of ministers reveals an extraordinarily large number

of women's names.

My research has taken me into the lives of a number of these notable women who have ministered, often while overcoming difficult situations and adverse conditions. Their history deserves compiling.

A single volume cannot convey, or even catalog, the name and history of each individual woman who has served with excellent faithfulness in Free Methodist ministry. What follows here is the compelling saga of a few of these heroic women who have struggled to approximate the vision of wholeness for us all in Jesus Christ.

PROPOSED OUTLINE FOR THOSE ASTOUNDING FREE METHODIST WOMEN!

SECTION I

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTORY BIOGRAPHY
THE FREE METHODIST DECISIONS 1861-1911

CHAPTER 2

BIOGRAPHIES

CHAPTER 3

PENTECOST BANDS

CHAPTER 4

SUMMARIES
SELECTIONS FROM DOCUMENTS

SECTION II

CHAPTER 5

INTRODUCTORY BIOGRAPHY
THE FREE METHODIST DECISIONS 1911-1974

CHAPTER 6

biographies

CHAPTER 7

SUMMARIES
SELECTIONS FROM DOCUMENTS

SECTION III

CHAPTER 8

INTRODUCTORY BIOGRAPHY
THE FREE METHODIST DECISION 1974

CHAPTER 9

BIOGRAPHIES

CHAPTER 10

SELECTIONS FROM DOCUMENTS AND SURVEYS

CHAPTER 11

SUMMARIES, CONCLUSIONS, AND PROJECTIONS

(CHAPTER 1)

ELLEN LOIS STOWE ROBERTS

It will not be what we have endured
but what we have failed to endure
that will cause regret when we come
to the end of life.

Ellen L.S. Roberts

In 1857 James Buchanan became President, Central Park was being
¹
"laid out in Manhattan," and Ellen Lois Stowe Roberts confided the
above words to her diary. Her spouse, Benjamin Titus Roberts, along
with another ordained minister, William C. Kendall, was standing trial
during this (1857) session of the Genesee Conference of the Methodist
Episcopal Church, being held in LeRoy, New York. Underlying the overt
charge of "unchristian and immoral conduct"² against Roberts was a
covert accusation of libel resulting from Roberts' article, "New
School Methodism," which had been printed in a church paper circulated
among Methodists. Roberts, censured by the bishop, and warned against
repeating his offense, was then appointed to the village of Pekin, New
York, where revival soon broke out.

When the 1858 annual conference convened at Perry, New York,
Roberts was tried again, this time for helping to reprint and circu-
late "New School Methodism." Roberts, drawing upon his education in
law, acting as his own attorney, offered what appears to have been
sufficient proof - by means of witnesses, including the man who in
fact reprinted and distributed the article - of his innocence.

Roberts was found guilty and expelled from the conference and, by extension, from ordained ministry. Interestingly enough, this year when Roberts' debate seemed unacceptable to his colleagues was also the year of the Lincoln versus Douglas debates.³

In 1860 the southern states began to secede from the Union, Lincoln was elected President, and the Pony Express was established.⁴ Benjamin Titus Roberts, along with several other ministers, having been expelled from the Genesee Conference, continued to both live and preach, wherever possible, radical holiness of heart, mind, and life. The lack of this particular sort of pervasive holiness, as Roberts saw it, had been the subject of "New School Methodism." A number of laypersons, believing Roberts and his group to be advocating God's reformational intent for the Methodist denomination, seceded from the Methodist Episcopal Church as a matter of conscience.

The two groups, pastors and laypersons, together under Roberts' leadership, founded the Free Methodist Church at Pekin, New York, on August 23, 1860. Free Methodism, like John Wesley's Methodism, began as a reform movement within a denominational context; circumstances shaped it into a protest group; subsequent to the organizing conference at Pekin, it espoused the then popular holiness movement.

The holiness movement had exploded into the American consciousness during the early nineteenth century. It not only encouraged women to participate vocally in pursuit of the movement's goals, it provided them a forum for preaching, teaching, and leadership experience as well.⁵ Charles Finney's "commitment to perfectionism," for example, "only intensified his commitment to women's full employment

in the work of God. He followed Wesley in viewing conversion as a summons to action on the part of every believer . . ."⁶

Evangelist Phoebe Palmer and her sister Sarah Lankford, along with Frances Willard, Hannah Whitall Smith, and Catharine Booth exemplified the ideals of many women of that time.

Into this milieu stepped Ellen Roberts, who had married B.T. Roberts in 1849. Her personal experience with Phoebe Palmer had been ambiguous and unsatisfying in that it did not convince Ellen of her total commitment to Christ. That is to say she did not experience a readily identifiable sanctification at that time (1844, age 19). In 1850, Phoebe Palmer was "present on the occasion"⁷ when B.T. Roberts testified to receiving the experience of holiness. Primary sources for Phoebe Palmer's involvement, or lack of it, in initiating this experience have not yet been discovered.

Roberts believed in gender equality, and practiced it as he understood it, in the home - an unusual arrangement in that day. As the fledgling denomination began to build its traditions and codify its discipline, Roberts took up in earnest the cause of ordaining women; that is in essence gender equality in the denomination. The story of Ellen Roberts at this point virtually converges with that of Free Methodism's early years. The church's struggles became her conflicts; Roberts' verbal battles with his colleagues and laypeople as he campaigned aggressively for ecclesial equality for women wearied her as she participated in his persistent, troubling disappointments. The intimate story of Free Methodism's birthing, along with the stumbling discoveries of her youngest years, is implicit in Ellen Roberts'

story. The newly-founded A.M. Chesbrough Seminary, for example, survived lean financial times, fire, teacher shortages, and the death of B.T. Roberts (1893) largely because Ellen Roberts dedicated herself to educating Free Methodist ministers, women as well as men. She disciplined herself to address church and seminary problems alongside personal setbacks with creative solutions instead of with purposeless complaints.

As a young women, Ellen relied upon the strength which God supplied. With sickness in her home, and persecution dogging her husband, she wrote, "I am the Lord's, soul, body and spirit, in the midst of multiplied cares."⁸ Her writing, whether in her diaries or in other contexts, unveils the courage of one of Free Methodism's indomitable women. Her diaries could be healthful fare for our library tables today. During the time of her husband's trial, she wrote:

When they first took up Mr. Roberts' case it seemed as if I could not stand it. They would not grant him a committee to be tried by, nor counsel from abroad, nor a transfer to another conference to be tried by impartial men. I asked God to give me nerves like steel that I might sit there unmoved and hear it all.⁹

Shay writes that Ellen Roberts was "clear in her testimonies and exhortations and later, at times, took a text and held a service, taking the place of a regular preacher."¹⁰ Ellen Roberts invested her final years, following the death of B.T. Roberts, in the young A.M. Chesbrough Seminary. Her diary reveals her resolute battle along with her deliberate trust in God as she fought against tides of loneliness during the ensuing fifteen years until her own death on January 28, 1908.



REV. AND MRS. B. T. ROBERTS

From A.P. Carpenter, Ellen Lois Roberts:
Life and Writings

THE FREE METHODIST DECISIONS 1861-1911

The projected section, "The Free Methodist Decisions 1861-1911," of the manuscript presently comprises chapter 3 of the final document where it is entitled "Historical Foundations for the Model," "Stumbling Blocks and Stepping Stones: The Free Methodist Decisions 1861-1911."

(CHAPTER 2)

BIOGRAPHIES

But the people who go forth on ideas are the ones who have the true heroism. For it is the consciousness of hidden power which gives courage.

Dineson

The biographies below are necessarily either brief or cameo.

This strait however does not imply that any woman mentioned has been less responsive to God's call, or less valuable in his work than any other.

The Free Methodist General Missionary Board was incorporated June 19, 1885; missionaries were sent out that same year. More than half the number of these pioneer missionaries were women.

Mariet Hardy Freeland was one of the many women, virtual ambassadors without portfolios, who ministered within the continental United States.

Mariet Hardy Freeland

Greenville, Illinois on Sunday morning, June 14, 1903. Shay, Freeland's daughter and biographer, describes that eventful morning: since the Free Methodist love feast that morning, "several have mentioned Mother Freeland's testimony . . ." ¹¹ She [Freeland] began with:

I was there before it [the Free Methodist Church] was launched . . . Yes, we have prospered and accomplished great things, but not as much as we would if we had stayed on the lines we were started out on by Brother Roberts: for it was his intention that brothers and sisters . . . stand shoulder to shoulder in . . . this great work, both being given authority to publish the glad tidings.¹²

Shay continues:

Now Mother [Ellen] Roberts was on the floor, putting her endorsement to this, . . . declaring, 'That's so, Mother Freeland, that's so.' And the Lord set his seal on her testimony by a visitation of the slaying power. While Mother Freeland lay prostrate, there followed such an outpouring of the Holy Spirit on that large [General Conference] congregation as is seldom seen. There must have been no less than three hundred on their feet simultaneously shouting and praising God.¹³

Ellen Roberts recalls that meeting in her diary entry dated Sunday,

June 14:

Meeting in Tabernacle
Bro Coleman said 'there
would never be another
meeting like it in the
world - much blessing on
the people [.]

Though already past eighty years of age when the 1911 General Conference voted to ordain women Deacons, Mariet was encouraged by this positive step; "official recognition of those women who had labored so faithfully was at last about to be realized."¹⁴

While yet a young woman Mariet Hardy determined to learn all she could at Genesee Wesleyan College and Seminary in order to equip herself to serve God with her best. She had long dreamed of reading the Bible in its original languages. To her dismay, she discovered that Latin and Greek were considered improper language studies for a young lady. She was obliged to study French and German instead.¹⁵ Shay

continues:

This distinction, based on sex rather than intellectual ability, roused all her sense of justice, and led her to make numerous defenses of woman in connection with debates, essays, etc., during her seminary course.¹⁶

God called her to preach at a time when few women were regularly occupying pulpits. Never doubting that call, yet disallowing bold or unseemly behaviour in order to push herself ahead in her work, she continued to preach whenever God opened the door. Later, she would make and keep three rules for living:

First, she would enter every open door. Second, she would open no doors. Third, she would accept her husband's decisions with reference to her public work as the will of God for her, and leave the responsibility there.¹⁷

Mariet married Jonathan Barney Freeland on Wednesday, November 2, 1859. Following her marriage, doors were opened for her to preach with increasing frequency. In 1860 she joined the Free Methodist Church, during the first session of the Genesee Conference at Rushford, New York.¹⁸

The remainder of her active life was invested in preaching whenever she was invited, as well as supply or assistant pastoring at times. Mariet Hardy Freeland was licensed as an Evangelist in 1877. She received her Conference Evangelist's license in 1879:

About this time B.T. Roberts published a pamphlet entitled "The Right of Women to Preach the Gospel." This was a great encouragement to Mrs. Freeland as well as to other women who felt the call of God upon them. It helped to remove the prejudice against such laborers. So great had been the feeling against the public work of women in some places where she had been called upon to occupy the pulpit, that a large part of the congregation would leave when she arose to speak, rather than listen to a woman. This became so embarrassing that she made it a rule never to take the place of a preacher, unless it had been previously announ-

ced that she would do so, thus allowing those to remain away who were prejudiced against such efforts.¹⁹

Mariet Freeland was one of the founders of Wessington Springs Seminary in South Dakota. She died on August 29, 1912. As a young woman she gave her life to God; she never tried to take it back.

Mary E. Carpenter, Liberia, West Africa

In the early 1880's, The Free Methodist printed an appeal from King Tappa in West Africa.²⁰ Free Methodist people were deeply stirred by his plea for missionaries. Never suspecting that his promises meant "far less" than they perhaps implied, the church sent a number of its first missionaries to Liberia, West Africa. Among them was Mary Carpenter from New York state. Miss Carpenter, along with Rev. and Mrs. A.D. Noyes, sailed from New York City September 12, 1885.²¹

They arrived in Liberia on Thanksgiving Day. On Christmas Day Mary was taken ill with African Fever.²² On January 3 [?], 1886, six weeks after landing in Liberia, Mary E. Carpenter died.²³

The church had acquired no property in Liberia, and the attempt to start a mission station there was soon given up.²⁴

Augusta "Gusta" Tullis Kelley, Portuguese East Africa

An extract from Gusta's journal, 1880, reads:

Ever since I have been saved I have felt that the Lord was calling me into his vineyard to labor. A sense of unworthiness has prevented me thus far from entire devotion to this work. During the winter of 1879-80 I received some encouragement from my pastor, and promised the Lord that when my term of school closed I would devote at least one year to his work, and then wait for further light.²⁵

Her school closed in May. Augusta assisted her pastor, then helped a young preacher named W.W. Kelley with a tabernacle meeting. She then "gave her whole time, strength and talent"²⁶ to evangelistic work. Children's meetings were her special delight, though she was always ready for any work the Lord set before her.

In August 1882, following a mutual revelation, Gusta teamed up with Sister Romack. They held evangelistic services together until 1885. Gusta married Rev. W.W. Kelley on April 21, 1885; B.T. Roberts officiated. The ceremony took place in the Roberts home. Having been accepted by the General Missions Board, the Kelleys left New York City April 25, 1885, bound for Africa.

Upon their arrival in Inhambane, a missionary told them of "a great needy field"²⁷ six hundred miles up the east coast. It was not their intended destination, but they investigated the area, then decided to build a mission station at Komeni. Komeni was about 50 miles inland from Inhambane, and 35 miles from the nearest river where supplies could be landed.²⁸

Working with G. Harry Agnew who had been appointed with them, the Kelleys struggled to "reduce to writing the sounds they heard,"²⁹ in order to make handwritten dictionaries of the natives' unwritten language.³⁰ Mr. Kelley's health began to fail rapidly, which necessitated the Kelleys' return to America barely one year following their departure. W.W. Kelley was, at least while Gusta lived, never healthy again. Gusta did not have "any light to go"³¹ from her missionary station; she wanted to stay. She was however ready to go following a message from God:

He took me back to that remarkable Calhoun camp meeting, and caused me to remember how fast asleep I was on the subject of foreign missions. He then gave me to see how my interest had enlarged and increased. After this He said, in substance, "Return to the country of light and civilization, and wake up others who are asleep as you were." I trembled under the new responsibility. He added to this, missionary work among the children. So I feel that my work is enlarging. May the Lord grant that my soul 32 shall go from strength to strength, and from glory to glory.

She wrote further to her friend Miss Romack, that "I feel in a special sense that I am the mother of this mission . . . because I am the first and only woman that has been here . . ."³³ Her apparently innate adaptability had convinced her spouse that she had a particular gift along this line. This faculty of adaptability is perhaps not as rare among Christian women in ministry as is commonly supposed.

Gusta made a habit of literally obeying Jesus' command: "As you go, preach." One lady they had met on their trip from London to Liverpool traveled eighty miles with them in order to learn the way of salvation as Gusta presented it. Aboard ship, returning to America, she found a number of passengers who were eager to listen to God's truths as she presented them.³⁴ They planned to travel to North Chili immediately upon disembarking. The twelve dollars they had however was not sufficient for fares, so they went to Utica. While there, Rev. W.W. Kelley spoke at the morning service and Gusta spoke in the evening. Neither had mentioned their financial need, yet the people "freely and gladly"³⁵ gave them \$13.36. The people urged the Kelleys to remain in Utica for a brief time. While there, Gusta attended two camp meetings. A letter from B.T. Roberts contained a gracious invitation to spend an indefinite period with the Roberts.

Gusta began to preach again, along with performing other sorts of Christian work. The Kelleys moved to Paxton, Illinois where she: held a few Sunday afternoon meetings in the Baptist church; she took an active part in the Sabbath-school work in the United Presbyterian church; and attended and took part in the social meetings of the Congregational church. The members of these other churches recognized her as a thorough, devoted Christian; and in turn were very kind to us, not forgetting our temporal necessities.³⁶

Gusta Kelley's final letter was written to Mr. J.B. Caldwell:

Paxton, ILL., Nov. 26, 1887

Dear Brother Caldwell:

It was very good of the Lord to tell you something of our needs, and it was very kind of you to be obedient to the heavenly vision. Our house rent (\$7) had been due nine days when your letter came, 23rd inst., and we had been asked to pay it, - an unusual occurrence. I had been asking the Lord the morning your gift was received, to send us the means -- but did not imagine how he would answer. We thank you, and praise Him.

He gave us other tokens of His love the same day, such as a quarter of veal, a peck of apples, two chickens, some milk, tomato pickles, etc. So we had a joyful, bountiful Thanksgiving. . . .

Gusta had kept a diary regularly for seven or eight years. The final entry is dated Sunday, November 27, 1887. Below is her entry from November 24:

Thurs. Nov. 24, 1887, - Our temporal wants are all supplied by kind friends, and our Heavenly Father pours out rich spiritual blessings. . . .

On November 29, 1887, a daughter was born to the Kelleys. Mother and baby appeared to be doing well. Augusta was however unusually quiet, though no disease symptoms appeared. She slept well, waking to talk with her spouse at 4:30 a.m. At 5 o'clock a.m. he raised her in the bed; she spoke to him in her usual voice. As he laid her back onto the pillow, "she made an effort to breathe, or perhaps the air in her

lungs merely forced escape."³⁷ Augusta Tullis Kelley, age 31 years, was with the Lord.

Marston writes that the mission field which the Kelleys, along with Harry Agnew founded - Free Methodism's oldest mission field - is growing rapidly seventy years later.³⁸

Mrs. Abbie Lincoln, Komeni, Portuguese East Africa

The Lincolns, accepted by the Board, sailed for Africa March 3, 1888, arriving on April 30. She died, apparently at Komeni, on June 20, 1888.

Mrs. Emma Hillmon Haviland, Portuguese East Africa

Emma Hillmon arrived in South Africa in May, 1892. She married Rev. Haviland October 28, 1892. They remained at Bethany Mission, Estcourt, until that property was sold. On June 13, 1895, they made their way to Inhambane. They remained at Inhambane until March 18, 1897, the eve of their departure for America. Rev. Haviland died that same evening. Mrs. Haviland and their two children arrived in America in May. Mrs. Haviland spent her remaining years traveling and speaking on missions to the extent that her delicate health and family circumstances allowed.³⁹

Rose (Myers) Desh, Portuguese East Africa

The year that the first gasoline automobile was completed by Durea in Massachusetts⁴⁰ a former Pentecost Bands member named Rose

Myers married Frank Desh. This 1892 wedding took place at Fair View Farm, Portuguese East Africa. The couple slept in a cloth tent at the farm while they helped with the girls' school. Soon however, the Desh's engaged in rescue mission work in Durban, Natal - apparently in defiance of the Mission Board's directive. The Board discontinued the relationship; the Desh's returned to America in 1898.⁴¹

Jennie (Hamilton) Haley, Inhambane, Portuguese East Asfrica

Jennie Hamilton, preacher's daughter from the West Ontario Conference, had been accepted by the Board. She embarked for Africa January 7, 1905,⁴² the year that Japan defeated Russia in the Russo-Japanese War.⁴³ Only a few months passed in Africa before she married J.W. Haley.

A sturdy-hearted woman, Jennie once traveled inland with her husband and their baby girl - a distance of two hundred miles - traveling for some length through a region where no white woman had ever before been seen.⁴⁴

She took particular interest in the Africa Woman's Missionary Society. She also taught sewing and quilting to the native African women, along with helping them to discover the joy of giving to other missions.⁴⁵

The inhospitable climate in Inhambane so impaired her spouse's health that they were forced to return to North America. Winget writes that in 1911 they were making their home on the Saskatchewan prairie.⁴⁶

Matilda Deyo Haley, South Africa

Matilda Deyo and her Fiancée A.E. Haley hoped to be married, then

travel together to their mission field in Africa. Haley however went in January, 1904, at the Board's insistence, while Matilda waited three long years - until December of 1906 - before receiving her orders to sail.⁴⁷ They married soon after her arrival in Africa. Most of their labors were in Natal until 1910, when the Board appointed them to Germiston (Johannesburg).⁴⁸ The Haleys pioneered new territory now known as Massinga.⁴⁹

Ethel A. Cook, Natal, Pondoland, East Africa

Accepted by the Board March 20, 1907, Ethel A. Cook sailed from New York, bound for Africa, on November 2, 1907. Her fifteen months in Africa were divided among Natal, Pondoland, and Inhambane. Her health began to fail, making a return to America imperative. She arrived in New York April 3, 1909, a valued missionary who labored in the African tropical climate, so antagonistic to many missionaries from the temperate zone of North America.

Charlotte E. Johns Wells, Inhambane, South Africa and Portuguese East Africa

Charlotte E. Johns had already been accepted by the Board as a missionary to Africa. While the acceptance was given in the fall of 1908, an appropriate opening and sufficient funds were not available before she married Elbert H. Wells.

October 20, 1910 found the couple attending Greenville College when their acceptance and appointment arrived. They would be going to Inhambane. Their ship sailed from New York January 11, 1911, and

the Wells reached the mission station in Transvaal on March 10. Prior to traveling on to Inhambane, they studied the native language at Modderfontein in Transvaal. They served in Africa until 1915, and were present along with a large number of other Free Methodist missionaries at the eighth quadrennial meeting of the General Woman's Missionary Society, held June 10-21, 1927, in Rochester, New York.⁵⁰

The book is now beginning to come together. I have invested most of my time in research and in compiling the bibliography.

END NOTES

- ¹Marjory B. Hinman, Shirley Hess, and Helen A. Sax, compilers, "Chronological History of Broome County - Its Place in the Country and in the World" (The Broome County Historical Society, Binghamton, NY, 1976), p. 31.
- ²Esther Mae Roberts, The Bishop and His Lady (Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1962), p. 36.
- ³Hinman, Hess, and Sax, "Chronological History . . .", p. 31.
- ⁴Ibid., n.p.
- ⁵Jack Richardson, "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth Century Free Methodism (Master of Arts dissertation, Colgate Rochester Divinity School, April 1984), p. 14.
- ⁶Ibid., p. 16.
- ⁷Ibid., p. 19.
- ⁸Mary Alice Tenney, Adventures in Christian Love (Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1964), p. 46.
- ⁹Adella P. Carpenter, Ellen Lois Roberts: Life and Writings (Chicago, IL: Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1926), p. 42.
- ¹⁰Emma Freeland Shay, Mariet Hardy Freeland: A Faithful Witness (Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1913), p. 108.
- ¹¹Ibid., p. 179.
- ¹²Ibid., p. 179.
- ¹³Ibid., pp. 179-180.
- ¹⁴Ibid., p. 209.
- ¹⁵Ibid., pp. 41-42.
- ¹⁶Ibid., pp. 41-42.
- ¹⁷Ibid., p. 138.

¹⁸Ibid., p. 72.

¹⁹Ibid., p. 138.

²⁰Carrie T. Burritt, The Story of Fifty Years (Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1935), p. 19.

²¹Benjamin Winget, Missions and Missionaries of the Free Methodist Church (Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1911), p. 19.

²²Burritt, The Story of . . ., p. 19.

²³Emma L. Hogue, Adella Paulina Carpenter: In Memory of a Beautiful Life (Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1939), p. 51.

²⁴Helen Isabel Root, Our Africa Work: A Brief History of the Free Methodist Mission in Africa (Chicago, IL: Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1928), p. 5.

²⁵Walter W. Kelley, Memoirs of Mrs. Augusta Tullis Kelley: Her Experience, Labors as an Evangelist and Missionary to Africa, with Extracts from her Writings (Attica, IN: Walter W. Kelley, 1888), p. 24.

²⁶Ibid., p. 27.

²⁷Root, Our Africa Work: . . ., p. 8.

²⁸Ibid., p. 8.

²⁹Ibid., p. 8.

³⁰Ibid., p. 8.

³¹Kelley, Memoirs of Mrs. Augusta Tullis Kelley: . . ., p. 220.

³²Ibid., pp. 220-221.

³³Ibid., p. 223.

³⁴Ibid., p. 234.

³⁵Ibid., p. 237.

³⁶Ibid., pp. 261-262.

³⁷Ibid., n.p.

³⁸Leslie R. Marston, From Age to Age a Living Witness: A Historical

Interpretation of Free Methodism's First Century (Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1960), p. 461.

³⁹ Winget, Missions and Missionaries . . ., pp. 22-23; Burritt, The Story of . . ., pp. 23-26; Alice E. Walls, Ruth L. Cochrane, and Mary Loretta Rose, Eighty Years: Historical Sketch of the Woman's Missionary Society of the Free Methodist Church (n.d.), p. 4, Root, Our Africa Work: . . ., pp. 10-11, 27.

⁴⁰ Hinman, Hess, and Sax, "Chronological History . . .," p. 32.

⁴¹ Winget, Missions and Missionaries . . ., p. 22; Burrit, The Story of . . ., pp. 23, 25.

⁴² Winget, Missions and Missionaries . . ., p. 27.

⁴³ Hinman, Hess, and Sax, "Chronological History . . .," p. 33.

⁴⁴ Winget, Missions and Missionaries . . ., p. 28.

⁴⁵ Ruth M. Tapper, Life Stories of Foreign Missionaries of the Free Methodist Church (Winona Lake, IN: Young People's Missionary Society Council, n.d.), p. 42.

Tapper writes about missionaries supported by the Young People's Missionary Society 1931-1935.

⁴⁶ Winget, Missions and Missionaries . . ., p. 28.

⁴⁷ Ibid., p. 31; Tapper, Life Stories . . ., p. 43.

⁴⁸ Winget, Missions and Missionaries . . ., p. 31.

⁴⁹ Tapper, Life Stories . . ., p. 43.

⁵⁰ Winget, Missions and Missionaries . . ., p. 39; Burritt, The Story of . . ., pp. 28, 48; Walls, Cochrane, and Rose, "Eighty Years: Historical Sketch . . ., pp. 16-17.

CHAPTER 5
FUTURE DIRECTIONS FOR MINISTRY BY MEANS OF:

A. THE BOOK

The book is intended to assist Free Methodists in rediscovering our roots within their historical contexts. It has been suggested that this book might serve as the nucleus for a video. As an accurate history, the book will serve as a didactic tool. This is the first compilation of the history of Free Methodist women in ministry as a fairly exhaustive historical document.

B. THE BIBLIOGRAPHY

The bibliography is a tool for scholars and other researchers. It also meets the denomination's need for a bibliography of women's studies.

C. THE THEOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS DOCUMENT

The theological foundations document is the nucleus for a future sophisticated Bible study. In addition, it contributes to the existing body of literature on the theology of gender equality.

D. OTHER SETTINGS WHERE THE MODEL MIGHT BE USED

The completed book will be interesting reading fare as well as providing a didactic enhancement. It will provide a broad spectrum of

information for those who are particularly interested in denominational histories. Its specialized nature could augment its value as a basic text.

The bibliography will aid in women's studies research.

E. LIMITATIONS AND POSSIBILITIES OF THE MODEL FOR DIVERSE RELIGIONS TRADITIONS

The limitation is that both book and bibliography are denomination-oriented. This limitation can prove itself a boon however; in our ever-narrowing, specializing culture, it is the esoteric which will be sought out for particularized studies.

APPENDIX A
CONFERENCE RECORDS OF WOMEN APPOINTED

The Genesee Conference 1860-1959

<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Society</u>	<u>Years</u>	<u>Name</u>
Pastor	Belfast	1922-1923	Blanche E. Stamp (with Joel Webb)
Pastor	E. Randolph	1937-1938	Catherine Cox
		1939-1940	Helen Gordonier
Pastor	Forestville	1940-1943	Eva Donley
Missionary	Franklinville	(Africa)	Mae P. Armstrong
		(Africa)	Ila M. Gunsolus
Pastor	Fredonia	1891-1893	Olive Teffts
Pastor	Hornell	1939-1940	Mary Simpson
Missionary	Jamestown	(India)	Mata D. Allee
		(Africa)	Lydia Ogren Gaudin
		(Dom. Rep.)	Mrs. Ruth Lyndberg Mills
		(China)	Mrs. Mary Ogren Schlosser
Missionary	North Chili	(China)	Edith Frances Jones
		(Liberia)	Mary E. Carpenter
		(Ceylon/India)	Kitty Wood
		(India)	Kumeroohulasingh
		(South Africa)	Louisa Ranf
		(?)	Mildred Cady Hoffman
Pastor	N. Tonawanda	Summer-1949	Althea Morey Lawrence
		Summer-1950	Ruth G. Copley and Barbara Sherman
			Rosalie Richards and Mae Marsh
Pastor	Rushford	1924-1925	Martha Williams
Pastor	Salamanca	1929-1930	Katherine Cox (Cath- erine?)
Pastor	Warsaw	1924-1925	Ethel Thrall
Pastor	W. Kendall	1957-1958	Joyce Morey Smith

Compiled from Wilder, Wesley, et.al., Genesee Conference History,
Free Methodist Church, 1860-1959 (b.p., n.d.).

Appendix A, con't.

The Oil City Conference 1898-1973

<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Society</u>	<u>Years</u>	<u>Name</u>
Pastor	Beechwood and Emporium		Mrs. N.F. Hibbard (1883)
Pastor	Keech and Raymond		Emma Ellison (1883)
Supply	Allegheny and Portage Creek		Gertrude Grimm (1899)
Supply	Enterprise	1899	Helen Critchlow
Pastor	Sharon, Sharpsville, Bethel, and Charleston	1899	Kate Baldwin and May Brunner
Supply	Corry	1899	Minnie M. Smith
Pastor	E. Bradford	1938-1940	Mrs. Jennie Sell
Pastor	Ulysses	Spring 1902 1905-1906	Luella Newton Gertrude Grimm, aided by Victoria Cannon
		1914	Emma Holbrook
		1931	Rev. Mabel Hicks
Pastor (Founder)	Duke Center	1901?	Rev. Emma Ellison
Missionary	Port Allegheny	1900	Gertrude Grimes
	Franklin	(South Africa) (?)	Myrtle (Myrta) Smith
(Founders)	West Home	1893	Mary Simpson Fanny Hodgens, Effie Boyer, assistants to Rev. E.M. Sandys
Pastor Missionary	Sugar Grove	1938-1941? (?) (?)	Nellie Haskins Mildred Norbeck
Missionary Pastor	Sheffield Sharpsville	(India) 1898	Ruth Landin Essie Josephson Rev. Mae Brunner, Rev. Kate Baldwin
		1918-1921? 1921-1924	June B. Horning Rev. Luella Newton
		1931-1934	Rev. Inez Hill
Pastor	Ellwood City	(?)	Mae Brunner Fox, assisted by Kate Baldwin Smith
Pastor Assistant	Sharon N. Kingsville	1900 1943	Kate Baldwin Ida Watson (Rev. M.L. Watson, supply
Pastor	Union City	1933	E. Lorena Maynard
Pastor	Girard	c. 1900	Sadie Gray
Pastor	Erie/Girard	(?) (?)	Kate Baldwin Susie Decker
Pastor	Girard	1929-1931 1934-1936 1940-1951	Annie R. Wilcox Annie R. Wilcox Jennie G. Sell

Appendix A, Oil City Conference, con't.

<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Society</u>	<u>Years</u>	<u>Name</u>
Pastor	Meadville	(?)	Minnie Smith
		(?)	Emma Ellison
Co-pastors		(?)	Ruth Whitehead and Usula Jackson
Pastor	Erie First	1920-1923	June Horning
Supply	Conneaut	1907-1909	Ozziline Tanner (Rev. A.C. Tanner, Pastor)
Pastor		1911-1918	Rev. June B. Horning
Pastor	Fleming	(?)	Rev. Esther Blews
Pastor	Tyrone	(?)	Rev. Inez Hill
Pastor	Renovo	(?)	Mrs. Ella N. Kulp
		(?)	June B. Horning
Pastor	Moshannon	(?)	Rev. Mrs. Ella Kulp
Pastor	Huntingdon	1956-	Joan Houck
Assistant		1956-	Joan Sones
Pastor	Clearfield	1932	Minnie Wertz and Orpha Williams
		(?)	Esther Blews
Pastor	Brookville	(?)	Mary Brunner and Kate Baldwin
Pastor	Clarion	(?)	Esther Blews Arner
Pastor	Penfield	1893	Mrs. N.F. Hibbard
Assistant	Penfield, Mt. Pleasant, and Clearfield	1901	Jennie Whitehouse

Received into Full Connection in Oil City Conference

<u>Year</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Final Disposition</u>
1916	June B. Horner	Located at her own request, 1933
1921	Edna Perry	Died 1942
1928	Mary Addis	Transferred to Ohio Conf., 1937
	Inez Hill	Died 1967
1930	Mabel L. Hicks	
1935	E. Lorena Maynard	Transferred to another denom., 1951
	Anna R. Wilcox	Died 1940
1941	Jennie Sell	Died 1969
	Esther Blews	Located at her own request, 1956
1942	Minnie Wertz	
1943	Orpha Williams	
1958	Joan Houck	
1961	Usula Jackson	
	Ruth Whitehead	

Appendix A, Oil City Conference, con't.

Compiled from Richard R. Blews and Frances McKay Roggenbaum, Our Heritage 1898-1973: The Oil City Conference (Privately published, 1973).

Appendix A, con't.

The Pittsburgh Conference 1883-1983Mary A. Beeson: ordained deacon 1922

<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Society</u>	<u>Years</u>
Pastor	Griffin, GA	1906
Conference Evangelist		1907-1910
Pastor	Hollywood, GA	1910
	Riverside, GA	1911
	Kissimmee, FL	1912
Repairers Office and Evangelist		1913-1918
Pastor	Creighton	1918-1921
	Sunnyside	1921
	Blairsville	1922-1925
	Freeport	1925-1927
	Monaca	1927-1929
Evangelist		1930
Pastor	Monaca	1931-1934
	Huntingdon First	1934-1936
Evangelist		1936
Pastor	Hendricks	1937-1940
	Bitner	1940
Retired		1941
Deceased		4/26/47

June Horning Miller: ordained deacon 1916

Ministered	Oil City Conference	1906-1932
Pastor	Apollo	1932-1934
	Blairsville	1934-1937
Dean of Women, Roberts Wesleyan College		1937
Evangelist		1938
Sup't. General Junior Missionary Society		1939-1944
Oregon Conference		1944
Retired		1945
Deceased		1/4/49

Dorothy Mae Sellers Garman: ordained deacon 1955

Pastor	Hendricks	1942-1945
Evangelist		1945-1950
Deaconess Hospital, Oklahoma City		1950-1954
Evangelist		1954-1958

Appendix A, The Pittsburgh Conference, con't.

(Dorothy Mae Sellers Garman, con't.)

Supplying in Florida	1958
Retired	1959

Rossalette Ullom: ordained deacon 1932

Pentecost Bands	1890-1893
Assistant Pastor	1903
Pastor	1905
Beulah, Morgantown, and	
Dellslow	1906
Catawba	1911
New Kensington	1912
Catawba	1916
Catawba and Opekiska	1917
Leechburg	1918
Monaca	1919
Enterprise	1925
Beulah, Catawba, and	
Opekiska	1929
Beulah	1930
Rivesville	1931
Morgantown	1932
Rosedale and Mount Morris	1933
Rivesville	1934-1937
Nain	1937
Rivesville	1939-1944
Samaria	1944-1946
Callery	1946
Hendricks	1947
Retired	1948
Deceased	4/13/52

Addie VanGilder: evangelist's license 1902, deacon's orders 1935

Pastor	Nain	1906-1908
	Enterprise	1908-1910
	Hendricks	1910
	White House	1911
	W. Brownsville and Roscoe	1912
	Kissimmee, FL	1913
	Enterprise	1919
	Opekiska and Catawba	1923
	Morgantown, etc.	1924-1926

Appendix A, The Pittsburgh Conference, con't.

(Addie VanGilder, con't.)

	Beulah	1926
	Catawba and Opekiska	1927
	Goose Creek (Nain)	1928
	Beulah	1933
	Ohioville	1934-1936
	Beulah	1936-1940
	Hendricks	1940
	Collier	1941
Evangelist		1942-1944
Pastor	Waynsboro, VA	1944-1947
Retired		1949
Deceased		11/9/68

Sylvia Boring Kennison: ordained deacon 1947, elder 1975

Pastor	Nain	1944
	Hendricks	1945-1947
	Enterprise, etc.	1947-1950
	Mount Sharon	1950-1952
	Little Brownfield	1952-1956
	White House	1956-1959
Leave of Absence		1959-1963
Pastor	Smithfield	1963
	Mount Pleasant	1964-1968
Leave of Absence		1968-1972
Evangelist		1972
Pastor	Shoaf	1972-1975
Leave of Absence		1975
Pastor	Little Brownfield	1976-1981
Evangelist		1981
Retired		1982

Verna Tite: ordained deacon 1975, elder 1978

Missionary	Mozambique (Port. E. Africa)	1946-1975
Mission Work	Miami, FL	1975-1977
Retired		1977
Missions-related trip	Africa	1979-1980

Appendix A, The Pittsburgh Conference, con't.

Lily Horwood: ordination in preparation 1983

Missionary	Portuguese East Africa	1947-1975
Retired		1977
Missions-related trip	Transvaal (with Verna Tite)	1979-1980

M. Jean Parry: ordained deacon 1972, first Free Methodist woman to be ordained elder 1974

Laura Lamb: ordained deacon 1913

Have also gone out as Missionaries

Gertrude Alcorn	India	1906-1950
Emma Alcorn McCready with spouse W.R.	India	1900-1909
Mrs. E.C. Snyder with spouse	Dominican Republic Texas Latin American	1931-1940 1967-1970
Ruth N. Foy	Paraguay	1946-1950
Helen (Rose) Basch	India	1950-1954
Mary Lucille (Luffy) Crawford	India	1950-1954
Esther Clemens with spouse Edwin	Portuguese East Africa Haiti	1950-1974 1980-
Peggy Mack with spouse Wes	Hong Kong	1969-1978
Lola Baker with spouse John	Florida Spanish Mission	1955-1956
Virginia Daniel with spouse Paul	Haiti	1973-1977

Compiled from C.H. Canon, E.W. Cowser, and R.L. Page, History of the Pittsburgh Conference of the Free Methodist Church: Centennial Edition 1883-1983 (Published by order of the Pittsburgh Conference, 1983).

There is additional information about women in ministry in the Pittsburgh Conference in Arthur D. Zahniser and John B. Easton, History of the Pittsburgh Conference of the Free Methodist Church (Winona Lake, IN: Free Methodist Publishing, 1932).

Appendix A, con't.

The Susquehanna Conference 1862-1987

<u>Appointed</u>	<u>Society</u>	<u>Years</u>	<u>Name</u>
Pastor	Alton	1928-1930	Helen Balch
Pastor	Chittenango	1913-1915	Anna B. Collier, Bessie Lester
		1932-1936	Leola Hunt
Pastor	Cortland	1910-1911	Florence H. Deyle
Pastor	Elmira	1939-1942	Bessie M. Richards
Pastor	Gouverneur	1914-1915	Harriet E. Sheldon with Harry Carey, Joel Webb
		1918-1919	Louise D. Calkins, Evangeline Crockett
Supply	North Pharsalia	1896-1898	Hattie Austin
Pastor		1924-1926	Jennie Pratt
Pastor?	Norwich	1937-1939	Bessie M. Richards
Pastor	Norwood	1915-1917	Amelia Youngren, Emily Shattuck
		1917-1918	Hazel Cline Perry, Lucy Chaffee
		1919-1921	Isabelle White
		1923-1926	Hazel Cline Perry
		1934-1936	Beryle Kelly, Lura F. Smith (woman?)
		1953-1955	Lura F. Smith (woman?)
Pastor	Oneida	1894-1896	Thirza Milem, Rosella Adair
		1897-1898	Florence Deyle, Rosella Adair
		1898-1899	Thirza Milem (woman?)
Pastor	Port Byron	1893-1894	Thirza Milem, Rosella Adair
		1910-1911	(C.E. Robbins), Carolyn Robbins
		1920-1923	Annabelle Collier (Andrus L. Bates)
		1928-1930	Jessie Bates
		1934-1937	Bessie M. Richards
Pastor	Webster	1903-1905	Florence Deyle (with C.E. Christman)

Women listed as serving appointments in the Susquehanna Conference 1862-1987, but not listed in the appointments above: Harriet S. Barnes, M.D., Ruth Hopes Blaho, Grace Buckles, Lillian T.

Dallas, Lillie Durham, Hattie Fox, Catherine Gouthey, Evelyn Long Hasselbrock (now serving in MA), Ruth D. Hessley (retired missionary), Mabel Hicks, Joyce Newton Knowles, Bessie Reid Kresge (missionary), Pauline Maxwell, Bertha Newton, Pearl Newton, Helen I. Root (missionary, denominational women's worker, deceased), Mary I. Wilcox, M.(Mary?)E. Chynoweth (Missionary, deceased).

Compiled from Elton O. Smith A History of the Susquehanna Conference
Free Methodist Church 1862-1987 (n.p.d.).

Appendix A., con't.

The Canadian Conferences

The appendix below is included temporarily in this document pending permission of the compiler: John Sigsworth, The Battle Was the Lord's (Oshawa: Sage, 1960), pp. 281-282, and 279.

ORDAINED LADY MINISTERS WHO HAVE SERVED CIRCUITS

East Ontario Conference—Sara Gregory, Bessie Reid Kresge, Delia Potter, Pearl Reid, Edith Mainprize.

West Ontario Conference—Alice E. Walls.

Saskatchewan Conference—Lottie Babcock, Marion W. Larson.

Alberta Conference—Mrs. Ada Foreman Henderson.

LADY SUPPLY PASTORS AND EVANGELISTS WHO HAVE
SERVED CIRCUITS

North Michigan Conference (Canada District)—Valtina Brown, Jerusha Hagle, Frankie Davis, Arlette Eddy, Maggie Crittenden.

Canada Conference—Jerusha Hagle, Martha Thomas, Maggie Hoffman, Mary Alice Loveless, Nancy Schantz, Laura J. Warren, Mary Hutchinson, Katie Epps, Matilda Sipprell, Eva Wicker, Martha Stonehouse, Maggie Draper, Mary Craig, Jemima Hutchinson, Miss Merritt, Mary Keeler, Mary Milliken, Olive Diller, Millie Lapp, Maggie Boyd, Jane Hill, Mary Bretz, Kate Booth, Phoebe Avery, Mary Taylor, Nellie Fulton, Emma Woodcock, Eliza Wees, Valtina B. Harrison, Martha Page, Annie L. Green, Maggie Crittenden, Josephine Rusk, Mary Norrington, Jennie Robinson, Annie Robertson, Lydia Bortz, Emma Snider, Almira Hogle, Minnie Bauder, Mary Botting, Jimima Macklin, Alma Smith, Ada Slingerland.

East Ontario Conference—N. Schantz, Emma Buck, Mary Diller, Jennie Robinson, Emma Snider Hamden, Esther Goodberry Brown, Lottie Babcock Ada Foreman, Eliza Free, Gertrude Pratt, Louise Hicks Findlay, Kate Clark, Amanda Hughes Norrington, Frances Botting, Caroline Gregory, Sadie Gunter, Laura J. W. Coleman, Ethel Davey, Georgia Wilkins, Nina Green, Ella Luck, Edith Sears, Annie Slack, Maud Everson, Olive Butcher, Edna Redne, Effie Gibson, Pearl Rebman, Annie Stark, Alberta Sims, Gertrude Patterson, Alvina Sine Gunter, Florence Potter, Edith Draper, Pearl Rye, Julia Smart Grey, Agnes Benn, Violet Gunter, Iva Snider, Violet Mallory, Edith Snyder, Edith Jones, Myrtle Halliday, Luella Ball, Lulu Halliday, Ethel Griffith, Gladys Miller, Grace Goheen, Neva Kemp, D. M. Wolsey, Audrey Robinson, Elmira Webb, Ila Hart, Ethel F. Chase, Lois Kemp, Helen McNutt, Muriel Darling, Bertha Mills.

West Ontario Conference—L. J. Warren, A. L. Green Steet, J. Rusk Wees, J. Macklin, M. Sipprell, A. Smith, Ada Slingerland, Alice Underhill, N. Schantz, Jennie R. Elson, Mary Toolc Clink, Emma Geary, Hattie Toole, Delia Sinden, Harriet Sheldon, Mary J. Everhart, Emma Green, Bertha Purdy, Flossie Teal, Maggie Allan, Lizzie J. King, Mabel Pett, Lillian Beirge, Effie Cowherd, Ada Foreman, Martha Mullen, Emily Kent, Lillian Briggs, Nellie Smith, Annie Botting, Alice E. Walls, Elizabeth Allan, Alma Scott Haley, Jane Hill Coates, Harriet Loveless, Harriet McCready, Mabel Peach, Grace Hyndman, Olive Vail, Myrtle Halliday, Martha Marlatt, Margaret Allan

Appendix A, The Canadian Conferences, Sigsworth appendix, con't.

Stevenson, Ruby Hicks, Hazel Arnold, Minerva McQuarrie, Edna Riblett, Sarah Miller, Evelyn Dawson, Katie Burton, Ella Lishman, Pauline Avey, Kathleen Garland, Muriel Darling, Jennie Hamilton, Kaye B. Mitchell.

Western Canada Conference—Josie Wees, Annie L. Steer, Thilia Champion, Hannah Lawrence, Lizzie King, Agnes Cronin, Florence Haight, Nellie Hunt, Ada Foreman, Alma Dies.

Saskatchewan Conference—Josie Wees, Sarah Miller, Edith Abbott, Eliza Fletcher, Victoria Ayre, Eliza Free, Alma Dies, Laura Gibbs Buffam, Nettie Raymer, Pearl Rusk, Eva Bradley, Myrtle Smith, Edith Sutherland, Hazel S. Knowles, E. C. Mitchell, Grace L. Summers, Ethel F. Chase, Lela DeMille, Margaret Collett, Ina Byce, Myrtle Moor, Verna Smith, Florence Moreside, Luella Dies, Helen Markell, Ina Miller, Doris Gray, Bernice Tanner, Lois Wheeler, Ruby Beckstead, Doreen Wilson.

Alberta Conference—Florence Haight, Alma Dies, Lizzie L. King, Alice Heath, Bertha Calhoon, Leila Ferguson, Lena Nelson, Leila Taylor, Lamorah Sellers, Flora Wilson, Katherine Shaver, Nina Taylor, Margaret Taylor, Vivian Madsen, Irene Kaye, Dora Eckert, Mildred Mottet, Betty Mack, Ethel Chase, Ella Somerville, Maude Rogers.

Washington Conference (B. C. Coast District)—Marion Rennie, Eva Alberts, Josie R. Wees, Alice Simpson, Mona McKeown.

APPENDIX B

SUMMARY OF CONTEXT ASSOCIATES' EVALUATIONS

Is the language "popularly" understandable?

Yes --5

One qualified "yes" stated that I included a number of "less commonly used words."

Does what you have read entice you to read more?

Yes -- 5

Does the text convey messages in addition to the obvious content?

Yes -- 4

Abstentions -- 2

If so, what do you think that (message) might be?

The responses centered around the conviction that God calls people to particular tasks, and that He enables and nurtures those whom He calls so that, no matter what we must go through in order to do His will, there is no alternative for any of us.

One person found the history to be intriguing and exciting.

Does the text respect the reader?

Yes -- 5

Abstention -- 1

Would the introduction tempt you into buying the book?

Enthusiastic affirmative -- 4

"Not quite" -- 1

"With a change of sequence of paragraphs it would be better" -- 1

Are the facts clearly presented (no muddy passages)?

Yes -- 4

Abstention -- 1

"Generally" -- 1

Would the introduction pique your interest in the subject if you were not already interested in it?

Yes -- 2

No -- 1

One person declined to respond because he or she had known or known closely about a number of the women we discussed.

Appendix B, Summary . . . , con't.

Would you suggest changes in what has been presented (major changes)?

No -- 4

Abstention -- 1

If so, what would you change, and how would you do that?

One person suggested that I make the introduction more interesting. Another asked if so many women went overseas to pastor (as missionaries) because that was the only way they could fulfill their call. [The book does address this issue, but further into the text than we went.]

Are you glad that you have participated in this group?

Yes -- 5

One wrote, "Very glad! I enjoyed the challenge of critiquing a book plus helping Pastor Jean. Got to know her and others in the group in a new light."

Have we accomplished something together?

Yes -- 3

One responded, "Much."

One other person responded with, "I think we have been exposed to how others can read the same material and sometimes perceive it differently. I have learned how others' preferences and tastes in reading may differ from mine - I have enjoyed the cooperative effort and group identity for such a meeting for a common purpose - "

Has Pastor Jean responded well to your suggestions and criticisms?

All were positive here - on this which seemed to me to be the most important question pertaining to my growth.

One person commented, "She was always open and responsive to suggestions and criticism and never seemed to get annoyed with us." [This particular response, though I do not know from whom it came, appears to have a very painful double entendre, flowing out of a segment of the immediate catalyst for the local church's split, even though I was not involved in that.]

Another writes, "Very open to suggestions. A very good spirit."

Are you more interested now in her topic than you were when we began?

All responses were - surprisingly to me - affirmative! Most added that they would be glad to own a copy of the book when it comes out.

One responded: "Yes - the discussions have raised questions and issues to be further examined and explored."

APPENDIX C

EXAMPLES OF PERSONAL REFLECTION QUESTIONS

I, _____ have just read about one area of Free Methodist Church history. It has _____ and _____ me. I thought that _____, and have discovered _____

_____. Keeping this in mind, I intend to _____, so that _____
_____.

Notes and reflections one week later:

At times I think in pictures and/or colors. I express this below.

Appendix C, Examples . . . , con't.

God has called me, _____, to practice everyday radical personal obedience to Him - to live holy. I must respond now. After listening to me talk about this, and after reading what I have written, my church - the people I love - say that _____

My first reaction is _____
_____. Upon careful consideration, and after searching the Scriptures in even more depth than I had already done, I _____,
because _____

Notes and Reflections One Week Later:

My period of consternation brings a picture to my mind; I'll sketch it here.

EXTENDED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF FREE METHODIST WOMEN'S STUDIES: WITH
SELECTED ECUMENICAL ENTRIES

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. FREE METHODIST REVIEW

- A. Background Material
- B. Biographical Sources
- C. General Works
- D. Pentecost Bands
- E. Bibliographies

II. SELECTED ECUMENICAL REVIEW

- A. Background Material
- B. Biographical Sources
- C. General Works
- D. Bibliographies

III. SELECTED MATERIAL IN OPPOSITION TO WOMEN AS ORDAINED MINISTERS
AND/OR AS CHURCH ADMINISTRATORS

IV. APPENDIX TO I, E.: INDEX TO ARTICLES RELATING TO WOMEN IN FREE
METHODIST ORDAINED MINISTRY, FOUND IN THE FREE METHODIST,
COMPILED BY JACK RICHARDSON.

I. FREE METHODIST REVIEW

A. Background Material

Andrews, Robert F., Donald N. Bastian, Gerald E. Bates, David M. Foster, and Clyde E. VanValin. Foundations Building for the New Day: Five Bishops Speak to the Church. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, n.d. (ca 1988).

Each of the five then-presiding Free Methodist Bishops centers his expertise and vision upon one particular denominational need which, if met, would further the denomination's approximating of its New Day vision. This booklet provides today's background for women aspiring and expecting to participate in our world-wide aim to plant one thousand new Free Methodist churches by the year 2000. Additional Free Methodist hopes for this time period extend toward an openness to non-traditional, though peculiarly "fitting" sorts of ministries (Free Methodism is a reform movement.). This could allow for a larger number of women to minister as ordained clergy than has been the case in a number of our conferences until now.

Arnold, Helen. Under Southern Skies. Atlanta, GA: Repairer Publishing Company, 1924.

This work places some notable early Free Methodists within their historical contexts. Adelia Arnold, Julia Shelhamer, and Auntie Coon are among the women whom Arnold includes.

Baldwin, Harmon A. Holiness and the Human Element. Salem, OH: Convention Book Store, H.E. Schmul, 1971 copy of 1919 edition.

An important tool for illuminating the Free Methodist emphasis upon personal holy living. Baldwin succeeds well in his purpose which is to clarify the application of general rules to the intricacies of daily living and emotions (preface). Holiness background and practical holy living are essentially the same for female and male.

Bastian, Donald N. Belonging! Adventures in Church Membership. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1986 revision of the 1978 edition.

A basic history and elucidation of the Free Methodist Church. This book is the standard guide which a number of Free Methodist pastors offer to those who express an interest in the denomination.

Bates, Gerald E. "Some Very Demanding Truths." Unpublished essay, November 1989, n.p.

Free Methodist Bishop Bates' lively position paper on the spiritual state of the denomination (1989) includes the following statement:

I have a special affection for Luke. In his gospel he

is the historian of the despised and the oppressed. Samaritans and women come off well while the religious aristocracy are regularly accused and reduced to helpless anger.

With this sort of considered, thought-through statement, the denomination's remaining intransigent supporters of the traditional double standard for male and female might be inclined toward at least reviewing their stance on this issue.

Blews, Richard R. Our Heritage 1898-1973. History of the Oil City Conference (Free Methodist). Published by the Oil City Conference, 1973 (pp. 2-3, 6-9, 14-15, 18-27, 30-67, 70-73, 82-89, 92-93).

This conference history tells the story, by means of both statistics and biographical sketches, of the women as well as of the men who have pastored its people. WMFI information is included.

Buckley, James M. A History of Methodism in the United States. 2 vols. New York, NY: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1898 (pp. 168-170).

Pages 178-170 report on the founding of Free Methodism from an anti-Free Methodist sentiment. Page 319 mentions that not one Free Methodist representative attended the 1866 committee, comprised of non-Episcopal Methodists, which met in Cincinnati, Ohio. Buckley comments favorably on Free Methodism's "many illustrations of heroic self-denial" within the context of its financial, membership, and educational reports (330-331).

Canon, C.H., E.W. Cowser, and R.L. Page. History of the Pittsburgh Conference of the Free Methodist Church: Centennial Edition 1883-1983. Pittsburgh, PA: Published by order of the Pittsburgh Conference, 1983 (pp. 114-117, 150-153, 212-217, 234-237, 256-257, 264-265, 268-269, 272-273, 278-281).

This authorized history of the Pittsburgh Conference is also the history of its women in ministry, including the Reverend Jean Parry, first woman to be ordained elder in the Free Methodist denomination.

Cochrane, Ruth L., Mary Loretta Rose, and Alice E. Walls. Eighty Years: Historical Sketch of the Woman's Missionary Society of the Free Methodist Church. 1894-1974. N.d.

This pamphlet conveys a brief yet comprehensive history of the first eighty years of the Free Methodist Woman's Society. Historical details.

A Digest of Free Methodist Law or Guide in the Administration of the Discipline of the Free Methodist Church. Prepared and published by order of the General Conference of 1898. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1901 (pp. 20, 48). (Later editions in 1908, 1924, 1935.)

The controversy which raged around ordaining women can be followed in this and in subsequent Free Methodist Law Digests. These digests contain no personal or anecdotal enhancements.

The Doctrine and Discipline of the Free Methodist Church. Buffalo, NY; Winona Lake, IN; Indianapolis, IN: The Free Methodist Church. Revised and published following each General Conference, 1869-

The Earnest Christian. Buffalo, NY: Roberts, 1860-1909. Edited by Benjamin Titus Roberts, then, later, by his son Benson H. Roberts.

This periodical, founded and initially edited by Free Methodism's principle founder, became a particularly useful forum for debates among the early Free Methodists. A number of these exchanges, along with opinions and scholarly articles, centered around the role and status of women in the new denomination.

Fear Leona K. New Ventures: Free Methodist Missions 1960-1979. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press.

Hogue, Wilson Thomas. History of the Free Methodist Church of North America. 2 vols. 2nd ed. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1915. Vol. 1 (pp. 344-347, 356-385). Vol. 2 (pp. 178-179, 184-199, 207, 216-219, 222-223, 230-233, 255-259, 262-303, 310-311, 315-321, 326-327, 344-345, 354, 358-359, 362-363).

Bishop Hogue's official history of the founding and beginnings of the Free Methodist denomination.

Lamson, Byron S. To Catch the Tide. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press for the General Missionary Board, 1963 (pp. 61-62, 75-76, 124).

Lamson chronicles the background and instituting of Free Methodist conferences overseas.

. Venture! The Frontiers of Free Methodism. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1960 (pp. 125-131, 120, 246, 248-264).

Venture! . . . is Lamson's history of Free Methodist missions. His charts are wealthy with the names of women who have served as missionaries.

Marston, Leslie R. From Age to Age a Living Witness: A Historical Interpretation of Free Methodism's First Century. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1960 (pp. 418-419, 434-437, 452-453, 544-545). References to individual women, Clara Leffingwell for example.

Marston, a Free Methodist Bishop (1935-1964), has included a number of references which are favorably inclined toward women in ministry, including ordained ministry.

Moore, Marselle. "The Origins of B.T. Roberts' Feminism." Unpublished

manuscript, n.d.

Moore highlights the history of women in the Burned-Over District of western New York State. Emphasizing B.T. Roberts' concerns in this area of women's ministries, he tracks the rise of women's movements during the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

Mylander, Ruth, and Helen Root. Japan Investment. Winona Lake, IN: The Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church of North America, 1944.

Mylander and Root have accounted for the Free Methodist missionary investment in Japan prior to, and during, World War II. Women's contributions are documented clearly throughout this booklet about denominational accountability.

Record of the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society, Binghamton, New York, November 27, 1897-September 1905.

Handwritten minutes of the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society, from its local organizing meeting through its September 1905 meeting. These minutes reveal the conception and rise of a woman's missionary society in a local church at the turn of the century as well as providing an intimate glimpse into the ongoing functioning of a small, indigenous group of Free Methodist women in that era.

Richardson, Jack D. "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth Century Free Methodism" (Master of Arts dissertation, Colgate Rochester Divinity School, April, 1984).

Extensive particularized bibliography of articles from the Free Methodist, April 16, 1868-October 22, 1890, follows this detailed and interesting analysis of B.T. Roberts' championing of the cause of ordaining women. Historical background.

Roberts, B.T. Ordaining Women. Rochester, NY: Earnest Christian Publishing House, 1891.

Ordaining Women, written out of Roberts' disappointment following the 1890 General Conference's rejection of his proposal to ordain women, is a scholarly biblical justification for equality for women in both ordination and church administration. This work is probably the centrum for Free Methodist women's studies.

. Why Another Sect: Containing a Review of Articles by Bishop Simpson and others on the Free Methodist Church.
Rochester, NY: Earnest Christian Publishing House, 1879.

The following is an excerpt from the sales promotion which follows the text:

An authentic account of the origin of the Free Methodist Church, giving facts never before collected or published. It covers new ground, and is the only full

account of the events which led to the formation of the Free Methodist Church.

While this book does not address the issue of women in ordained ministry, it is one of the seminal works which define the communal history of all Free Methodists.

Sellew, Walter A. Why Not? A Plea for the Ordination of those Women whom God Calls to Preach His Gospel. Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1914.

This pamphlet is, with negligible changes, a reprint of Sellew's 1894 apology in favor of ordaining women. The 1894 version was written while Free Methodists battled hotly over the issue of ordaining women. The reprint however was published in the hope that it might forestall a movement to rescind the 1911 General Conference decision to ordain women as deacons. Sellew's pamphlet is one of the selections which stands at the crux of Free Methodist women's studies as a major primary source.

Shelhamer, Julia A. Secret of a Happy Married Life. 8th edition. Cincinnati, OH: God's Bible School and Missionary Training Home, n.d.

Shelhamer sets forth some early Free Methodist teachings and practices relative to the roles of women and men in maintaining the loving sanctity of a Christian home. Julia Shelhamer was prominent among Free Methodist women in the fledgling days of the denomination.

Sigsworth, John. "A Look at Canadian Roots." Light and Life, Aug. 1990, pp. 9-12.

The Free Methodists in Canada were among the first to appoint women as pastors-in-charge. Their history is one of openness for the most part toward the practice of gender equality.

Smith, Elton O. A History of the Susquehanna Conference Free Methodist Church 1862-1987. N.d. (pp. 5-8, 18, 24, 26, 39, 45-47, 50, 53-54, 73, 84-86, 91).

Smith, who in July 1991 closed a fifteen-year tenure as Superintendent of the Susquehanna Conference, has included the following in his document:

In the history of the conference, seven women have been ordained deacons . . . No women have been ordained as elders and although in years past women have pastored churches there are none under appointment at present (1987) (p. 7).

1991 update: the Susquehanna Conference ordained its first woman elder, Jean Hall Gramento, on July 12, 1991.

Rev. Gramento has served under appointment as Associate Pastor in the Binghamton, New York, Free Methodist Church, Susquehanna Conference, since July 1989.

_____. "Social, Political, and Religious Concerns of the Susquehanna Conference 1862 to 1900." Unpublished documented history (pp. 1,5).

Smith quotes from the minutes of the 1873 General Conference, the Resolution pertaining to woman's work in the church. This resolution proposes in part:

That we ask the ensuing General Conference to amend our book of discipline as clearly to define our views as a church upon this subject; thus enabling us to properly authorize and encourage suitable female labourers among us, and at the same time check improper aspirants to this high vocation (p. 5).

Women were granted the right to deacon's orders in 1911, but, as Smith further reports, "not until 1974 was provision made for elder's status [for women] (p. 5).

Smith, Ruth Gould. Through the Years with the Susquehanna Conference Woman's Missionary Society 1895-1960. Unpublished manuscript, Binghamton, New York, 1961.

Snyder, Howard A. "The Social Mission of Free Methodism." Paper presented to Conference on Mission and Strategy, May 9-11, 1975.

In his historical overview of Free Methodism's role in social reform during the denomination's early decades, Snyder briefly addresses the ministry and status of women. He also includes women in his prognosis for Free Methodism's potential interaction with social issues.

"A Social, Urban, and Ethnic Agenda: An Official Document." Light and Life, Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, Oct. 1990, p. 14.

This agenda presents both a description and a strategy. It attempts to describe social and demographic realities to which the church must respond in the nineties:

Free Methodists must face the reality of ingrained cultural prejudice, paternalism, and sexism. All sectors of the church must embark on a course of education for acceptance of those who are racially or culturally different.

Supplement to Digest of Free Methodist Law: Giving Disciplinary Changes made by the General Conference of 1911. N.d.

Paragraph 2 of this document applies directly to the role and status of women in the Free Methodist Church:

¶2. Ordination of Women. The Discipline now provides that women be received into the traveling connection and ordained deacons on the same condition as men, only they are received from the relation of annual conference evangelists instead of from that of local preachers.

Tapper, Ruth M. Glimpses of Victory. Chicago, ILL: Y.P.M.S. Council of the Free Methodist Church, 1931.

A series of missions studies for young people.

Wilder, Wesley R., with Harry F. Anderson, Neil E. Pfouts, and Ora Ann Sprague. Genesee Conference History: Free Methodist Church 1860-1959. N.d.

The pages of Genesee's history are bursting with remembrances of the women who served as pastors and evangelists in that conference since its early days.

Winget, Benjamin. Missions and Missionaries of the Free Methodist Church. Chicago, ILL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1911.

A plain, factual account of the Free Methodist missions, funds, and missionaries from 1881, when the Free Methodist Mission Board was instituted, until 1911. Includes brief mention of the Pentecost Band missionaries as well as an explanation and list of "Faith Missionaries."

Zahniser, Arthur D., and John B. Easton. History of the Pittsburgh Conference of the Free Methodist Church. Chicago, ILL: Free Methodist Publishing House, Published by order of the Pittsburgh Conference, 1932.

This history is wealthy with biographical etchings as well as names, dates, and local church information relating to women in ministry. A number of Pentecost Band members' names are mentioned during the years when these young women and men, under the leadership of Vivian Dake, were active in Free Methodism.

B. Biographical Sources

Abrahamson, Grace. Mrs. Shay Did It! The Wessington Springs Independent. A.L. Webb, Publisher, 1976.

I have not yet seen this particular work; my documentation therefore could be bibliographically incorrect. The content is, in most probability, a study of Emma Freeland Shay.

Baldwin, Clara Etta Weatherly. Mother Baldwin's Ninety years. Unpublished manuscript, n.d.

This biographical account of Mrs. Harmon Baldwin contains a number of references to the Pentecost Bands.

Bates, Gerald. Soul Afire: Life of J.W. Haley. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1981.

Bates includes some of Haley's personal correspondence pertaining to Haley's strong convictions about opening a Free Methodist mission work in Central Africa.

Blews, Richard R. Master Workmen: Biographies of the Deceased Bishops of the Free Methodist Church. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1939.

Brown, Zella M. Trailblazers in Livingstone Country. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1981.

The story of missionaries Ronald and Margaret Collett, and their work in Central Africa.

Burritt, Carrie T. The Story of Fifty Years. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1935.

Burritt's comprehensive history of Free Methodist missiology contains anecdotes from the missionaries, maps, photographs, and charts. A large percentage of these missionaries were women. An excellent introductory book to Free Methodism's early missions efforts.

Carpenter, Adella P. Ellen Lois Roberts: Life and Writings. Chicago, IL: Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1926.

Carpenter's biography of Ellen Lois Stowe who married B.T. Roberts, principal founder of Free Methodism, contains a number of excerpts from Ellen Roberts' diaries, a seminal source in Free Methodist women's studies.

Casberg, Olivia. Mission through a Woman's Eyes. Los Olivos, CA: Olive Press Publications, 1985.

The autobiography of a missionary woman and her physician spouse in India.

Davis, Rolland N., editor. The Challenge in Central India: By Members of the Free Methodist Mission and Church, Yeotmal, M.P., India. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press for Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1954.

This book presents the challenge in Central India (ca 1954) by means of history, geography, and biographical sketches of missionaries, many of them women, who served there. Maps, charts, and photographs as well.

Chapman, Mary Weems. Mother Cobb or Sixty Years' Walk with God. Chicago, IL: T.B. Arnold, Publisher, 1896.

Clarke, Ethel H. Mary E. Chynoweth: Missionary to India. Chicago, ILL: The Woman's Foreign Missionary Society of the Free Methodist Church, 1915.

Mary Chynoweth pastored in the early Susquehanna Conference prior to leaving for the foreign mission field.

Damon, C.M. Sketches and Incidents: Or Reminiscences of Interest in the Life of the Author, with an Appendix. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1900.

The appendix pun is, I am sure, unintended! Rev. Damon pastored in the Free Methodist Church during its early days.

Haley, John Wesley. But Thy Right Hand. Winona Lake, IN: The Woman's Missionary Society of the Free Methodist Church, 1949.

. Life in Mozambique and South Africa. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1926.

Hawley, Doreen, and Jessica Yardy. Living Water, Living Letter: Free Methodist Missions in Egypt and India. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1980.

The co-authors of this book draw upon personal experience for their narrative. Both were missionary wives, Hawley in Egypt, while Yardy served with her medical missionary spouse Paul in India.

Hogue, Emma L. Adella Paulina Carpenter: In Memory of a Beautiful Life. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1939.

Miss Carpenter, who taught at the seminary in Chili, New York, is one of Free Methodism's outstanding pioneers in education for both males and females.

Hogue, Wilson Thomas. G. Harry Agnew: A Pioneer Missionary. Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1907.

Agnew pioneered in African missions along with Rev. W.W. and Augusta "Gusta" Kelley.

"Imo Smith: More than a Token." Light and Life, Oct 1988, Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press (p. 24).

Chaplain Smith, a Free Methodist woman in ministry, served in Saudi Arabia during Operation Desert Storm. She has recently received an award for her dedicated service there.

Ingersol, Robert Stanley. "Burden of Dissent: Mary Lee Cagle and the Southern Holiness Movement." Unpublished dissertation, Duke University, 1989.

Kelley, Walter W. Memoirs of Mrs. Augusta Tullis Kelley: Her Experience, Labors as an Evangelist and Missionary to Africa, with Extracts from her Writings. Attica, IN: Walter W. Kelley, 1888.

This is an account of a woman with indomitable courage, one who kept on serving the Lord with all her strength in every circumstance.

Kirkpatrick, Charles D. Cow in the Clinic and Other Missionary Stories from around the World. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1877.

Kirkpatrick has written a delightful book for children.

La Due, William K. The Life of Rev. Thomas Scott La Due, with some of his Sermon Sketches and Other Writings. Containing also a Brief Memoir of his Wife Martha Kendall La Due. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1898.

The brief memoir of Martha Kendall La Due is an excellent biographical source for information about Martha Kendall La Due, a close friend of Ellen Roberts. Martha was first married to Rev. William Kendall.

Macy, Victor W., and Lela DeMille. Discovery under the Southern Cross below the Equator: Missions Adventures in Mozambique and South Africa. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1984.

Richardson, Arleta. Passport South America. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1987.

The author has also written a popular series of books for children.

Roberts, Ellen Lois Stowe. Diary. Unpublished manuscript, 1839-1845, 1848-1853, 1857, 1874-1875, 1898-1907. The original diary (or diaries) is in Roberts Wesleyan College, North Chili, New York.

Roberts, Esther Mae. The Bishop and his Lady. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1962.

Though this biography of the Roberts was written for Free Methodist young people, it contains information which is useful for women's studies.

Root, Helen Isabel. An Alabaster Box: The Life Story of Grace E. Barnes. Chicago, IL: Woman's Missionary Society, The Free Methodist Church, 1929.

The biography of one of Free Methodism's most beloved missionaries to India.

. A Corn of Wheat: Life Story of Clara Leffingwell. Winona Lake, IN: Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1943.

The biography of the woman missionary who opened the Free Methodist mission station in China.

. Our Africa Work: A Brief History of the Free Methodist Mission in Africa. Chicago, IL: Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1928.

A valuable resource for women's studies in Free Methodist missiology.

Ryckman, Lucile Damon. Paid in Full: The Story of Harold Ryckman Missionary Pioneer to Paraguay and Brazil. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1979.

Sayre, Mary Geneva. Missionary Triumphs in Occupied China. Winona Lake, IN: The Woman's Missionary Society of the Free Methodist Church, 1945.

Sayre's autobiographical account of the twenty-two years she invested as a missionary in China. A number of those years, following December 7, 1941, were spent as a prisoner of the Japanese.

Shay, Mrs. Emma Freeland. Mariet Hardy Freeland: A Faithful Witness. Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1913.

Mariet Freeland was one of early Free Methodism's remarkable women pioneers. The excerpt below is from her "Woman and Early Free Methodism," quoted in Shay:

In the formative days of the Free Methodist church woman had unlimited freedom to labor. She was a powerful factor in those early days. Her public and private ministrations, her groans, her tears, her shouts of triumph, her fidelity to Christ, standing with her brothers in the battle's front, told volumes for the cause of right.

When the first conference was organized, however, woman was not counted in, and at the second conference she was officially counted out. But she went forward hopefully, tremblingly, occupying the position of a supply on circuits among us, with no official voice in our conferences. The time has come when an open door must be set before her to full membership in the conference and the right to ordination (p. 189).

See Jack Richardson, "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth-Century Free Methodism (Master of Arts Dissertation, Colgate Rochester Divinity School, April, 1984), (pp.34-35), for additional background.

Shelhamer, E.E. Life and labors of Auntie Coon. Atlanta, GA: Repairer Office, 1905.

. Sixty Years of Thorns and Roses. Cincinnati, OH: God's Bible School and Missionary Training Home, n.d.

Shelhamer, a colorful Free Methodist holiness preacher, includes material about his first wife Minnie, his second spouse Julia and their daughter Evangeline who died in her early twenties. One chapter is entitled "Discretion Toward Women" (pp. 75-77).

Tapper, Ruth M. The Full Years: The Story of Helen I. Root. Winona Lake, IN: The Young People's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1948.

Helen Isabel Root, sent home from her work as a missionary in India, her health impaired, and her heart mourning, never lessened her service to the people of India. She became one of

Free Methodism's most active missions advocates. Root was, in addition, an evangelist as well as being the first woman to be ordained a deacon in the Susquehanna Conference.

. Life Stories of Foreign Missionaries of the Free Methodist Church Supported by the Young People's Missionary Society 1931-1935. Winona Lake, IN: Y.P.M.S. Council, Free Methodist Church, n.d.

Tapper has included a selected series of brief biographies of Free Methodist missionaries. A number of those portrayed are women.

Tenney, Mary Alice. Adventures in Christian Love. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1964.

A series of biographies of a number of early Free Methodists. Although Tenney employs the story form, her accounts are not romanticized. Among the women included in Tenney's work are Ellen Roberts, Adella Carpenter, Grace Allen, Clara Leffingwell, Jennie La Due, and the women of the Pentecost Bands.

Terrill, Joseph Goodwin. The Life of Rev. John Wesley Redfield, M.D. Titusville, PA: The Allegheny Wesleyan Methodist Connection, 1889.

. . . I am more than ever convinced that God is about to perform a work in this land [America] which is to tell in the salvation of myriads . . . And I am equally sure that God will open this era by means and instrumentalities quite out of the old stereotyped forms. Among these instrumentalities I believe woman is to take a very prominent part (p. 438).

The above is excerpted from one of Redfield's numerous letters to Ellen Roberts. This particular letter was dated "Feb. 1, 1860." Redfield carried on a voluminous correspondence with Mrs. Roberts as well as with Mrs Kendall (Later Mrs. La Due). Redfield's evangelistic activities are inextricable from the conflicts and consternations woven into the fabric of pioneer and pilgrim Free Methodists. He died before the role and status of women erupted into a molten-lava issue across the denomination.

Ward, Ethel Allen. Ordered Steps or The Wards of India. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1951.

Ernest Fremont Ward and Elizabeth Cox Ward began their years of missionary ministry in India with only personal funds. Ethel, their daughter, authored this biography.

. World Treasure Trails. II. India. Winona Lake, IN: Woman's Missionary Society, Free Methodist Church, 1938.

Ward, Ernest F. Memory Links of "Our Own Chickabiddie" or Reminiscences of Mary Louise Vore. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, n.d.

Williams, Victoria Fairbairn. Life Stories of Charles V. and Lena M. Fairbairn. N.p.d.

Brief biographies of the author's parents. Intended for all Cadet Crusaders.

Williamson, Glen. Frank and Hazel: The Adamsons of Kibogora. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1972.

The Adamsons were Free Methodist missionaries to Kibogora, Central Africa, from 1929 until after 1966.

_____. Julia: Giantess in Generosity. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1969.

Williamson worked with Julia Arnold, the second spouse of E.E. Shelhamer (or Shelhammer), in the Free Methodist Department of Interracial Evangelism. Julia was the niece of T.B. Arnold, editor of Arnold's Commentary, and Free Methodist Publisher over an extended period of time.

Winslow, Carolyn. By Love Compelled: Life Story. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1981.

The autobiography of Carolyn Winslow, Free Methodist missionary to China prior to World War II, and until the Free Methodist missionaries were brought home during the war.

_____. Tomorrow. Winona Lake, IN: The Young People's Missionary Society, 1945.

Winslow's Tomorrow is a volume of cameos sketched in the words of a Free Methodist woman missionary who loved the people of China. This book is intended to challenge young people to commit their lives to doing God's will.

C. General Works

Adams, Linda. Letter in "Letters." Light and Life, May 1989, p. 29.

Adams writes, "Thank you! If I were an outsider reading this issue [Feb 1989], I would get the clear impression that there is room in the Free Methodist Church for women whom God calls to ministry."

_____. "Stop Pushing the Sisters Off the Scaffold!" Light and Life, April 1991, pp. 8-9.

Adams, a 1991 graduate of Asbury Theological Seminary, and a ministerial candidate in the Free Methodist Church, has written an upbeat article which expresses both elation and concern about socio-religious traditions alongside recent changes in attitude and practice in a number of Free Methodist conferences. She celebrates the emerging acceptance of

women as preachers, while she also voices the concomitant paradoxical slowness to accomplish this acceptance in some other areas where women are ministering in God's will.

Callahan-Howell, Kathy. Letter in "Letters." Light and Life, May 1989, p. 5.

Callahan-Howell, a Free Methodist pastor in Cleveland, Ohio, writes:

. . . accepting God's call under the present conditions is difficult. I have known women who felt called but simply could not overcome the obstacles involved. We have lost many gifted leaders due to our discouragement of women pastors. Bishop Gerald Bates says the call of the church is the call of God. I hope our church joins God in calling women.

Ellis, Carollyn. "Bridge Builders." Light and Life, May 1991, pp. 12-13.

Ellis is President of (Free Methodist) Women's Ministries International. Her article spotlights women in various ministries, including the ordained clergy, which bring people, needs, and help together in order to bridge the gap between what is and what needs to be.

Embree, Esther. Chikombedzi. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1973.

Gordon, Esther L. Letter in "Letters," Light and Life, May 1989, pp. 5, 29.

Gordon closes her letter with: ". . . one must logically conclude that, indeed, the dawning of a new day for women in our tradition has yet to break."

Hartley, Brian T. "Women in Ministry: Our Heritage and our Hope." Unpublished essay.

Hartley mentions four steps which the Free Methodist Church could take [context suggests that the paper was probably written in early 1989] in order to "reclaim Roberts' vision": (1) that the revised Discipline employ inclusive language, (2), that the WMI be elevated from auxiliary status to that of a denominational ministry, (3), that women be encouraged, trained for, then appointed to positions of leadership and high profile "where they could serve as role models for younger women preparing themselves for ministry," and (4), that a history of women now living who have served faithfully in the church might record this present time as a heritage for the future.

Haslam, Bob. "Care Enough to Send the Best." Light and Life, May

1991, p. 34.

Haslam, who edits Light and Life, writes that, "Fair representation of our conferences and churches should be a hallmark of our denomination. Women should be considered as well as men."

Howell, John. Letter in "Letters." Light and Life, May 1989, p. 29.

Howell's response to Shoaff ("Women In the New Day," Light and Life, Jan 1989, p. 29) follows in part:

As well-meaning as Mr. Shoaff might be, the only acceptable rationale for opening the ministry to women can be nothing less than the affirmation of the equality of both sexes in God's eyes. We do not open the ministry to women because the gospel requires nothing less than equal opportunity and pure justice in our treatment of persons. And, more important, because the Holy Spirit calls women into the parish ministry as well as into any other form of ministry imaginable.

Howell, John W. "When Called of God and Duly Ordained: Issues Surrounding Women in the Ordained and Pastoral Ministry in the Free Methodist Church of North America." Unpublished essay, Colgate-Rochester, Bixley Hall, Crozer Theological Seminary, Spring 1981.

This essay, which contains a number of factual errors, indicts Free Methodism on the whole for its traditional practice of denying women equal status in ministry even though they perform, at the least, equally well.

Koch, George. Letter in "Letters." Light and Life, May 1989, p.29.

Koch responds to Shoaff ("Women in the New Day," Light and Life, Jan 1989, p. 29) in this tenor:

In the early part of this century, the government allowed women to vote, but only recently has our male-oriented denomination allowed the ordination of women.

Missionary Tidings. Indianapolis, IN: Free Methodist World Missions, bimonthly.

The Free Methodist denominational missions organ.

Olver, Paul S. "Wives Can be Pastors, too." Light and Life, Feb 1990, p. 30.

Roberts, B.T. Pungent Truths: Being Extracts from the Writings of the Rev. Benjamin Titus Roberts, A.M., While Editor of "The Free Methodist" from 1886 to 1890. Compiled and edited by William B. Rose. Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1912 (pp. 354-355).

Roberts' terse, pointed paragraphs are cogent and convin-

cing in 1991. He has included few references to women in ministry, but those few are critical statements from Free Methodism's principal founder and first General Superintendent.

Shoaff, Robert J. "Women in the New Day." My View column in Light and Life, Jan 1989, p. 29.

Shoaff's article drew much critical rebuttal, not because it favored equality for women in Free Methodist ordained ministry, but instead, because of its male-hierarchical tone. The article enhances my study because it verbalizes one period in the struggle which engages many men during their process of transition from thinking only "clergymen" to thinking "clergy-women" as well.

Smith, Deborah D. "Checking Our Pulse: Today's Women Ministers In the Free Methodist Church." Unpublished essay, Fuller Theological Seminary, Pasadena, CA, December 1985.

Smith's study utilizes the results of a survey which she conducted among Free Methodists in ordained ministry. Those surveyed included 35 women elders, deacons, and ministerial candidates, along with 2 denominational leaders. 31 of the 35 responded. All of Free Methodism's 5 bishops responded to a brief questionnaire which she mailed to them.

The conclusions resulting from these instruments are indicative of the ongoing struggle for practical equality for women in ordained ministry, yet the depressing numbers appear to be somewhat balanced, perhaps offset, by the courageous perseverance of those women who continue to minister in the hope that some day soon they will be accepted as the equals that they are. Not all however expressed hope; a number of these women are discouraged; some are depressed.

Smith, Elton O., Jr. "An Editorial: Our Church and World Tomorrow." Advance, Susquehanna Conference, The Free Methodist Church, Oct/Nov 1991. N.p.

Smith includes the following in his article on the Susquehanna Conference's local churches' potential for the future:

Also, church growth specialists indicate that women pastors will need to be more commonly received than they are presently in most evangelical churches if local congregations are to survive.

Snodgrass, K. with R.U.J. "A Biblical and Theological Basis for Women in Ministry." Unpublished essay, Feb 1987. N.p.

Snodgrass and R.U.J. staunchly support women in ordained ministry, and insist that ". . . all of the Bible must be included in the discussion . . ." They assert:

There is nothing in Christianity that relates only to our

salvation; our faith relates to all of life, including the roles of male and female. The issue is whether our attitudes concerning race, social class, and gender will be determined by our oneness in Christ in the new age or by the barriers and values of the old age.

Snyder, Richard D. "Rejoicing in Rochester." Light and Life, May 1991, pp. 10-11.

Snyder was, until July 12, 1991, Superintendent of the Genesee Conference (Free Methodist). He superintended the Susquehanna Conference briefly, then went on to new duties as Bishop. He recorded the phenomenal history of New Hope Free Methodist Church, planted recently in Rochester by Rev. Delia Neusch Oliver.

Spencer, Cindy. "Theology of Women in Ministry." Unpublished essay, Asbury Theological Seminary, January 25, 1991.

Spencer's survey of biblical passages involving women in ministry, along with a number of other passages which appear to forbid women to participate actively in ministry, is helpful to women's studies. Her bibliography, though limited, provides a number of fruitful sources.

Tenney, Mary Alice. Living in Two Worlds: How a Christian Does It! Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1958.

Tiras, Erin M. Letter in "Letters." Light and Life, May 1989, p. 29.

Tiras comments about Shoaff's article ("Women In the New Day," Light and Life, Jan 1989, p. 29) pique interest though they appear somewhat ambiguous:

Thank you for not being afraid to confront the reality of women's roles in the church. Thank you for truly demonstrating the love of Christ toward me today by treating women as individuals capable of entering the ministry. I congratulate the Free Methodist Church for being in vanguard of change where women are concerned, without being too radical.

D. Pentecost Bands

Baldwin, Clara Etta Weatherly. Mother Baldwin's Ninety Years. Unpublished manuscript, n.d.

This biographical account of Mrs. Harmon contains a number of references to the Pentecost Bands.

Baldwin, Harmon. Diary, July 23, 1892-October 18, 1894. Unpublished.

This diary is essentially the record of Baldwin's life in relationship with one Pentecost Band in particular as well as containing historical references to the Bands' activities.

Culumber, T. Joe. "The Pentecost Bands: A Sodality in Early Free Methodism." Unpublished thesis (no date, 1977). On file in Marston Historical Center Library, Indianapolis, IN.

Culumber's thesis contains a select bibliography which is excellent (pp. 44-45).

A Digest of Free Methodist Law or Guide In the Administration of the Discipline of the Free Methodist Church. Prepared and published by order of the General Conference of 1898. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1901 (p. 48).

The General Conference of 1890 made provision for the organization and operation of bands. This line of work had come into operation gradually, and being regarded as a valuable agency in carrying on the Lord's work, it was thus made a part of the machinery of the church. The rules governing the bands and band workers are fully and clearly set forth in the Discipline.

The paragraph above is a paraphrase of the authorized interpretation of a rationale for dealing with the independence of the Pentecost Bands. Many of the band workers were women, particularly young women who were enthusiastic, energetic, articulate Christians called by God to evangelism.

The Doctrines and Discipline of the Free Methodist Church. Buffalo, NY; Winona Lake, IN; Indianapolis, IN: The Free Methodist Church. Revised and published following each General Conference, 1860-.

Fortress, Carroll. "Great Missionary Hymns and Free Methodists Who Write Them." The Missionary Tidings, Jul/Aug 1991, pp. 1-5.

Vivian Dake, "dynamic speaker, leader of Free Methodist Pentecost Bands, pioneer of missionary music" (p. 1, caption), had "considerable opposition (p. 3), as did those, including the young women, who worked in the Pentecost Bands. For example:

While holding a tent meeting in Paw Paw, Michigan, his tent was torn down, packed, placed on the railroad dock, and addressed to Australia! Fortunately, Dake retrieved the tent before the train came in (p. 3).

Dake wrote the poem "We'll Girdle the Globe," which Mrs. Dake (Ida) set to music.

. . . several of the Pentecost Band members had considerable musical ability . . . Fannie and Flora Birdsall, and Dake's spouse Ida, composed several tunes to the poems of Vivian Dake and Thomas Nelson [Dake's successor as Pentecost Bands leader]. . . . Fannie arranged the "Bula" tune (or "missionary" tune) to the Doxology. . . . a distinctive Free Methodist tune . . . included in all Free Methodist hymnals (p. 4).

The Free Methodist, Chicago, IL:

Wed., Jan 13, 1886, Pentecost Band number 4, Battle Creek, MI,
p. 3;
Jan 27, 1886, Pentecost Band number 1, Parma, p. 3;
Jan 27, 1886, Pentecost Band number 3, north of Parma, p. 4;
Jan 27, 1886, Pentecost Band Ingathering at Battle Creek, MI,
p. 4;
Jan 1, 1890, Pentecost Bands Praise Meetings, p.5;
Wed., Jan 9, 1895, Chicago, IL, Doud obituary, p. 7;
Wed., Feb 20, 1895, Myers obituary, p. 7.

General Conference Daily, 5th sitting, Sat., Oct 25, 1890.

This, along with the "daily" from other sessions of this conference, contains references to the Pentecost Bands.

Hogue, Wilson Thomas. History of the Free Methodist Church of North America. 2 vols. 2nd ed. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1915. Vol. 2 (pp. 194-195).

Hogue included the General Conference discussions, motions, and actions pertaining to the Pentecost Bands' relation to the denomination. He also includes anecdotal material.

Jones, Charles Edwin. Perfectionist Persuasion: The Holiness Movement and American Methodism, 1867-1936. Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1974 (pp. 66, 68-69, n7.8--161-162, n11.2--173).

Jones has discovered information about the Pentecost Bands in locations as widely separated as:

See U.S. Bureau of the Census, Religious Bodies: 1906 (2 vols., Washington, D.C.: Government Printing Office, 1910), II, 284-285; and Ira Ford McLeister, History of the Wesleyan Methodist Church of America, rev. ed. by Roy Stephen Nicholson (Marion, Ind.: Wesley Press, 1959), 503 (9. 173).

Marston, Leslie R. From Age to Age a Living Witness: A Historical Interpretation of Free Methodism's First Century. Winona Lake, INL Light and Life Press, 1960 (pp. 434-436).

Marston interprets the Pentecost Bands' relation to the Free Methodist Church impartially. He does however frankly assert that:

In its dealings with the Pentecost Bands, the Free Methodist Church came the nearest to repeating Methodism's historic pattern of action against "irregulars." A more moderate course might have conserved to Free Methodism the zeal of this movement which had been fruitful in bringing a considerable harvest into the church (p. 435).

Nelson, Thomas H. Life and Labors of Rev. Vivian Dake, Organizer

and Leader. Chicago, IL: T.B. Arnold, 1894.

Nelson succeeded to leadership of the Pentecost Bands following the death of Dake (January 3, 1892, in Africa).

Parsons, Ida Dake. Kindling Watch-Fires, Being A Brief Sketch of the Life of Rev. V.A. Dake. Chicago, IL: The Free Methodist Publishing House, 1915.

Snyder, Howard A. "Radical Holiness Evangelism: Vivian Dake and the Pentecost Bands." Unpublished manuscript, United Theological Seminary, Dayton, OH, 1990. 29 pages plus map and appendix (partial list of Pentecost Band workers).

Because the Pentecost Bands were a major vehicle by means of which women could convey their calling from God along with their gifts for public ministry, into practical service, many young women joined the local bands. Snyder's paper has enriched historical studies for and about Free Methodist women.

Note: the bands were made up of young men as well as young women.

Tenney, Mary Alice. Adventures in Christian Love. Winona Lake, IN: Light and Life Press, 1964.

Tenney includes a wealth of material in her chapter on the Pentecost Bands. Her presentation is practically sympathetic as well as interestingly factual. The objectionable behaviour of a number of the most radical of the young women is treated with common-sense understanding.

Terrill, Joseph Goodwin. The Life of Rev. John Wesley Redfield, M.D. Titusville, PA: The Allegheny Wesleyan Methodist Connection, 1889 (pp. 436-437).

Winget, Benjamin. Missions and Missionaries of the Free Methodist Church. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, 1911.

Pages 41-42 carry the statistics pf the Pentecost Band missionaries appointed to Africa - a discouraging account. Dake died on January 3, 1892, in Sierra Leone (Africa). Winget writes:

Their return and the deaths of so many of the Pentecost Band and Faith Missionaries in Liberia has caused these bodies to cease sending missionaries to that field.

This field is proverbially known as the grave of the white missionaries (p. 43).

Zahniser, Arthur D. and John B. Easton. History of the Pittsburgh Conference of the Free methodist Church. Chicago, IL: Free Methodist Publishing House, Published by order of the Pittsburgh Conference, 1932.

Band members' names are mentioned throughout this history. This is however accomplished by means of informal notations,

such as 'So and So, Band members, were here or there.' Zahniser credits the bands with the following: "Practically every point of the Greensburg District had been raised up by the Pentecost Bands (p. 28).

E. Bibliographies

"The Free Methodist Church: A Select Annotated Bibliography on its History and Development." Davis, Philip. Jean Gramento, Michael Guthrie, John Timothy Schumaker, and Samuel Tinsley. Unpublished manuscript, United Theological Seminary, Dayton, OH, 1991.

Richardson, Jack D. "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth Century Free Methodism" (Master of Arts dissertation, Colgate-Rochester Divinity School, April, 1984). Appendix A.

Walls, Francine E. The Free Methodist Church: A Bibliography. Winona Lake, IN: Free Methodist Historical Center, Free Methodist World Ministries Center, Indianapolis, IN., 1977 (pp. 96-97).

The women's studies bibliography in this fine 1977 work is now inadequate to meet the needs intrinsic in the proliferating scope of particularized studies which are being made for, by, and about Free Methodist women in ministry today. It is however an excellent initiatory work.

II. SELECTED ECUMENICAL REVIEW

A. Selected Background Material

Black, W.C. Christian Womanhood. 2nd thousand. Nashville, TN: Publishing House of the Methodist Episcopal Church South, J.D. Barber, Agent, 1889.

Black appears to have been decades ahead of his time in his commentary.

Booth, Catherine. Godliness: Being Reports of a Series of Addresses Delivered at St. James's Hall, London W., During 1881. Philadelphia, PA: National Pub. Association for the Promotion of Holiness, ca 1883.

Boulding, Maria. Prayer: Our Journey Home. Ann Arbor, MI: Servant Books, 1979.

A deeply spiritual insight into a number of the aspects of prayer, written by a woman from a woman's point of view.

Chafe, William H. The Paradox of Change: American Women in the 20th Century. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1991.

A scholarly history of the paradox between the American woman's rights and the implementation of these rights in 20th century America. An update of Chafe's The American Woman (1972).

Christian History. Carol Stream, IL: Christianity Today, Inc.

A reliable periodical which presents in-depth articles centered in the history of the church. Four issues per year.

"The CHRISTIAN HISTORY Time Line." Christian History, 26 IX(2): 24-25.

Topical timeline of Catherine Booth's life, 1820-1890.

This issue also contains a timeline of "Significant Social and Political Events," 1828-1914 (pp. 24-25).

Coutts, John. "The Booths' American Mentors." Christian History 26 IX(2): 14-17.

Phoebe Palmer was one of the Booths' "American Mentors" (p. 22). Catherine Booth particularly admired Charles Finney (pp. 22-23).

Horridge, Glenn K. "William Booth's Officers." Christian History 26 IX(2): 14-17.

Horridge relates background material along with the early Salvation Army's expectations of all its officers. He includes a number of pertinent facts about the Army women.

Iglehart, Hallie. Womanspirit: A Guide to Women's Wisdom. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1983.

Womanspirit . . ., one of the non-biblical feminist approaches to spirituality, is oriented closely between the near-Eastern and the American Indian religions. Though my study is biblical, our time in history demands that every women in ministry be astutely aware of others' religious tendencies and offerings.

Jones, Charles Edwin. Perfectionist Persuasion: The Holiness Movement and American Methodism, 1867-1936. Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1974 (pp. 2-6, 7, 9, 12-14, 17, 23, 35, 49, 55, 82-83, 66, 68-69, 154, 161-162, 173).

Jones invites the reader along on a number of side-trips, including some of Phoebe Palmer's history as well as a number of references to the Pentecost Bands' activities.

Kroeger, Richard Clark, and Catherine Clark Kroeger. I Suffer Not a Woman: Rethinking 1 Timothy 2:11-15 in Light of Ancient Evidence. Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Book House, ca 1992.

The Kroegers place 1 Timothy 2:11-15 within the context of a first-century heresy, peculiar to the Ephesians, which involved women.

Mitchell, Ella Pearson, editor. Those Preachin' Women: Sermons by Black Women Preachers. Vol. 1. Valley Forge, PA: Judson Press, Inc., 1985.

. Those Preachin' Women: More Sermons by Black Women Preachers. Vol. 2. Valley Forge, PA: Judson Press, Inc.,

1988.

These collections of sermons reveal the minds and hearts of the African American women who preached them. Their call to preach, however, along with their message, is universal among women whom God has called to minister in and to the body of Christ.

Moloney, Francis J., SDB. Woman: First among the Faithful. Introduction by Thomas Green, SJ. Notre Dame, IN: Ave Maria Press, 1986.

This scholarly treatise upon the faithfulness of women throughout the New Testament is an unabashed hurrah for women in the church then and now. While a few areas, notable - and expectedly - women in ordained ministry, are sparsely addressed, the work is impressive as "an attempt on the part of a male biblical scholar to examine the sources of our faith and our tradition and to trace a New Testament theology of women" (p. 11). Moloney interprets Mariology in a sensible, practically revelatory manner.

Murdoch, Norman H. "The Army Mother." Christian History 26 IX(2): 5-9.

From Murdoch's essay:

Catherine Booth, the mother of eight, evangelist, bread-winner, confidante to her husband, promoter of women's rights, and moral crusader. She became enormously popular as a preacher; her extensive speaking helped to finance William's mission work (p. 5).

_____. "The General." Christian History 26 (IX(2)): 5-8.

Murdoch emphasizes the equal working partnership between the Booths, remarkable in its day.

Parkin, Christine. "Pioneer in Female Ministry." Christian History 26 IX(2): 10-13.

Parkin, a Salvation Army Major, includes excerpts from Catherine Booth's pamphlet "Female Ministry" (p.12). As early as 1859, Booth wrote:

... the text, 1 Corinthians xiv:34, 35 is the only one in the whole Book of God which even by a false translation can be made prohibitory of female speaking in the church; how comes it then, that by this one isolated passage, which, according to our best Greek authorities, is wrongly rendered and wrongly applied, woman's lips have been sealed for centuries, and the testimony of Jesus which is the spirit of prophecy, silenced, when bestowed on her (n.p.).

Parkin writes of Booth:

For Catherine Booth, championing the cause of women

arose from her understanding of the liberating effects of the gospel. She looked not so much to natural rights as to the overwhelming right of men and women to become, through faith in Christ, children of God and heirs of all the gifts of redeemed humanity (p. 13).

Pobee, John S., and Barbel Von Wartenberg-Potter, editors. New Eyes for Reading: Biblical and Theological Reflections by Women from the Third World. Quezon City, Philippines: Claretian Publications, 1986.

New Eyes . . . is a collection of insightful reflective essays which contribute largely to women's theological studies. The candidness in these reflections can be startlingly refreshing as well as convictingly challenging.

Reuther, Rosemary Radford, and Rosemary Skinner Keller. Women and Religion in America: Volume 1: The Nineteenth Century. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1981.

This particular history documents women's struggles and accomplishments as they have been living out their religions in America. The chapter entitled "The Struggle for the Right to Preach" (pp. 193-241) is acutely appropriate.

Scanzoni, Letha Dawson, and Nancy A. Hardesty. All We're Meant to Be: Biblical Feminism for Today. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1986.

Simpson, A.B. Missionary Messages, New York, NY: Christian Alliance Publishing Company, 1925 (pp. 50-51).

Simpson's book was written from a perspective which is indigenous to gender inequity, that perspective which appears to be benevolent paternalism. His brief remarks about women are to some degree favorable.

Snyder, Howard A. The Radical Wesley and Patterns for Church Renewal. Downer's Grove, IL: Inter-Varsity Press, 1980 (pp. 16-17, 129-142, 54, 63, 87, 94, 156, 175).

This well documented particularized history carries among its various strands a series of insightful observations on the status and role accorded women in the Wesleyan tradition, from Susannah Wesley's meetings (pp. 16-18) through John Wesley's unique provision of leadership opportunities for women (p. 63) in the context of his New Testament reflections (p. 94), on into some carefully considered speculations (pp. 156-157).

. Signs of the Spirit: How God Reshapes the Church. Grand Rapids, MI: Academie Books, Zondervan Publishing House, 1989. Select bibliographies and indices. Women: pp. 223-230.

Snyder's history of selected renewal movements does not

bear directly upon the issues of women in ministry today, yet he places women in their historical Wesleyan roles (page 230 in particular).

Southard, M. Madeline. The Attitude of Jesus toward Woman. New York, NY: George H. Doran, Company, 1927.

Spencer, Aida Besancon. Beyond the Curse: Women Called to Ministry. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, Publishers, 1985. Contains "Appendix Suggestions for Group Study" along with extensive bibliography.

Spencer scrutinizes in depth the Old and New Testament teachings about women, women's traditional roles in the biblical context, and critically examines Jesus' teachings as well as those of the apostle Paul concerning women in positions of leadership among God's people.

Thomas, Hilah E., and Rosemary Skinner, editors. Historical Perspectives on the Wesleyan Tradition: Women in New Worlds. Nashville, TN: Abingdon, 1981.

This volume, which "originated in the Women in New Worlds Conference in Cincinnati, Ohio, 1980 . . . is sponsored by the Women's History Project of the General Commission on Archives and History of the United Methodist Church" (jacket). It documents the history of women who have participated in the pattern which formed, and which continually reforms, the shape of churches in the Wesleyan tradition.

Walker, Barbara G. The Crone: Woman of Age, Wisdom, and Power. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1985.

The Crone . . . is an example of current non-Christian feminist religious literature.

Willard, Frances E. Woman and Temperance or, The Work and Workers of the Woman's Christian Temperance Union. Hartford, CT: Park Publishing Company, 2nd edition, 1884.

Willard's commitment to the Woman's Christian Temperance Union, as well as her leadership of and inspiration to Christian women in general, are seminal to the ongoing historical movements in which Christian women involve themselves.

B. Biographical Sources

Booth-Tucker, F. de L. The Life of Catherine Booth, the Mother of the Salvation Army. 2 vols. New York, NY: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1892.

Campbell, Mary J. The Power-House at Pathankot: What some Girls of India Wrought by Prayer. Philadelphia, PA: The Board of Foreign Missions of the United Presbyterian Church of North America, 1918.

The Power-House at Pathankot . . . enlarges the historical

scope of missions to and by women in India. Campbell emphasizes temperance.

Coles, George. Heroines of Methodism; or, Pen and Ink Sketches of the Mothers and Daughters of the Church. New York, NY: Carlton and Porter, 1857.

In addition to a large number of biographies of women in early Methodism, Coles includes the following:

After Mr. Wesley's death, the Conference of 1803 passed the following rule:

"Question. Should women be permitted to preach among us?

"Answer. We are of the opinion that in general they ought not.

1. Because a vast majority of people are opposed to it.
2. Because their preaching does not at all seem necessary, there being a sufficiency of preachers whom God has accredited, to supply all the places in our connection with regular preaching. But if any woman thinks she has an extraordinary call from God to speak in public, (and we are sure it must be an extraordinary call that can authorize it,) we are of the opinion she should, in general, address her own sex, and those only. And upon this condition alone should any woman be permitted to preach in any part of our connection: and when so permitted, it should be under the following regulations: 1. They shall not preach in the circuit where they reside, until they have obtained the approbation of the superintendent and a quarterly meeting.
2. Before they go into any other circuit to preach, they shall have a written invitation from the superintendent of such circuit. and a recommendatory note from the superintendent of their own circuit" (Chronicles of Wesleyan Methodism).

De Mayer, Jenny E., "Shaheeda" (A Witness). Adventures With God. New York, NY: Evangelical Publishers, 1942.

De Mayer, an independent evangelical missionary, ministered over a wide geographic area. She chronicled her risks, perils, and imprisonments in the course of her zealous missionary labors.

Hardesty, Nancy A. Great Women of Faith. Nashville, TN: Abingdon Press, 1980. 2nd printing 1983.

A collection of brief, inspiring sketches, appropriately titled. Excellent for terse glimpses of a number of Christian women.

Hefley, James C. "Two Were Faithful." Moody (Nov 1986): 22-24.

"There wasn't much for us young folks to do in my little hometown, until the lady preachers came" (22). Hefley's

biographical cameo reveals some of the effects which missionaries Florence Handyside and Helen Leisie had on Mount Judea, Arkansas, during the mid-1940's.

Palmer, Phoebe. Promise of the Father; or, A Neglected Specialty of the Last Days. Boston, MA: Henry V. Deegan, 1859.

The Way of Holiness. New York, NY: Foster and Palmer, Jr., 1867.

Perry-Daniel, Annie. "Double Jeopardy in a Quadrupled Warfare: Being Black, Female, and Ordained in the United Methodist Church," *Circuit Rider*, Feb 1991, pp. 7-8.

Perry-Daniel avers that:

Because of the virulent nature of the racist/sexist double jeopardy, its malignancy reaches to all levels of the church system, destroying in its insidiousness healthy chances for personal growth, development, and advancement within the church system . . . (p. 7).

Thompson (p.8) and Ammons (p. 9), in their responses to Perry-Daniels' article, acknowledge the authenticity of her pain, then respond to it from considerably divergent perspectives. Perry-Daniels publicly recognizes and confronts her personal experiential suffering as woman and as African American woman in United Methodist ordained ministry; a hurting contribution to our ongoing, hopefully healing and reconciling history of ministry in all denominations.

Sketches of the Women of Christendom. By the author of "Chronicles of the Schonberg-Cotta Family," New York, NY: Dodd, Mead and Company, Publishers, n.d.

This volume is, perhaps, more a history than a series of biographical sketches.

Smith, Amanda. The Story of the Lord's Dealings with Mrs. Amanda Smith,
the Colored Evangelist. Introduction by Bishop Thoburn of India.
Chicago, IL: The Christian Witness Co., 1921.

Stevens, Abel. The Women of Methodism: Its Three Foundresses, Susannah Wesley, The Countess of Huntingdon, and Barbara Heck; With Sketches of their Female Associates and Successors in the Early History of the Denomination. New York, NY: Carlton and Porter, 1866.

Storkey, Elaine. "A Christian and a Woman." Decision, Jan 1991, pp. 10-11.

Storkey chronicles her own odyssey from unconcern with women's issues to great and active concerns for women's varied and potentially equal ministries in the church. Storkey's concise definition of the traditionalist and the feminist views of the role of women are practical, working definitions. She

then continues with, "My own life began to change when I started to see the debate, not from entrenched human positions, but from the light of the gospel" (p. 11).

Turner, George Allen. Witnesses of the Way: The Interior Life of Some Famous Christians. Kansas City, MO: Beacon Hill Press of Kansas City, 1981 (pp. 93-94, 114-116, 124-125, 128-129, 145-147).

Turner's emphasis upon the interior life of each of the women whom he includes extends the spiritual center of women in ministry.

Wheatley, Richard. The Life and Letters of Mrs. Phoebe Palmer. New York, NY: W.C. Palmer, Publisher, 1881.

Phoebe Palmer is included among the prominent forerunners of those who advocate holiness as an achievable state of heart, mind, and life. She acknowledged Sanctification to be a second work of grace, subsequent to and dependent upon Regeneration (Salvation). Instantaneous Sanctification by means of laying all on the altar and claiming the promise was the then unique crux of Palmer's teaching and preaching.

White, Charles Edward. The Beauty of Holiness. Grand Rapids, MI: Francis Asbury Press, Zondervan, 1986.

White portrays Palmer as theologian, revivalist, feminist, and humanitarian. B.T. Roberts and John Wesley Redfield both claimed Sanctification under her ministry.

C. General Works

Ammons, Edsel A. "No Conspiracy of Silence." Circuit Rider, Feb 1991, p. 9.

Ammons' response to Perry-Daniel's criticisms and conclusions about sexism and racism in United Methodism is a sternly thoughtful critique reflecting personal consternation which Bishop Ammon has prudently directed toward an understanding solution in the future, if Perry-Daniel chooses to accommodate others' views alongside her own.

Becker, Nancy D. "Can Men and Women Work Together?" Leadership: A Practical Journal for Church Leaders, Winter 1991, pp. 21-23.

Belenky, Mary Field, Blythe McVicker Clinchy, Nancy Rule Goldberger, and Jill Mattuck Tarule. Women's Ways of Knowing: The Development of Self, Voice, and Mind. New York, NY: Basic Books, Inc., Publishers, 1986.

Bristow, John Temple. What Paul Really Said About Women. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1988.

Bristow's scholarly volume is a documented source book in support of the practice of gender equality.

He scrutinizes, then discusses the biblical passages which have been traditionally interpreted as if they were vehicles which God had destined to advance the cause of male dominance in the Church.

Clouse, Bonnidell, and Robert G. Clouse. Women in Ministry: Four Views. Downer's Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1989.

Dayton, Donald W., and Lucille Sider Dayton. "Women as Preachers: Evangelical Precedents," Christianity Today, May 23 1975 (n.p.).

The Dayton's' factual article includes a number of interesting historical highlights. The discussion centers closely around ordaining women throughout the history of the evangelical movement.

Gaede-Penner, Naomi. "Ministries Among Today's Women," Leadership: A Practical Journal for Church Leaders, Winter 1991, pp. 58-62.

Gaede-Penner's article discusses reaching women in order to minister to them. She implies that methodologies for reaching women might be directed differently from either general populace-oriented ministries or ministries to males. First of a trilogy of like-thrusted articles: Farrar's "How We Revitalized Our Women's Group" (pp. 65-67) along with Yates' "Straddling the Great Divide" (pp. 63-65) complete the series.

Galli, Mark. "What Do Men Want?" Leadership: A Practical Journal for Church Leaders, Winter 1991, pp. 36-44.

This article is aimed toward revitalizing and enhancing ministries to men. One of its perspectives however originates in this: "It's not true that women are more religious than men. It's just easier in our society for them to express religious interest outwardly" (p. 40).

Goldman, Ari L. "Black Women's Bumpy Path to Church Leadership," New York Times, Sunday, July 29, 1990 (pp. 1, 28).

Goldman's article features Caroline Ann Knight, pastor of Philadelphia Baptist Church in Harlem, whose experience led her to found a church in order to live out God's call to her to pastor.

Grant, Jacquelyn. White Women's Christ and Black Women's Jesus: Feminist Christology and Womanist Response. Atlanta, GA: Scholars Press, 1989.

Grant asserts that while Christology may be best interpreted contextually, the context which frames the feminist experience is predominately that of White women. The single issue of sexism, Grant argues, is not broad enough in its

particularities to adequately address the needs of Black and other minority women. This volume, ecumenical in scope, proposes a Feminist Christology from the Black Womanist perspective.

Gundry, Patricia. Neither Slave Nor Free: Helping Women Answer the Call to Church Leadership. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1987.

Factual. Experiential. Ecumenical. Gundry accosts the fundamental sexist inequities which are still being practiced in a number of denominations. She quotes letters from contemporary Christian women who are "breaking on the rocks of traditionalism in our churches" (p. 60). The work defines the questions and states the nature of the struggle to be equally recognized and equally accepted alongside men when called by God. Kathryn Lindskoog, in her evaluation of this book, states candidly that, "Gundry stays calm, candid, and practical as she deals with outrageous realities. . . . People who read it [Gundry's book] won't have to learn everything the hard way" (jacket).

"How Gender Specific is Ministry." Leadership: A Practical Journal for Church Leaders, Winter 1991, pp. 24-35. A Leadership Forum.

Alice Petersen, Mary Miller, and Jim Smith dialog with one of the Leadership editors about "the disparity between the religious practices of men and women."

James, Kay. "How to Be Heard," Herald of Holiness, Nov 1990, pp. 44-47, 38.

James is Assistant Secretary for Public Affairs for the United States Department of Health and Human Services (1990).

Jewett, Paul King. "Why I Favor the Ordination of Women," Christianity Today, 6 June 1975, pp. 7-10, 12.

Jewett provides a series of scholarly affirmations as the means of support for his advocacy of women in ordained ministry.

Johnson, Patricia Altenbernd and Janet Kalven, editors. With Both Eyes Open: Seeing Beyond Gender. New York, NY: The Pilgrim Press, 1988.

This collection of essays by women, and about women, addresses a number of disciplines, recognizing the common need for transformation to lie within the area where all women's experiential studies converge.

Martinez, Inez. "Women Artists: Key to the Female Psyche," Quadrant (Journal of the C.G. Jung Foundation for Analytical Psychology), Summer 1979: 64-79.

Martinez' article converges and intersects ideas with reality:

Jung once remarked that ideas are models of reality. We fashion them into patterns and hold them against our experience; we keep or discard them depending on how much meaning they offer us. (Meaning here includes both conscious and unconscious significance) (pp. n--79, 64).

If women are to function realistically as ministers, we will always have to be keeping in touch with women in secular occupations. Martinez' article is one sort of vehicle for conveying cross-occupational information among women.

Mehl, L. Guy. "Marriage and Ministry, Mixing and Separating in Mid-Life Women." Unpublished manuscript, Lancaster Career Development Center, Lancaster, PA, 1982.

Mehl addresses the issues which rear themselves when God calls a middle-aged married woman to full-time ordained ministry. He covers a broad spectrum of issues; his closing remarks are keenly astute and appropriate to the issue of social structures which have long been allowed to interpret scripture in an unbalanced manner:

There are others, however, who believe that ministry and marriage are equal callings and that it is possible to fulfill both. Whether the wife and husband are in the home or out on the job, according to this position, satisfying work and nurturing relationships are part of the divine plan. If the two are not able to be maintained together, it is because of sin, sin in social structures and norms as well as in personal attitudes and psychic structures. Maintaining a respect for God's call to family, this more modern position states, does not mean that the wife must stay at home and/or that the husband's work is divinely sanctioned to be outside the home. These are societal norms, not divine. The couple may negotiate how home and work are to be balanced and live out God's plan on that individualized basis (pp. 25-26).

Miller, Jean Baker. Toward a New Psychology of Women. 2nd edition. Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 1986 (1st edition 1976).

Odegard, Laura Lee. "Aging Female Clergy: A New Phenomenon," Circuit Rider, June 1990, p. 8.

Porter, Rose, editor. Thoughts for Women from Famous Women. New York, NY: Hurst and Company, Publishers, 1893.

Beware, in the course of your life, you hurt not your mind (p. 31). [Lady Mary Wortley Montagu, 1690-1762.]

Priscilla Papers. Gretchen Gaebelein Hull, editor. Journal of Christ-

ians for Biblical Equality. Published quarterly.

Christians for Biblical Equality, 380 LaFayette Road, South, Suite 122, St. Paul, MN 55107-1216.

"Report of the Bishop's Task Force on Clergy Divorce of the Northern New Jersey Annual Conference, United Methodist Church," May 1983.

This report offers guidelines for handling clergy divorce, a reality which every denomination must deal with.

Shelley, Marshall. "From the Editors," Leadership: A Practical Journal for Church Leaders, Winter 1991, p. 3.

Shelley's lead editorial introduces the theme as well as emphasizing the bent of this particular edition: "In both secular and sacred forums, we are rediscovering some of the unique characteristics of men and women" (p. 3). Editor Shelley's is one of a volume of articles about women and men in ministry.

Snyder, Howard A., with Daniel V. Runyon. Foresight: 10 Major Trends that Will Dramatically Affect the Future of Christians and the Church. Nashville, TN: Thomas Nelson Publishers, 1986 (pp. 95-110).

Snyder and Runyon discuss 10 major trends, including the role and status of women as clergy/administrators, which the church will need to acknowledge as well as to work with in order to expand now and into the 21st century. For example:

Fundamentally the issue is not ordination or non-ordination of women but rather the issue of women participating at every level of the church. However, as participation is recognized and affirmed, in most cases it will almost certainly increase substantially. Since the ministry and leadership of women goes to the core of human sexuality, community, and self-identity, this trend will be crucial as any in shaping the church of the twenty-first century (p. 110).

Snyder, Howard A. "John Wesley and Macarius the Egyptian," The Asbury Theological Journal, Fall 1990: 55-59.

Snyder matter-of-factly asserts that "Men and women are created in the image and likeness of God; there is that within them that responds to the divine nature" (p. 56). While the article does not address the issue of women in ministry, Snyder's consistent inclusion of women as equals in the kingdom work promotes assurance for and in women as God's ministers.

Thompson, Barbara R. "Some Blacks Become 'Honorary Whites'", Circuit Rider, Feb 1991, pp. 8-9.

Thompson's empathic response to Perry-Daniel's painful article ("Double Jeopardy in a Quadrupled Warfare . . .," (pp. 7-8) is an astutely perceptive in-depth antiphon.

Wagner, Peter C. Your Spiritual Gifts Can Help Your Church Grow.
Ventura, CA: Regal Books, 1979 (p. 41).

Though he expresses it tersely in this book, Wagner fiercely favors equality for women in the church.

Walker, Barbara G. The Crone: Woman of Age, Wisdom, and Power. San Francisco, CA: Harper and Row, 1985.

Waisbrooker, Lois. A Sex Revolution. Introduction, "Women in the Lead, Waisbrooker's Way to Peace," by Pam McAllister. Philadelphia, PA: New Society Publishers, 1985.

McAllister, in her introduction, blatantly identifies Waisbrooker's 18th century women as those who: "in standing beside the men on the battlefield, rip the lie out from under the patriarchal scheme of the Victorian era" (p. 23). Perhaps these women also defy the Renaissance notions of courtly love when their stance beside the warriors can indeed, "challenge the claim that blood is shed primarily on women's behalf or for their honor [as they] . . . refuse to let their lives be used any longer to justify or to sanction reliance on violence.

. they also call into question patriarchy's artificial dichotomy of gender-linked behaviours . . ." (p. 22). This is not to say however that women universally embrace or even support, by means of any sort of extension, either the state or the role of the pacific (peace at any price) in the world or in the church. Waisbrooker writes that woman: "does not seem as yet to realize that with men's methods she will succeed no better than man has done" (p. 55).

We will be wise to bring Waisbrooker along with other militant feminists from the past, into our women's studies today because as individuals in a burgeoning group of women in ministry, we need to acquaint ourselves with the history of our sisters' attempts to win genuine equality. A thorough knowledge of women's movements of the past can help us to capitalize upon their successes while avoiding repetition of their mistakes.

Wolfe, Helen B. "Midlife Career Change: Call to Ministry." Unpublished essay, n.d.

Wolfe tabulates the results of a number of surveys which could provide helpful guidelines for second-career clergypersons early in their educational process.

Wolff, Christine. "Woman Pastoring 2 Local Churches: Not the First, But Ohio's Only." The Cincinnati Inquirer, 8 Feb 1988, 8(A).

Wolff's article is the result of an interview with Rev. Dianne Wisemiller, American Baptist pastor. "It took her longer than her male counterparts, she said, to get a senior pastor position. But she's encouraged by the progressive attitude toward women promoted by the American Baptists . . ."

"Women Priests: An Incarnation of Christ." An address, n.d.
This address focuses on C.S. Lewis' article "Priestesses

in the Church?" published in 1970 in his work God in the Dock.

D. Bibliographies

Byrne, Pamela R., and Susan K. Kinnell, editors. Women in North America: Summaries of Biographical Articles in History Journals. People in History Series. Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-Clio, Inc., 1988.

This unusual bibliography brings lesser known and unknown women, Canadian and American, to the reader's attention, along with a number of famous women. The volume, with its topical arrangement, contains brief biographical articles about each woman who is included. The back matter contains an extended subject index as well as a list of history-oriented periodicals.

Christians for Biblical Equality. Books, Reprints, and Tapes Catalog. October 1991. Updated often.

Although this publication is a catalog instead of a bibliography, its listings comprise a useful bibliography which is kept current. Particularly appropriate for women's studies.

Lewis-Newberg, Carol. "Phoebe Palmer: A Prophesying Daughter." Unpublished essay, United Theological Seminary, Dayton, OH, 1979.

An annotated bibliography follows the essay.

Loeb, Catherine et al. Women's Studies: A Recommended Core Bibliography 1980-1985. Littleton, CO: Libraries Unlimited, 1987.

Musto, Ronald G. Liberation Theologies: A Research Guide. New York, NY: Garland Publishing, 1991. (Garland Reference Library of Social Sciences, vol. 507.)

Sexism: A Bibliographical Guide. Wesley Theological Seminary, Washington, D.C., January 1987.

A compilation of Wesley Theological Seminary's holdings on the subject of sexism.

Women/Feminist Studies: A Representative List of Titles Held by The Seminary Library. Wesley Theological Seminary, Washington, D.C., January 1984.

The Women in the Church: International Bibliography, 1982-1984. Strasbourg, Cerdic Publications, 1985.

Women of Color and Southern Women: A Bibliography of Social Science Research, 1975-1988. Andrea Timberlake, editor. Memphis, TN: Center for Research on Women, Memphis State University, ca 1988.

III. SELECTED MATERIAL IN OPPOSITION TO WOMEN AS ORDAINED MINISTERS AND/OR AS CHURCH ADMINISTRATORS

Elliott, Elisabeth. "Why I Oppose the Ordination of Women." Christ-

ianity Today, 6 June 1975, pp. 12-14.

"It is in willing and glad submission rather than grudging capitulation that the woman in the church and the wife in the home find their fulfillment" (p. 14). Elliott writes out of the Fundamentalist tradition:

The particular ways in which sex differentiation is signaled in various cultures may differ widely. The use of the headcloth or veil in Paul's time may perhaps be an example of a custom which might vary in a different time and place; but what is represented, the subjection of women, is a divinely inspired principle and not negotiable (p. 14).

Henry, Carl F.H. "Further Thoughts About Women." "Footnotes" in Christianity Today, n.d.

Henry's inconclusive "further thoughts" tend to rest upon, thereby cling to, the "subordination of women in Christian public worship on the basis of a divinely established order . . ." (n.p.)

Kleinstauber, R. Wayne. "Terms of Endangerment." Light and Life, May 1991, pp. 29, 31.

Kleinstauber inserts, alongside his viable points, a number of radical worst-case scenario anti-inclusive language arguments which have, for the most part, become obsolete.

Packer, J.I. "Let's Stop Making Women Presbyters." Christianity Today, 11 Feb 1991, pp. 18-21.

"Is there not a better way of benefiting from women's ministry than by ordaining them?" (p. 18). This taut query indicates the tenor and stance taken in the article.

Revell, Jennifer M. Letter in "Letters." Light and Life, May 1989, p. 5.

Odegaard, Leta A. Letter in "Letters." Light and Life, May 1989, p. 5.

IV. APPENDIX TO I, E,: INDEX TO ARTICLES RELATING TO WOMEN IN FREE
 METHODIST ORDAINED MINISTRY, FOUND IN THE FREE METHODIST,
 COMPILED BY JACK RICHARDSON

"Appendix A" below is used with the kind permission of its compiler, Jack Richardson, who included this valuable resource in his Master's thesis: "B.T. Roberts and the Role of Women in Ministry in Nineteenth-Century Free Methodism," Colgate Rochester Divinity School, April 1984.

APPENDIX A. Index of Related Articles found in the Free Methodist

<u>Date</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Title</u>
[138]	04-16-68	7 The Female Preacher (Editor)
	04-23-68	7 Female Suffrage in the Church (Editor)
	09-24-68	1 Female Preachers (M.H. Freeland)
	11-19-68	1 Female Preachers (M.H. Freeland)
	09-30-69	1 To the Front! (James Matthews)
	09-30-69	4 The Sphere of Women (Editor)
	12-16-69	1 Light Wanted (W.N. Hamby)
	12-23-69	3 Close the Sister's Lips - Shall We? (D.F. Newton)
	12-23-69	4 Woman's Prerogative (Editor)
	09-05-72	2 Shall the Church Authorize Women to Preach? (W. Gould)
	09-26-72	2 That License (W.N. Hamby)
	06-25-74	3 Woman in the Pulpit (Selected)
	10-08-74	2 Concerning Deacons in the Church (L. Wood)
	03-10-75	2 Woman and the Gospel (A.O. Van Brocklin)
	06-05-78	1 The Right of Women to Pray and Speak in the Churches (Asa Mahan)
	01-01-79	3 Position of Woman in the Churches (<u>Golden Rule</u>)
	03-05-79	1 Papers on the General Conference (W. Gould)
	09-15-80	3 From Bro. Turney (D.B. Turney)
	02-16-81	1 Ordination of Women (D.B. Turney)
	03-30-81	1 The Question of Ordaining Women to the Eldership (D.B. Turney)
	05-25-81	1 The Legal Phase (D.B. Turney)
	06-29-81	1 Ordination of Women (D.B. Turney)
	03-22-82	4 A Law Question (Editor)
	05-03-82	2 Women Among the Seventy (D.B. Turney)
	05-17-82	2 Presbyteresses (D.B. Turney)
	05-31-82	2 Co-Laborers in the Lord (D.B. Turney)

Appendix to I, E.; APPENDIX A, Richardson, con't.

<u>Date</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Title</u>
06-14-82	2	Generic Classifiers (D.B. Turney)
10-25-82	4	General Conference (Editor)
02-14-83	4	The Sex of a Bishop in Reply to a Reviewer (D.B. Turney)
05-09-83	2	The Sex of a Bishop (D.B. Turney)
[139]		
05-23-83	5	Deaconess Phoebe (D.B. Turney)
08-15-83	2	Ministerial Monosexment (D.B. Turney)
09-05-83	4	Query and Reply (Editor)
10-10-83	2	Woman's Work in the Church (D.B. Turney)
10-24-83	2	As Unto the Weaker Vessel (D.B. Turney)
11-07-83	2	Laborers Into His Harvest (D.B. Turney)
12-05-83	1	LeRoy, New York (C.L. Carlton)
01-14-85	5	Women in Official Relations (Matthew Hazel)
10-14-85	2	Bible Language and Church Government (H.C. Pierce)
02-17-86	1	Notes (Editor)
04-28-86	3	A Woman Among the Apostles (D.B. Turney)
04-28-86	8	To Whom It May Concern (W.T. Hogg)
05-05-86	2	A Woman Among the Apostles (D.B. Turney)
05-26-86	3	Teachers of Salvation (D.B. Turney)
06-02-86	3	Teachers of Salvation (D.B. Turney)
06-02-86	4	Communications (J.S. Bradbrook)
06-09-86	4	Communications (J.S. Bradbrook)
06-16-86	3	Ought Women to Govern in the Churches? (W. Gould)
06-23-86	2	Ought Women to Govern in the Churches? (W. Gould)
06-30-86	1	Notes (Editor)
06-30-86	2	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (W. Gould)
07-07-86	2	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (W. Gould)
07-14-86	2	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (W. Gould)
07-14-86	2	A Woman Among the Apostles (D.B. Turney)
07-14-86	4	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (W. Gould)
07-21-86	2	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (W. Gould)
07-21-86	3	A Woman Among the Apostles (D.B. Turney)
07-21-86	5	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (B.T. Roberts)
07-28-86	2	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (W. Gould)
07-28-86	5	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (B.T. Roberts)
[140]		
08-04-86	2	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (W. Gould)
08-04-86	4	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (B.T. Roberts)
08-11-86	1	Notes (Editor)
08-11-86	4	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (B.T. Roberts)
08-18-86	4	Ought Women to Govern in the Church. (B.T. Roberts)
08-25-86	5	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (B.T. Roberts)
09-01-86	4	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (B.T. Roberts)
09-08-86	4	Ought Women to Rule in the Church? (A.F. Curry)
09-15-86	4	Ought Women to Govern in the Church? (B.T. Roberts)

Appendix to I, E.; APPENDIX A, Richardson, con't.

<u>Date</u>	<u>Page</u>	<u>Title</u>
09-22-86	5	Ought Women to Rule in the Church? (A.F. Curry)
09-29-86	4	Ought Women to Rule in the Church? (A.F. Curry)
10-06-86	4	Ought Women to Rule in the Church? (A.F. Curry)
10-06-86	4	Woman's Rule in the Church (L.S. King)
10-06-86	5	A Second Reply to A Woman Among the Apostles (J.S. Bradbrook)
10-13-86	5	A Second Reply to A Woman Among the Apostles (J.S. Bradbrook)
10-20-86	4	A Second Reply to A Woman Among the Apostles (J.S. Bradbrook)
10-27-86	3	The Woman Question Again (G.W. Coleman)
10-27-86	8	General Conference (Editor)
11-03-86	5	A Woman Among the Apostles, In Rejoinder (D.B. Turney)
11-03-86	5	A Review (Impartial)
12-29-86	2	The Moral Mission of a Woman (R. Gilbert)
07-11-88	1	Notes (Editor)
07-11-88	2	Woman's Work in the Church (Mrs. A.G. Warne)
05-14-90	2	Shall Women Be Ordained? (Mrs. C.L. Wetherald)
05-21-90	2	Shall Women Be Ordained? (Mrs. C.L. Wetherald)
05-28-90	2	Is Woman Man's Equal? (W.J. Gladwin)
07-30-90	4	Why Not? (Mrs. M.H. Freeland)
10-01-90	2	Why Not? (W.M.B. Colt)
10-08-90	2	Why Not? (W.M.B. Colt)
10-22-90	2	Help It On! (Mrs. E.S. Roberts)

